An Investigation of Primary Music Education in Victorian Schools: A Single Case Study

By
Wei Cosaitis, M. MusStud., B. Mus. Ed

A Thesis
In Music Education
Submitted to the Faculty of Education
Monash University
For the
Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree of
Doctor of Philosophy

Supervised By
Associate Professor
Jane Elizabeth Southcott

July 2012
Notice 1

*Under the Copyright Act 1968, this thesis must be used only under the normal conditions of scholarly fair dealing. In particular no results or conclusions should be extracted from it, nor should it be copied or closely paraphrased in whole or in part without the written consent of the author. Proper written acknowledgement should be made for any assistance obtained from this thesis.*

Notice 2

*I certify that I have made all reasonable efforts to secure copyright permissions for third-party content included in this thesis and have not knowingly added copyright content to my work without the owner's permission.*
# Table of Contents

Abstract vii

Statement viii

Acknowledgment ix

Chapter 1 Nature and Scope of the Study 1

Issues 1

Curriculum development 8

Teacher efficacy 12

Teacher education 19

Research contentions and the importance of this study 22

The Researcher 24

Chapter 2 Literature Review Part (1) Advocacy and Efficacy 26

General introduction 26

Advocacy of school music education 28

31
Efficacy of school music education
School choral program
School instrumental program
Pull-out program
Public performance

Chapter 3 Literature Review Part (2) The Kodály Method and Orff Approach
Zoltán Kodály and his music education philosophy
Carl Orff and the Orff approach
Orff and Kodály

Chapter 4 Research Methodology
Three major educational research approaches
Qualitative research
Phenomenology
Case study
Single case study
Reliability, validity, and generalisability
Triangulation
Data collection
Semi-structured interviews
Observation
Data analysis – IPA
Selection of research site

Chapter 5 Context for the Research
Primary school music education in Victoria 114
The Arts in the Australian Curriculum 121
The Arts in the Victorian Essential Learning Standards (VELS) 137

Chapter 6 The Music Program at Happyrock Primary School 141
Introduction to Happyrock Primary School 142
Introduction of the music specialist 144
An overview of the music program at Happyrock Primary School 145
Opinions on the school’s music program 149
The school Principal 150
The Assistant Principal 153
The Violin Specialist 158
The school Librarian 160
Students’ responses towards the school’s music program 162

Chapter 7 Classroom Music and the Choral Program 172
Classroom music program 173
Class observation No. 1 176
Class observation No. 2 182
Choral program 192
Conclusion 196

Chapter 8 The Instrumental Program 198
General introduction 198
The violin program 199
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Violin class observation No. 1</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Violin class observation No. 2</td>
<td>212</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The guitar program</td>
<td>219</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The recorder program</td>
<td>220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 9 Discussion</td>
<td>222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Music curriculum</td>
<td>222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student-centred teaching objectives</td>
<td>222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eclecticism in school music teaching</td>
<td>226</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Importance of music literacy</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher efficacy</td>
<td>231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advocacy of school music education</td>
<td>231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Importance of early music education</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Positive relationship with other parties involved in the school’s music program</td>
<td>233</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Effectiveness in general school music teaching</td>
<td>240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Effectiveness in school instrumental and choral programs</td>
<td>244</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public performance and informances</td>
<td>245</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pull-out program</td>
<td>246</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 10 Conclusion</td>
<td>250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Issues and research contentions</td>
<td>250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concluding statement</td>
<td>252</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Abstract

This phenomenological research has employed a qualitative case study approach and investigates what practices are required in successful music curriculum development and quality music teaching within and without the music classroom in state-supported (government) primary schools in Victoria, Australia. To contextualize the study, issues involving the history of music education in Victorian government primary schools, current national and state music curricula, particular music teaching approaches of Kodály and Orff, school choral and instrumental instructions, and music advocacy were also discussed at length. The data in the study was obtained through a number of semi-structured interviews with the music specialist in the selected school, several semi-structured interviews with numerous individuals involved in the school’s music program, and a series of observations of various music teaching episodes. Research findings of this study suggest that a number of practices are required in the successful operation of a music programs in Victorian primary schools under the current state-supported educational system. It is indicated that a successful music curriculum should be comprehensive, sequential, balanced, literacy-oriented, and enjoyment-based. Findings also recommend that the music
teacher devise the curriculum for the purposes of serving students’ needs and levels of progression, incorporating the school’s culture, taking into consideration the nature of the local community. In terms of implementing teacher efficacy, skills in developing school music advocacy, maintaining quality classroom teaching, and organizing and managing choral and instrumental activities are essential for successful music programs. The research also indicates that an effective school music program requires a specialist who is a highly qualified, experienced music teacher as well as an accomplished musician, and is, hence, a recognizably successful music specialist.
Statement

The thesis, except with the Research Graduate School Committee's approval, contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university or other institution and affirms that to the best of the candidate's knowledge the thesis contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference is made in the text of the thesis.

Wei Caoaitis
Acknowledgement

The world’s most expressive words are not capable of conveying the deepest gratitude I have for my supervisor, Associate Professor Jane Southcott. Her excellent expertise in music education, broad knowledge in various fields, clear guidance in research studies, deep understanding of my personal circumstances, endless patience and solid friendship were a constant source of support and motivation throughout the entire study. Her undeniable sense of humour has made the study more enjoyable. Without Jane this thesis would have never been possible.

I would like to thank the music specialist at the selected primary school, who was the core subject of this case study, for being extremely generous in sharing her much valued time, expertise, teaching experience and enthusiasm.

I must also thank my husband, Leonard, dedicating his time and energy working beside me, and tireless efforts in proofreading and polishing the entire thesis.

Last but not least, I need to express the gratitude I have for my parents, especially my mum, who have inspired me in my academic pursuit in accomplishing this degree. Their enormous love and practical support in my everyday life enabled the completion of this study.
Chapter One
Nature and Scope of the Study

- Issues

The importance of music education in children’s overall intellectual and psycho-emotional development has been the subject of many investigative studies. The Australian *National Review of School Music Education* (*NRSME*) in 2005 stated that “International and national research shows that music education uniquely contributes to the emotional, physical, social and cognitive growth of all students” (Department of Education, Science and Training, (DEST), 2005, p. v.). The chair of the *NRSME* Steering Committee, Margaret Seares, asserted that all Australian students’ aesthetic, cognitive, social and experiential learning skills benefit from the positive impact that an increased quality of music education creates (DEST, 2005). In 2007, the past Federal Minister for Education, Science and Training, Julie Bishop, stated that children could attain beneficial experience from music learning as it could help children with their development of self-expression, creativity, school work engagement, and the passion towards learning (Bertram, 2007). At the National Music Administrators’ Conference (NMAC) held in 1980 Buxton and McMahon (1980) pointed out that music makes a unique contribution to support learning and is utilized to create meaning “through sound” (p. 9).

However, the adequacy of today’s music education in the Australian government school system has been and remains a matter of serious concern. Champion (2012) states that music education
in some Australian schools is not as effective as it should be for teachers, students, or the community at large. Amongst all Australian states and territories, New South Wales is the only state wherein Music is offered as a compulsory subject at all schools (Music Council of Australia (MCA), 2009). In a speech in 2006, Senator Fifield stated that “only 23 per cent of kids in Australian government primary schools have access to any form of music education … it is possible for some Australian students to complete 13 years of schooling without participating in any form of music education” (quoted in Music Council of Australia (MCA), 2011, p. 3). The NRSME (DEST, 2005) reported that in Victoria music is an elective subject only, and is often left out or eliminated for non-academic reasons, such as budgetary limitations and classroom unavailability. In fact, there are only 23.4 per cent of government schools providing music education services. Furthermore, the provisions of the Music Policy Officer, the Central Advisory Services or District/Regional Advisory Services have never been available. In addition to the findings of research and the assertions of authorities, the researcher’s observation and teaching experience also suggested that many parents in Victoria have little choice but to send their children to high-cost private music lessons after realizing that the primary school where their child is studying has either inadequate music education standards, or does not offer music tuition at all. This understanding, again, was supported by the NRSME (DEST, 2005) which stated that, “while there are examples of excellent music education in schools, many Australian students miss out on effective music education because of the lack of equity of access; lack of quality of provision; and the poor status of music in many schools” (p. v). Clearly there are major concerns with the provision of effective music education in government schools in Australia.
More than half a century ago, the United Nations Education, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) Seminar in Australian music education was held in Melbourne in 1956. In her article which explores this particular seminar, Southcott (2009) states that it was suggested by the panel that students’ music education should be conducted sequentially from the beginning of the kindergarten year to the end of secondary education. More than thirty years later, the Conference of National Music Administrators (Buxton & McMahon, 1980) recommended that children should be exposed to music from the early primary school years for the purpose of establishing a foundation for perceptions, skills, values and experiences. However, decades later, Temmerman (1997) still claimed that primary school music education in Australia, in terms of both policies and practices, was perceptibly unsatisfactory. In 2006, she further pointed out that the lack of resources, poor “status of the arts vis-à-vis other subject areas” in conjunction with teachers’ lack in preparation for arts teaching in Australian primary schools, have “contributed a less than ideal provision of arts education”, and that music could be seen as a typical example (p. 219). In addition, the NRSME (DEST, 2005) confirmed that school music education in Australia today is still often inadequate. Bertram (2007) cited the Executive Director of the Music Council of Australia, Dr Richard Letts, who described that the then present status of music education in Australia as “appalling” (p. 45). Letts was further cited as claiming that music education had not been sufficiently provided in many school systems, including both state-supported and Catholic schools. More recently, according to Bertram (2007), a study conducted by the Australian Music Association revealed that, “90 per cent of 1,945 Australians surveyed believe that a good music education should be available to all schoolchildren, and 76 per cent of non-music makers wished that they had learned a musical instrument” (p. 46). Unfortunately, there has been no significant shift in music education policy to accommodate these recommendations, so much so, that on a
national level music education in most parts of Australia is languishing (Southcott, 2009). The results of an investigation into the status of primary school music education and preservice teachers’ perceptions of challenges in music teaching at elementary levels in five countries indicated that Australian students had the weakest music training background. The investigation also found that Australian students had the lowest appraisal of music education being a priority in primary schools (Russell-Bowie, 2009).

In terms of the level of teacher quality, Hoermann and Herbert (1979) claimed that there was a distinct absence of provision in supporting professional music specialists in music teaching at primary level in New South Wales in the late 1970s. It is not unreasonable to assume that there was a similar situation in all Australian states and territories at this time. Letts asserted that the situation of music education was even worse at primary levels as most generalist teachers “don’t know what they are doing because they were never trained” (quoted in Bertram, 2007, p. 45). To support this point, Jeanneret (2006) expressed her concern about the difficulties of preparing teachers for effective music teaching when the total provision of music training during a two-year Bachelor of Teaching course was merely 12 hours. Consequently, primary school children remained “totally ignorant” until they reached secondary level, where a proper music program was usually provided. Further, Letts maintained, “We don’t start teaching reading or math at secondary school. Why would it work for music?” (Bertram, 2007, p. 45). Many teachers at kindergartens and primary schools, where music lessons are available, appear to have insufficient musical education. Further, there was a lack of qualified music specialists at many primary schools “across the country”, and therefore, the limited provision of musical instruction was “left up to the class teacher” (Bertram, 2007, p. 45). As a consequence, students may get some opportunity to learn music but only within a very limited range and standard because the lack of
efficacy in primary teacher training results in inadequate delivery of the effectiveness in graduate teachers’ actual teaching. It should be noted that this problem is exacerbated by the fact that many pre-service teacher education students have themselves received little music education in their schooling. Jeanneret (2006) reported that amongst all states and territories in Australia, it was only in Queensland that every primary school had a music specialist.

Hoermann and Herbert (1979) clearly asserted that children would not be able to receive effective music tuition if their teachers had themselves only received a small amount of music education during their tertiary studies. Zoltán Kodály – one of the most influential and outstanding music educators in the world, whose teaching philosophy and method will be introduced in detail in Chapter 3 – believed that only quality teacher training was able to provide the “best possible music education” to children. He added that “there will be good education in schools only when we educate good teachers” (quoted in Blackford & Stainthorp, 2007, p. 32).

This was acknowledged by the NRSME (DEST, 2005) which reported that it was imperative to have appropriate training for teachers to ensure quality music teaching. Therefore, to provide quality and high level standard teaching efficacy in music education, music teachers should always be educated in a proactive manner in order to be more able to meet the music developmental needs of their students. Actually, the same issue was raised in the aforementioned UNESCO Seminar in 1956 (Southcott, 2009 where of the seminar’s pronouncements on the inadequate training of music teachers fifty years ago, stated that, “the supply of music specialists was deemed inadequate for the needs of schools” (p. 116). Unfortunately, this does not seem to have been rectified.

Jeanneret (2006) pointed out that one of the actions needed to be taken to improve the quality of music education in Australian primary schools was to increase the numbers of music specialists
(p. 93). Champion (2012) maintains that one of the reasons that there are difficulties in instituting and maintaining school music education, is the fact that “[music] specialist teachers aren’t always available”. For this reason it seems that Australian generalist teachers, in almost all instances, are unable to provide an effective, sequential music program in their classrooms. Jeanneret (2006) further claimed that when generalists were involved in music teaching, discussions about the lack of quality in music education usually arose. In this research enquiry, the researcher did make an attempt to find a government primary school where there is a good music program run by a generalist teacher or generalists, but was unable to do so. The state primary school finally selected to be the subject of this research study has chosen to employ a full-time music specialist, a less than common situation in government primary schools in Victoria.

Considerable time has elapsed since educators initially approached the government on matters pertaining to the introduction of music education at primary levels as part of national education policy. The National Music Administrators Conference in 1980 was regarded as the “rationale for music education” in Australia (Buxton & McMahon, 1980, p. 8). The panel of the conference recognized the importance and the value of music education in children’s development, but at the same time, prophetically expressed their concern about music being at risk of becoming an elective subject. It was pointed out that music education in schools was facing the possibility of being “reduced to a part of arts and crafts” while it was meant to be regarded as a unique discipline in itself, capable of influencing learning and providing a means “for personal and public expression” (Buxton & McMahon, 1980, p. 4). Southcott (2009) argues that many issues that were of importance then are still a matter of consideration now and largely unresolved. It was clearly indicated in the NRSME (DEST, 2005) that action was needed to alter the apparently
critical situation that Australian music education was in, particularly to improve its quality and status immediately. In addition, there was a need to improve equity of participation in music education at all schools for all students, and supporting “productive partnership and networking with music organizations, musicians, the music industry and the Australian community” (DEST, 2005, p. v). Jeanneret (2006) reported that the Senate Enquiry into Arts Education in 1995 suggested that a number of actions needed to be taken in order to ensure music to be taught effectively. These actions included “curriculum changes being monitored; the improvement of quantity and quality of professional development programs; and increasing the number of specialist or advisory (consultant) teachers available to primary school” (p. 93). After summarizing a number of reports over 30 years, Russell-Bowie (2009) comes to the conclusion that the improvement required in the development of Australian primary school music education system involves five major areas: numbers of music specialists, quantity in resources and specialist capabilities; adequacy in instrumental instructions; quality in provision of pre-service and in-service education; and developing children-focused curriculum. Southcott (2009) puts forth that what was brought to our attention in the UNESCO seminar held more than fifty years ago is still treated as a matter of priority today. Such priorities include improving the teacher’s pre-service and in-service education; improving the adequacy of well educated music teachers; increasing the sufficiency of facilities and equipment; and, most importantly, improving the services of curriculum development.

These concerns seem to have developed into several particular issues that impact upon music teaching in government primary schools, particularly in Victoria. Firstly, formulating and developing appropriate music curriculum for music educators at all government primary schools; secondly, applying teacher efficacy in every component of the school music program, including
developing advocacy of school music education and improving effectiveness in and supporting classroom teaching and additional music activities; and finally, the provision of quality teacher education in both pre-service programs and in-service facilities. These issues will be explored in the following discussion with a greater emphasis on the first two, for example, curriculum development and teacher efficacy. The rationale for this emphasis is due to the fact that these two issues have formed the basis for the contentions of this study and, more importantly, have been seen as core practices used in the music specialist’s highly effective music program in the selected primary school. The third issue, teacher education, will be mentioned, albeit briefly, as a thorough investigation is beyond the scope of this study.

(1) Curriculum development

Understanding the aims, functions and value of music education is recommended for establishing and developing an effective music curriculum. There is a consensus amongst advocates that music education should not only be included in school curricula and placed in a core position, but should also be valued as a high priority (Lehman, 2002). Music is defined as “the imaginative process of creating, performing, and responding to sound and silence for personal and collective meaning”, and the engagement in music “shapes our thought and activity, and is evident from the earliest stages of life” (Australia Curriculum, Assessment and Reporting Authority (ACARA), 2010, p. 5). Hence, music education should start as early as possible and everybody should be, more or less, musically trained. A successful school music curriculum should accommodate accessibility for students at all year levels and should be balanced, comprehensive and sequential (Eisner, 2002; Lehman, 2002). The needs for students’ development should be positioned as the core of teaching objectives and curriculum development in music education (DEST, 2005; Schenck, 1989). The functions and value of music education
are better reflected in students’ developmental needs in the following four major areas: mental development, aesthetic experience, cognitive growth, and experiential participation (Eisner, 2002; Madsen & Lawton, 2002; MENC, 1999).

More specifically, from a neurological perspective, music training enables the auditory cortex – the part of the human brain that interprets sound – to perform faster in terms of transmitting information from the senses to the brain (Gray, 2010; Collins, 2010; Eisner, 2002). In school music education, students’ intelligence is cultivated musically through the learning of critical listening, expressive talking, creative composing, and analytical thinking. Subsequently, students benefit from music education in the development of communication skills and emotional expression. Mills (1991) asserted that, “music enriches children’s repertoire of ways of making sense of their environment … It is a crucial part of the development of the brain” (p. 107). Gray (2010) reports that recent research has suggested that music education should be placed in a more important position in school curricula in order to assist students with the development of their language and reading abilities. In addition to this point, Collins (2010) maintains that music education “could have a direct impact on a child’s ability to learn language by affecting the mind’s sensitivity to all sounds” (p. 1). Henley (2010) enhances this viewpoint, specifying that there is a link between music instrumental learning and the increase of children’s academic performance.

Moreover, from a sociological perspective, music education transmits cultural heritage from one generation to another and is essential in human behavioral development (DEST, 2005). This is but one of many reasons why music education should be valued and accommodated as any other core school subject, if not more so (Lehman, 2002). Lehman (2002) expressed a strong belief by asserting that any student who is allowed to leave school without receiving any music education
would be just as much at a loss as if he or she had left school without being taught science or mathematics. Enhancing this viewpoint, the *NRSME* (DEST, 2005) reported that research results had indicated more inherent benefits created by arts learning experience than that by science and mathematics. Lehman (2002) further claimed that in order to cultivate one’s innate musical potential early commencement and continuity of music education would optimize this development. By studying music on a formal level, students can learn to appreciate more sophisticated forms of music in addition to being exposed to everyday pop music. In addition, the *NRSME* (DEST, 2005) maintained that in the process of developing students’ musical potential, experience in music studies also provides students an opportunity to succeed when performance in other disciplines may be lacking. It was recommended in the report that music could enhance participants’ psychological and physical status in exercise or sports.

Music is an essential part of human existence and should be understood in all its complexity, diversity and forms by all of us, rather than just the gifted and the privileged (Mills, 1991). Music education accommodates and fosters the universal appeal that music possesses, providing the vehicle whereby music can be studied and created in all cultures. It also cultivates a deeper appreciation and need for the perpetual experience of that which is aesthetic, providing the individual with the capability to respond and participate in an artistic manner (Lehman, 2002; Madsen & Lawton, 2002). In addition, music learning helps develop “positive attitudes and keener insights towards others within the world community” (Madsen & Lawton, 2002, p. 150).

Based upon the results of his study, Henley (2010) suggests that music plays a vital part in our lives, and that every student is entitled to be involved in music education. Madsen and Lawton (2002) further recommended that music education should be built upon a foundation that
recognizes “that every person involved as a learner ought to have the best and most complete instruction possible” (p. 150).

In 1980, the panel of the aforementioned National Music Administrators Conference advocated that every child had an equal right to music education, and that music should be included in the core curriculum as a priority, especially at the early stage of schooling. It was further recommended that a nationalized music curriculum should be placed in the core curriculum together with subjects such as science, languages and the arts (Buxton & McMahon, 1980). More recently, Champion (2012) asserts that music, as a primary form of the Arts “can be a core element of a school’s formal curriculum, a significant contributor to the co-curricular program and a defining feature of the school culture”. However, under the current government educational system, music at primary levels still remains a non-compulsory subject in many schools in Victoria. This is permissible as the Victorian Essential Learning Standards (VELS), which covers all compulsory years of schooling (Preparatory\(^1\)-Year \(^2\)), only requires three of the five Arts (dance, drama, music, visual arts and media) to be taught (Victorian Curriculum and Assessment Authority (VCAA), 2009). The learning focuses in the lower levels of VELS are very non-specific, and even by the upper levels there is little specific direction offered. Disappointingly, some forty years later the arts curriculum seems to have moved backward towards the direction which opposes the skill-based prescription (Southcott & Hartwig, 2005). On the positive side, the national Shape of the Australian Curriculum: The Arts, released on 7 August 2012, could be regarded as a step forward towards including music as a compulsory subject in all Australian government primary schools (Cosaitis, 2012). Coinciding with this, Champion (2012) asserts that “this is a welcome national affirmation of the place of music

\(^1\) Preparatory students are aged from 4 to 5 years old.
\(^2\) Year 10 students are aged from 15 to 16 years old.
education in the curriculum”. A more detailed discussion about the principles and theories guiding the development of music curriculum, in conjunction with extensive exploration of the newly released national curriculum and VELS will be presented in Chapter 5.

There are many practices involved in the development of music curriculum, for example, identifying teaching objectives and purposes, planning and implementing programs, organizing corresponding experience, balancing activity engagement and learning concepts, evaluating teaching/learning outcomes, reviewing curricular materials, and so on (ACARA, 2010; DEST, 2005). In terms of developing a music curriculum at primary levels, Mills (1991) believed that the structure of the curriculum should be one that “gives a sense of direction to teaching, without constraining children’s progress” (p. 106). It was further stated that an effective music curriculum at primary levels should be children-centred and its development should be based upon students’ real needs for and their capabilities in authentic music learning. In this study, the discussion of this issue will focus on two practices: the establishment and development of teaching objectives based upon student-centred teaching principles; and eclecticism in the selection of music teaching approaches. The rationale for focusing on these two particular practices lies in their prioritized application in the music specialist’s curriculum development in the selected primary school.

(2) Teacher efficacy

Further to the issue of the actual provision of music education in schools, one must also be aware of the equally important issue of the teacher efficacy, especially at primary levels. Teacher efficacy is defined as “a construct developed to explore and measure individuals’ perceived self-efficacy beliefs as they apply to the specific behavior of teaching”, and has been the centre of
research studies for almost half a century (Buckner, 2008, p. 6). Teacher efficacy is a broad topic in the field of education, encompassing areas of origin, meaning, measure, etc, at both general and specific levels. Hence, a holistic investigation in this matter is beyond the scope of this study.

Amongst many practices required in successful teacher efficacy, music advocacy is considered vital. Advocacy of school music education is regarded as a vital skill for all music educators in terms of the development of their music programs as well as the promotion of music education in general public (Tutt & Townley, 2011). The value of music education - the teaching of music - should the initiating and underlying drive of the advocacy of school music education (Buckner, 2008). According to the NRSME (DEST, 2005), the adequacy of music education in the Australian government school system has been a serious concern since the late 20th century. The underlying causes for the current situation of government school music education are numerous, but all contribute to the growing demand for music advocacy to be developed and strengthened in order to convince those in authority, especially policymakers, to implement and consolidate music education in this particular educational system (DEST, 2005). In order to be successful in convincing administrators and holders of authority in the government school system through advocacy, the functions and value of music studies, which have been previously presented in the discussion of curriculum development, must also be drawn upon to support logical arguments necessary for effective advocacy (Eisner, 2002; Lehman, 2002).

Music educators around the world are facing the challenge of repeatedly proving to parents the importance of “involving children and adolescents in music education … in terms of [its] artistic experience, personal fulfillment and educational development” (McPherson & O’Neill, 2010, p. 102). In Australia, many music educators in the current government educational system also feel powerless when fighting for the survival of music education in government schools because of
the lack of advocacy tools and materials (MCA, 2011). Unfortunately, music advocacy in Australia does not seem to be as effective as it should be. Geoghegan and McCaffrey (2004) admitted that despite the positive outcomes many excellent educators achieved in music education, music advocacy in Australia is far behind that of some other countries, for example the USA. Elpus (2007) reported that the history of the advocacy of music education in the USA can be traced back to the beginning of the profession of music education.

In his article, Mark (2002) defines advocacy as “the way that we as music educators can explain to policy makers, as well as to the general public, the reasons why our profession is important and why we need their support to continue serving the needs of society” (p. 44). Despite the fact that the high costs of music education have proven too much of a burden in some schools, particularly for those in which the argument for arts education failed to convince policy makers, the effort achieved in school music education by far has demonstrated that music education advocacy not only benefits music teachers themselves in running their programs but also benefits music learners as well as the community in a multitude of ways (Tutt & Townley, 2011; Mark, 2002).

Through advocacy, policy makers can be informed about the advantages of school music education and also have their attention drawn to the value of these advantages. In addition, music educators can explain to the public at large about the function and importance of school music education through advocacy (Mark, 2002). However, in order to effectively implement music education in schools, ongoing support from policy makers is required at all times. Therefore, music advocates need to ensure that the decisions made by legislators are the result of “informed judgment based on knowledge” (Mark, 2002, p. 44).
Mark (2002) asserted that ‘advocacy’ is “a term that encompasses a wide variety of activities” (p. 45). However, Tutt and Townley (2011) warn that these activities often appear to be based upon presumption and simply acted upon without giving any thought to the policies which underpin them. ‘Valid’ music advocacy is the result of the guidelines stemming from specific grounds or principles which are based upon professional beliefs in the true purpose of music education. These beliefs will then form an advocate’s personal philosophy, and the degree of meeting the proposed outcome of the personal philosophy will gauge the effectiveness of one’s advocacy. Successful music advocacy strategies must be conceived in the music educator’s professional philosophy and the philosophy must be promoted through a variety of activities (Tutt & Townley, 2011).

Elpus (2007) argues that the purpose of advocacy in the field of school music education is to make clear how music educators’ belief in the value and benefits of music education can be delivered to the general public, and more specifically, to the school community in order to enhance the popularity and the quality of music education throughout all schools nationwide. Reinforcing this point, Mark (2002) asserted that “advocacy does not drive the profession; rather, it reflects music educators’ beliefs, purposes, and accomplishments” (p. 48). It is a vehicle whereby music educators are able to attain and complete their role in a process that provides democratic intervention in informing policy makers about the reasons underlying the necessity for maintaining their support for school music education. Advocacy also seeks to provide a positive influence upon important individuals and groups in the ways they recognize, understand and believe in school music education (Music Education Online, 2006).

Tutt and Townley (2011) argue that music advocacy strategies should not be simplistic and have no support from rigorous research or documentations. Instead, effective advocacy needs to be
formed upon the advocate’s “principle of arguing for a specific set of beliefs and needs” in music education (p. 63). The advocate’s professional beliefs and the specific working environments must also be given careful considerations in order to enhance the effectiveness of advocacy because policy makers and especially school “administrators are more likely to support programs that are led by thoughtful teachers who can clearly demonstrate the value and needs of their program” (Tutt & Townley, 2011, p. 63).

In the past, music education philosophers have paid very little attention to the real need for advocacy, and some advocacy has relied too heavily on “questionable research or questionable interpretations of valid research findings” (Elpus, 2007, p. 16). When music educators fight for the survival of music education at government schools or intend to persuade those in authority to include music education in the school curriculum, they are often unable to work communally as a whole, and are “unable to create a compelling, cogent advocacy argument” (Elpus, 2007, p. 13). But even when they are able to deliver their message, it appears that their voices have very little effect at federal, state, local and school levels (MCA, 2011).

Despite the extensive body of research, both internationally and nationally, demonstrating the positive impact music education has on students’ development, music educators cannot expect administrators and those in authority in the government school system to fully realize the value and importance of school music education from research results only, regardless of the reliability of the findings (Elpus, 2007). It has been suggested that the major reason why music education has not been recognized as a core subject in primary schools is because the legislators have only a limited view of the value of music education compared to other subjects. There have been some positive results achieved in the past which have served to reinforce the importance of this
issue. In the USA, Dr. Robyn Swanson, the President of Kentucky Music Educators Association, stated that the reason why

music education has been identified as a core content subject at the federal and state level [is] because key information about the value of music education was provided by music education advocates to those in government, school administration and the general community (Commission on Music Education in Kentucky (CMEK), 2003, p. I).

What is required in the government school system is the provision of precise and specific knowledge from music educators so that legislators can make judgments based upon the availability of accurate and extensive information. Until music is elevated to the status of a core subject in the minds of legislators, there will always be a continual demand for advocacy of music education in government schools (Elpus, 2007; MCA, 2011; Music Education Online, 2006). In Australia, many children receive either very limited music education or no music education at all, and therefore, the primary objective of music advocacy is to emphasize the importance of music education in schools through the promotion of school music programs by music educators as well as other parties involved (MCA, 2011).

Music advocacy needs to be well-organised, target-focused and on-going. Music educators should engage in strategically based advocacy in accordance with the roles and characteristics of relevant parties, particularly administrative members, other teachers, students, parents, and the local community. Developing a positive relationship with these parties is crucial (CMEK, 2003). Music educators and school principals should develop a strong working relationship. The key to achieving this requires the music educator to provide: a well-structured, carefully worded and comprehensive curriculum; frequent discussions regarding scheduling requirements and pertinent advice; a holistic and enthusiastic approach, encompassing both curricular and extracurricular
programs; an appropriate and timely manner in making purchase requisitions for music teaching equipment; meticulous planning of music events in accordance with the school’s timeline (CMEK, 2003; Music Education Online, 2006). Cultivating an extensive appreciation in all curricular areas and participating in joint curricular activities with other teachers are imperative in advocacy. The music educator may also suggest how other subjects can benefit from interacting with music education when inviting other teachers to music activities. Contributions by other teachers’ participation in music presentations should be recognized and appreciated, thus, informance, which will be introduced in detail in the following chapter, is recommended as an ideal practice. In terms of developing a friendly and positive relationship with students, the music educator should formulate the music curriculum in accordance with students’ real needs and progress (CMEK, 2003; Music Education Online, 2006). Providing opportunities for students to be involved in other music related activities, such as stage-craft and music classroom decoration, is also important. Students are to be constantly encouraged to research particular music themes and reproduce them in program format. Music educators should always be mindful that their performance in teaching and interactions with the students through the music program may directly influence students’ perceptions of music education. Hence, their effective teaching behaviour within and beyond the classroom may enhance students’ awareness of the merits of music education, which, subsequently, might better prepare the students for music advocacy in the future (CMEK, 2003). Parents need to be informed regarding what is required of students in terms of issues involved in the music program, such as students’ learning progress, homework, public performance, rehearsals, and after-hour training or tuitions. Involvement of parents in music teaching or performance (e.g. participating in a classroom informance) may provide opportunities to promote school music programs and to enhance advocacy resources. Parents can
also be encouraged to organize and implement fund-raising support groups to help finance school instrumental and choral requirements (CMEK, 2003; Music Education Online, 2006).

Within the local community, music educators should create and maintain an active image for the purpose of developing community awareness of the benefits of school music education. It is also important to organize public performance within the local community on a regular basis for students to gain experience in performing in front of different types of audiences (CMEK, 2003; Music Education Online, 2006).

These practices have been clearly demonstrated in the teaching of the music specialist in the selected primary school in this study. Elpus (2007) maintains that advocacy is made far easier in a school that has a comprehensive and sequential music program than in a school wherein the music program is substandard or in its early stages. The successful, well-established music program in conjunction with commendable outcomes the music specialist has achieved at the selected primary school has been integral in paving the way for the effectiveness of her music advocacy. Letts (2007) adds another dimension in determining teacher efficacy by observing that the “Vitality and inventiveness of the teacher is the crucial factor in that it makes a music program worthwhile” (quoted in Bertram, 2007). These skills and qualities are also demonstrably reflected in the music specialist’s teaching and will be presented in detail in conjunction with other practices used in her application of teacher efficacy in Chapter 9.

(3) Teacher education

The primary component in the development and enhancement of music education in general is pre-service education. Southcott (2009) maintains that, to enable primary music teachers to deliver effective lessons in classroom music teaching, instrumental skills and musicianship should be part of their teacher training. Better development in musical skills, knowledge and
understanding can possibly reduce the level of teacher’s dependence on consultant support (Hoermann & Herbert, 1979, p. 23). It was further suggested that sufficient skills in performing, keyboard playing, singing, conducting and orchestral/choral organizing should be acquired during the completion of each trainee’s training course. This remains optimistic but there is little doubt that the music education of primary teachers could and should be improved. Bertram (2007) reported that undergraduate teachers like Tasmin Berasley were baffled at the probability that they might need to provide music education to their future students at primary schools. Berasley explained that her musical skills were only equivalent to that of an average two-year-old, and as much as she desired music training in the teaching-degree course, the provision of such was only as little as 20 hours throughout the entire course. Berasley was quoted as saying that though the music lessons that she presented were entertaining, they “would lack any development of music skills” (quoted in Bertram, 2007, p. 45). As mentioned previously, the music training component within a two-year Bachelor Teaching course in some universities could amount to a mere 12 hours (Jeanneret, 2006). Again, this provision reinforces the notion that specialist music teacher may be the only workable solution to providing effective school music programs at primary levels.

In-service education is important to all music educators, including music specialists. The centre of this research study, namely, the music specialist at the selected primary school, expresses her viewpoint on this issue, stating that personal development is a necessarily and should be maintained on a continual, regular basis. This formed the major reason for her becoming a member of a local music teacher committee. In the committee, a number of music educators from different schools in the area present and share the latest information about school music education and innovative teaching pedagogies, as well as their specialised teaching strategies.
However, a thorough discussion of music teacher’s in-service education is beyond the scope of this study. According to the *NRSME* (DEST, 2005), “Music–specific professional development is urgently required for generalist classroom teachers currently in schools” (p. vi). In-service programs for the quality training of music teachers need to be well structured, regimented, and delivered over a suitable time frame so as to ensure effective acquisition of traditional and innovative music skills. Moreover, Southcott (2009) asserts that the seminar in 1956 demanded consideration from the Department of Education regarding the stipulation of further training for music teachers as part of Professional Development programs. A generation later, according to Buxton and McMahon (1980), the NMAC held in Brisbane in 1980 pointed out that to be able to supply adequately trained music teachers, the teacher training institutions were required to provide “appropriate courses as a compulsory of in-service training for all teachers” (p. 12). It was further stated that various in-service programs were required to support music teachers in developing and maintaining their critical teaching abilities (Buxton & McMahon, 1980).

Amongst various in-service programs, the Kodály teaching method has always had strong advocates and unique advantages. Hoermann and Herbert (1979) claimed that, in comparison with children, it is harder for adults to acquire basic music concepts and skills as “the progress requires precision teaching; it is cumulative, long and slow” (p. 26). However, “the logical, sequential and cumulative progression inherent in the Kodály approach is as appropriate for the teacher as for the child…teachers are able to function effectively at various levels, gradually acquiring skills in the same manner and at the same stage as the children” (p. 26).

Given all these recommendations that have been made repeatedly over the decades, there seems to be little improvement in the provision of music by generalist primary school teachers. In this study, as mentioned previously, the researcher attempted to find a government primary school
wherein generalist teachers provided a good music program but was unable to do so. For this reason the researcher then looked for a government school with a good music program to be the subject of this phenomenological qualitative case study in an authentic situation. There have been a number of studies into the provision (or not) of music in generalist primary teacher education but no studies were found that explored an effective music program in an authentic situation in a state school that was delivered by an effective and skilled music educator.

Expedience was the underlying impetus to conduct this single case study within which the first two identified issues became paramount and formed the contentions of this study.

- **Research contentions, questions and the importance of this study**

The two issues selected were curriculum development and teacher efficacy in primary school music education. Subsequently, the research contentions became (1) A balanced, well sequenced music curriculum is vital in an effective school music program; and (2) Teacher efficacy is pivotal in the success of a school music program. These two research contentions will be explained through several interrelated issues, such as the establishment of teaching goals, selection of teaching content and methods, advocacy of school music education, effectiveness in music teaching, and so on.

The contentions of this thesis concern the nature of an effective music program operating in a government primary school and the role of teacher efficacy in the implementation of such a program. From these contentions several research questions are identified:

1. What abilities are required in a successful music educator in a state primary school in Victoria?
2. How is classroom music taught in the selected school music program?
3. How are instrumental and choral music taught in this program and what is their relationship to classroom music?

4. What strategies does the school music educator employ to advocate for the inclusion of music in this school?

5. How is the school music program understood by the school Principal, the Assistant Principal and the other teachers?

6. How does the local community engage with the school music program?

This single phenomenological case study will address these research questions and investigate the school music classroom and the instrumental and choral music programs using observations and interviews. After the presentation of the data, the discussion will respond to each of these questions.

The significance of this study does not lie in its presentation of new practices in schools, but in its capacity to examine, analyse, and present a rare example of research into an actual school, its complexities, interrelationships, and its detailed profile of a most effective music educator and music program. The study of the selected school also presents a model of practice, and how this model can and does work. The researcher’s philosophy has its foundation in the deployment of phenomenology as a means of investigating what is actually happening. Phenomenology is an applicable philosophical and methodological approach as what is actually being observed at the school is comprised of real people within a real school, demonstrating real practices which achieve actual outcomes.

To contextualize the two research contentions it was necessary to explain: (1) the history of the inclusion of music education in Victorian state-supported primary schools; (2) the Arts in the recently released National Curriculum and VELS; (3) the most commonly and successfully used
teaching methods (the Kodály and the Orff approaches) and music activities (instrumental and choral programs); and (4) development of advocacy of school music education. These investigations will be addressed frequently throughout this thesis and in the final discussion of the data collected in this study.

This phenomenological research will investigate the music program in a selected state-supported primary school in Victoria for the purpose of identifying practices required in implementing and developing effective music teaching at primary levels. This school is selected as the subject of a single case study as a demonstration of a very successful school music program in the current state educational system. This school is rare in Victoria in having a full-time music specialist who teaches students at all year levels, organizes instrumental and choral programs and, at the same time, offers additional elective violin tuition. This study will explore why and how this system works and may provide a model of how such programs can be implemented in this or any state primary school. This selected primary school is in many ways representative of many such schools. It is located in a representative geographic area, the Northern region of Melbourne which includes a broad range of socio-economic levels and a correspondingly relevant sample of schools. To encompass more regions would be beyond the scope of this enquiry and, as a representative sample, indicative findings could inform future research in a wider area.

In this qualitative case study, semi-structured interviews will ask the participants of the school’s music program, including the music specialist, school Principal, Assistant Principal, and other staff members such as the violin specialist and the school librarian, about their music education backgrounds and their practices in the music program. There is a particular interest in the Kodály method and the Orff approach as they have been strongly recommended in
recent educational debates, both internationally and within Australia, as will be discussed in the review of research literature. Further, the music specialist in the selected primary school bases much of her curriculum on these approaches. Intensive observations will also be conducted in the case study over a certain period of time in order to investigate the school’s music program in detail. The music specialist and her teaching in classroom music and violin groups will be the focal point of observations. The interviews and observations will also explore in greater depth the school’s classroom music practice in order to identify the most efficacious methodological approach. In addition, a writing response will be collected from a group of students in terms of their perspectives on the school’s music program. Based upon the data gathered from the case study, an in-depth discussion of the school’s music program and the music specialist’s effective practices in school music teaching will be presented. It is hoped that the results of the data collated in this qualitative study will provide an example of positive practice in music education in state-supported primary schools in Victoria.

- **The researcher**

As a music teacher, in the capacity of both classroom and instrumental education, the researcher has always had a strong motivation to research music teaching methods in the setting of the modern classroom. The researcher graduated from the University of Melbourne with a Master of Music Studies (Teaching and Performance) in 2004 and has been teaching music in both China and Australia for some 12 years. Her interest in school music education underpins her belief that music education should be universally available to all students as early as possible so as to provide a foundation for music intelligence development and high level music appreciation throughout the life span. The rationale for this study stemmed from the observation of the researcher’s private students at primary school level in Victoria. She was often surprised by the
fact that some students had never received music education at school, or that the music education the school offered was inadequate. This led the researcher to question, firstly, the current status of music education at primary schools in Victoria, and secondly, what teaching method would be most suitable for Victorian primary students. Having been a student of the Kodály method from the age of 4 up until her undergraduate years, the researcher has always been a strong advocate for the Kodály approach to music education, recognizing it as a convenient, yet highly effective system which has enabled her to achieve her professional goals in music appreciation and expertise. Therefore, the researcher is motivated by the need to evaluate the efficacy and applicability of the Kodály method, as well as Orff and other approaches, as a step towards both improving music education and instituting its incorporation as a core subject within the early years curriculum throughout Victoria.

This chapter has discussed the nature of this study including the issues raised in the study, research contentions, the importance of the study, and an outline of the methodological approaches employed in this study. The following two chapters will present a holistic literature review examining firstly, the effects of advocacy, efficacy, school instrumental instructions, choral activities, pull-out program, and public performance; and secondly, the effects of specific teaching methods advocated in the Kodály method and the Orff approach. These practices are regarded as essential to this study as they have formed the basis and framework for the music specialist’s effective teaching within and beyond the classroom at the selected government primary school. The literature review will focus on the fact that research into these methods has been a relatively recent phenomenon, and that early reports were predominantly positive. It is also noted that until recently, research has been rather limited in its scope and frequency.
Chapter Two

Literature Review Part (1)

Advocacy and Efficacy

General introduction

This review will focus on research concerning primary school music education in Victoria and specific school music teaching approaches, including the Kodály method, the Orff approach, school choral activities, and school instrumental programs (violin, guitar and recorder). By far, the majority of studies that have been done have demonstrated positive effects of these teaching approaches (Blackford & Staintorp, 2007). Advocacy, efficacy of school music education, as well as public performance and pull-out issues in school music programs will also be the focal points of this review. There is a considerable emphasis given to research concerning the Kodály method as this underpins much of the music program, especially at lower levels, of the primary school selected for this research study. Comparatively speaking, few critical and evaluative research studies have been undertaken into the efficacy of specific approaches to school music instruction, such as those of the Kodály method (Blackford & Staintorp, 2007), and the Orff approach (McIntire, 2007). These approaches are implemented in much of the music program at the selected primary school, and have formed the foundation of the music specialist’s teaching practices within the classroom. The research literature concerning both these and other methods utilized in the school music program that is the focus of this study will be considered. The
comparative lack of detail in research concerning all the methods is due to the limited availability of relevant literature.

Given the breadth of the relevant body of substantial research literature, the review will be divided into two chapters with different focal points pertinent to the central aspect of this study, the music specialist and her program at the selected primary school. Firstly, the music specialist is regarded as an effective music educator as well as a strong advocate of school music education. Both advocacy and efficacy of school music education are vital in her teaching practice within and beyond classroom. The organization of her music program relies on a diverse array of practical arrangements, especially the instrumental and choral instructions, as well as negotiations with other staff members. One particular issue emanating from this that can generate tension in the school is the ‘pull-out’ program, whereby individual children leave regular classes for specialist music lessons. The other aspect which is imperative to school instrumental and choral programs is public performance. Both the pull-out program and public performance are important components in the music specialist’s music program at the selected primary school and have been mentioned by every interviewee in this case study. Hence, the first chapter of the review will focus on the music education research concerning advocacy of school music education, efficacy of school music teaching, effects on public performance, and the challenges of the pull-out program. In addition, this chapter will also present the review of literature regarding the effects of students’ participation in school choral activities as well as instrumental programs, specifying violin, guitar and recorder instructions, as these are the programs which are currently being run by the music specialist at her school.

The second part of the literature review, which will be presented in the following chapter, will focus on two particular music teaching approaches, including the Kodály method and the Orff
approach. The structure of this review section is organized thus because these two approaches have provided most of the effective teaching strategies for the music specialist’s teaching and have been utilized extensively in all of the different components of the music program, especially in her classroom music teaching.

1. Advocacy of school music education

Few research studies directly address the question of the role of advocacy in school music education (Southcott, 1998). In order to successfully advocate for music education in school systems, policymakers’ attitudes towards the issue is crucial. In addition, the attitudes of another three parties (students, school administrators, and school music educators) towards supporting, delivering, and participating in the school music program, also need to be taken into serious consideration. Recent research studies have, to a degree, offered some insight in the areas of students, school administrators and music educators.

- Students

Despite some research suggesting that involvement in music studies “is associated with higher academic achievement” (Lehman, 2002, p. 146) in major school subjects, and “can have a positive effect on the functioning of the brain in young people” (McPherson & O’Neill, 2010, p. 102), music as an elective subject is often undervalued in comparison to other subjects (Gray, 2010). Recent studies have revealed that many students regard music as a less achievable subject, and it is extremely difficult to “overcome the sociocultural barriers that prevent [students] from reaching their full musical potential” (McPherson & O’Neill, 2010, p. 102). Subsequently, students’ motivation, beliefs and attitudes towards engaging in and pursuing music studies have become major topics for music education researchers to investigate.
An international study involving research subjects from eight countries set out to identify the “key motivational orientations that impact on the decisions that students make about their engagement in music as a school subject compared to other school subjects” (McPherson & O’Neill, 2010, p. 102). The findings have revealed that across all school grades, “there was an overall decline in students’ competence beliefs and values” in most countries, and students’ competence beliefs for music were lower compared to physical education and mother language studies. Music education at school was less valued and its task difficulty ratings were lower than other school subjects, except for visual arts. Students with a background in music reported being more highly motivated towards general school subjects, and had less difficulty and stronger competence beliefs than non-musical students. Results suggested that the learning of instrumental or vocal music motivates students more in the study of other school subjects. The results of the findings indicate that advocacy for the purpose of enhancing the importance that students place upon school music education may motivate more students to learn music globally (McPherson & O’Neill, 2010).

Research results involving school students from Australia, New Zealand and the USA revealed that students expressed strong interest in music studies, especially in learning to play a musical instrument (Henley, 2010). The students believed that learning music provides them with a great deal of enjoyment and enhances their positive feelings about themselves. Students also reported that music learning helps them develop a positive attitude towards studies in other subjects as well as general schooling, helping “a significant number in their other academic studies” (Henley, 2010, p. 15). Based upon the study’s results, it is also suggested that students who were perceived to be failing, often experience an academic about face after commencing general music study and learning to play a music instrument (Henley, 2010).
School administrators and music educators

According to Gallagher (2007), a study was conducted to find out the level of competency held by music educators and music administrators in practising their advocacy tools, techniques and public relations in order to support the music program at their schools in the USA. The researcher found that music administrators feel proficient in delivering advocacy efforts whereas music educators did not feel competent with their advocacy efforts. In terms of the levels of satisfaction that music administrators and educators felt towards their State School Music Association, the outcome was equally positive. However, the research findings did point out a need for the provision of training that the association provides for the music administrations and music educators in order to improve advocacy efficacy.

Henley (2010) reported that teachers in general have a very positive attitude towards school music education, and “realize the enormous benefits that flow from good quality music programs” (p. 15). Other teachers also expressed the understanding that the principal’s support plays a significant role in flourishing the school’s music program (Henley, 2010). Generally speaking, teachers believe that learning to play a musical instrument has the effect of enhancing intelligence, bolstering self-esteem, and “supports greater student self-management” (p. 15). Overall, music education advocacy is in strong demand based upon the current status of music education in public schools in Victoria (MCA, 2011). The development of advocacy strongly relies on ongoing research findings in order to influence policymakers’ outlook and decisions through development of rigorous understanding of the importance of music education and its extensive benefits. It is also beneficial for advocacy to cultivate school administrators’ attitudes towards establishing a music program and providing necessary support for its development and continuity, whilst creating greater students’ awareness of the importance and the value of school
music education. Finally, advocacy plays a vital role in supporting music educators in their continuing endeavours to establish, maintain and perpetuate the inclusion of music education in public school curricula (Southcott, 1998).

2. **Efficacy of school music education**

Research gauging the efficacy of school education has increased since the 1970s (Grant & Drafall, 1991). The effectiveness of a teacher can be interpreted as his/her teaching efforts to achieve positive student learning outcomes, the measurement of which has become necessary in response to the lack of assessments and standards in evaluating existing teachers’ efficacy and in ensuring effective preparation of new teachers (Grant & Drafall, 1991; Darling-Hammond, 2010). It is readily acknowledged that students’ achievements in learning are affected directly by the quality of their teachers’ teaching and that specific types of teaching pedagogical behaviour can produce positive outcomes (Grant & Drafall, 1991).

More than twenty years ago, as Grant and Drafall (1991) stated, “Music education has not kept pace in efforts to provide a research-based model of effective teaching” (p. 34). Many music educators are not interested in having their teaching efficacy evaluated in terms of students’ learning outcomes. By far, the majority of studies in this area have been of a descriptive nature, indentifying (a) the successful music teachers’ professional, musical, and personal features; (b)
particular types of proficiency in teaching abilities; and illustrating instructional techniques demonstrated by teachers who have been recognized as effective models.

Teachout (1997) conducted an early study with the intention of identifying the most important teaching practices and skills required for the success of teachers in their first three-year music teaching experience. Responses received from both experienced and preservice teachers were categorized into three groups: musical talent, personal skills and teaching abilities. The results of the study concluded that the importance of teaching abilities and personal skills was valued above that of musical skills at a significant level.

Compared to teachers in other school subjects music teachers enjoy a number of advantages. Shuler (2011) outlines the following facts as “scientific evidence” to illustrate this statement (p. 8): (a) Music teachers have a more intimate understanding of their subject as the completion of a music degree requires more training within a longer time span than other subjects. (b) Music teachers are more immersed in their subject and are driven by music which permeates most aspects of their lives. Music teachers’ lives are transformed by music, the benefits of which they are happy to pass on. (c) Music teachers are better able to accommodate larger class sizes and are skilled in making their classes interesting so as to draw competitive numbers of students. Taebel (1990) reported on a study that compared music teachers and other teachers on different types of classroom teaching practices and ten skills. The results revealed that music teachers had advantages “in using materials and eliciting student performance” over other teachers (p. 15). Though some music teachers were discerning in their perceptions of the evaluators’ expertise
and the validity of the instrument used for evaluating music teachers’ competency, there was an overall consensus amongst music teachers in supporting the necessity for evaluation programs. Shuler (2011) suggests music teachers and communities should adhere to the following standards in order to measure the effectiveness of music programs: (a) students’ learning outcomes, and the intensity and extent of their learning; (b) the number of students who benefit from the music programs; (c) motivation of participating students in continuing onto future music learning involvement at advanced levels. However, just how these three criteria are to be measured is not articulated.

Choral programs and instrumental instructions are common to school music education. Prior to the investigations into the effects of these two particular forms of music activities, the researcher conducted a review of the effects of participation in general arts and music activities on students’ development. The benefits of participating in arts activities have been advocated in the past several decades. The value of arts education has been acknowledged and promoted extensively through UNESCO’s programs around the world (UNESCO, 2006). For instance, in Latin America, arts programs have helped reduce violence amongst members of the younger generations, for example, the Youth Orchestras which had “turned several generations of young people away from violence and [had] awoken true music callings” (p. 1).

Examining the relationship between children’s participation in music activities and their cognitive development has interested many educational researchers around the world, with a
number of studies having substantiated positive results (Fitzpatrick, 2006; Iwai, 2002). In terms of academic performance, Catterall, Chapleau, and Iwanaga (1999) reported that students’ who have higher levels of participation in arts activities perform better than those who have little or no arts participation. Akin (1987) asserted that “music education has a positive effect on providing opportunities for academic achievement” and that music students can usually be seen as successful achievers in academia (p. 2). She reported upon a study testing the effects of a keyboard program on children’s Mathematics achievement. The results revealed that higher scores were achieved by students who participated in the program than those who did not take the keyboard lessons.

Iwai (2002) maintains that participation in suitable arts activities not only helps children develop artistic skills but also improves their ability in arts appreciation. Psychologically, appropriate arts participations can benefit children in the areas of self-confidence, self-awareness and acceptance of others. Iwai (2002) puts forth that students’ involvement in arts activities reduces “children’s negative attitudes toward school”, at the same time, helps them “develop a positive attitude, such as motivation” (p. 409). Other positive affects that arts activities have on children include the development of a “non-biased and positive attitude toward society”, and better creative and communication skills (p. 411). Wallick (1998) maintained that skills required for music reading can be transferred into skills necessary for linguistic comprehension and graphic interpretation. In substantiation of this, a longitudinal study was conducted to identify the relationship between musical training and brain functions in linguistic pitch and reading processing. The results successfully demonstrated the positive transfer from music to linguistic abilities, illustrating the impact of musical training and further revealing its strong effects upon children’s brain functions (Moreno, Marques, Santos, Castro, Santos & Besson, 2009).
3. School choral program

Since the inception of school music education, choral singing has been a staple inclusion, especially at elementary level, throughout the world (Chorus America, 2009). As a form of extracurricular activity, choral singing has demonstrated both its immediate and long-term benefits on school children through shaping participants’ engagement in music performance and appreciation (Pitts, 2007). The general body of research in the choral field has revealed that participation in choral activities has significant positive influences upon its practitioners across generations. The benefits of the extensive inclusion of choral singing in arts education have been well documented. In 2003, a study about the impact of chorus conducted in America resulted in confirming that choral singing was the most favourable form of participation in performing arts. It is contended that the benefits attributed to choruses may be generated by a number of aspects, including its discipline, its artistic elements, and the opportunity it provides to cooperate and work with others in a community which is more far-reaching than the individual (Chorus America, 2009). The role that choral singing plays in children’s cognitive and behavioural development has become the focus of recent studies in the field of education. Such research has the effect of filling in the gaps in early-years music education as previous research has mainly focused on the influence of instrumental learning rather than singing (Chorus America, 2009). The results of such research have reinforced the viewpoint that the benefits of participating in choral activities are more significant for children than for adults, and that such benefits are demonstrated in a vast range of areas covering social skills, civic involvement, behavioural and emotional development and school performances (Tupman, 2011).
In 2009, a study examining choral impact upon American life was conducted by Grunwald Associates LLC at the request of Chorus America who had previously commissioned an initial study in 2003 as mentioned previously. The research focused upon two main objectives: firstly, as a means of updating the 2003 research concerning choruses and choristers; and secondly, to explore the role that choral experience plays in early-years education and development from the viewpoint of both educators and parents (Chorus America, 2009). The key findings of this study revealed that students who participate in choral singing (1) achieve higher grades in academic performance; (2) have a stronger sense of team work and are better team players; (3) demonstrate better social skills, e.g. have many friends and value friendships; (4) are more active and involved in sports or other school activities; (5) have better engagement in communities; (6) are more willing to be involved in voluntary work; (7) help more with housework and with peers’ school commitments; and (8) have benefited in terms of improvements in physical development and health condition since their choral participation. There could be a concern that this research contains a certain amount of bias, given the aim of the body commissioning the research.

In terms of the students’ attitude toward chorus participation, the results of a study reported by Mizener (1993) indicated that students’ attitude toward participating in singing activities are generally positive, especially amongst girls and young children. A child’s attitude towards music is well established by the time they turn 8 years of age. Factors that determine a child’s attitude towards chorus participation is not “singing accuracy” but influences from peers’ or family members’ participation in singing activities within school or community (p. 244). The classroom music educator’s lesson plans, with emphasis on a positive attitude toward singing, would also encourage students to participate in choral activities. The study concluded that the support and influence from school music educators, family members and peers would increase students’
positive attitudes toward chorus participation which may then result in enhancing their school music experience and future life in their adulthood (Mizener, 1993).

A study about “high school students’ attitudes toward single-sex choir versus mixed choir” was conducted by Jackson in 2009 (p. v). The results indicated no significant difference between high school girls’ and boys’ attitudes toward participation in choir. However, in terms of song preferences, a difference between two genders was revealed. The results of the study also indicated that mixed choir was favoured by both male and female participants despite the researcher’s suggestion that single-sex choruses are more suitable for gender-specific training techniques and music literature, and the ensemble may receive more musical benefits (Jackson, 2009). As a final point, it appears that students’ attitudes toward participation in choral activities are related to various aspects, including gender, age, family education, the classroom music educator’s teaching philosophy, classroom singing program, pre-existing musical/singing skills, and self-esteem.

In summary, a choral program can be a significant part of school curriculum for students. It provides opportunities for students to learn and develop vocal technique and musicianship, and to experience singing, performing and creating music within a community. It also creates a possibility for students to surpass or succeed not only in the music industry but in non-musical areas as well (Kingston, 2011). Choral singing is a unique form of participatory arts education which is characterized as being graceful, accessible and participatory (Chorus America, 2009). School choirs also create an environment for choristers to be involved in a community wherein their sense of being a team member may be built, their enthusiasm in helping others may be enhanced, and their friendships with each other may be consolidated (Tupman, 2011). The human voice is the most natural and readily accessible music instrument. By using voice as the
primary instrument, choristers realize that “the power of personal expression” is actually generated within their body, and experience the impact of this power “when blended with that of like-minded colleagues” (Roennfeldt, 2011, p. 1). Hence, participation in choral singing creates a most accessible entry into arts learning. It overcomes the cultural, educational and financial barriers which may occur in the participation in other art forms. In addition, the cost of establishing a school choir is relatively low compared to forming other instrumental music groups. Furthermore, encouraging young children to participate in choral singing provides opportunities for them to develop skills in both performing and appreciating music in their future life fulfillment (Chorus America, 2009). Nevertheless, the researcher would caution that because of the lack of research concerning measurement of the impact of choral participation in enhancing chorister’s musical skills, more diverse research is desirable in order to gauge choral impact upon participants’ music language acquisition, sight-singing skills, development in aural skills resulting in singing in perfect pitch and timing, and choristers’ long-term attitude towards music.

4. School instrumental program

Other researchers have placed their research focus upon investigating the benefits of instrumental learning for young children and the benefits of group instrumental instructions for school students. The results of Fitzpatrick’s (2006) research study show that compared to non-instrumental students, those who participate in school music instrumental programs perform better in Reading, Science, Math and Citizenship. Catterall et al. (1999) reported that an accumulated number of studies have indicated that experience in particular instrument learning appears to have incremental effects on young children’s cognitive performance. More specifically, these experiences seem to “involve forms of mathematical reasoning” (p. 9). For
instance, piano learning is associated with the geometric system of music which most likely strengthens children’s spatial-temporal ability whilst string music learning develops children’s cognition of spatial interpretation through producing musical phrases and sounds (Catterall, et al., 1999). Wallick (1998) further specified that the learning of string instruments requires students’ understanding of “fractions and their relationships to each other in order to manipulate rhythm. The student who has trouble understanding the abstract concept that a half is twice one quarter may comprehend the concrete example or his or her bow’s moving twice as far on half notes as quarter notes” (p. 245). Klinedinst (1991) concluded that beginning instrumental learners’ performances in mathematics, reading and scholastic ability strongly relate to the achievement in their instrumental learning.

Schenck (1989) claimed that music instrument learning provides many benefits for children, especially in the development of creativity and personality. Thompson (1984) specified that school music instrumental programs involve a great deal of group music making from which students not only gain the benefits created by general instrument learning, but also “the most significant aspect group work” offers - motivation (p. 157). Students’ involvement in group instrumental learning enables them to develop a broad range of skills as well as to prepare them for ensemble work. Cheng and Durrant (2007) note that group learning and ensemble participation are able to provide an interactive environment for students which other teaching forms may fail to do. Thompson (1984) maintained that in terms of the comparison to the one-on-one class setting, it is easier for group instrumental learning to create “an atmosphere of discovery”, within which, students are able to share the “sense of discovery” with others rather than listening to the teacher’s answers all the time (p. 170). Consequently, students’ acquisition of knowledge and skills on the instrument is a self-driven progression rather than a passive one.
Such a positive learning process also helps students develop their problem-solving skills as it develops greater independent reasoning. Concurring with this, Cheng and Durrant (2007) state that students’ participation in group instrumental learning helps them assess their own performance and progress, at the same time, allowing them to evaluate and comment on other’s playing. The result of their single case study confirms the enhancement of students’ problem-solving skills “during peer interaction” in ensembles and small groups (p. 202). The teaching experience of Waller (1944) and his colleagues had repeatedly shown that involvement in group string programs motivated students to “broaden their contacts with other players and then [to] take up study with private teachers” (p. 38).

- Successful instrumental teachers and effective teaching of instruments

There are many musicians and music educators involved in instrumental teaching, but Waller (1944) believed that the instrumental teachers, particularly in the teaching of strings, who are able to generate interest within the community, continue their applications of the most recent teaching approaches, and advance materials and methods, would enjoy a greater priority in demand. Cheng and Durrant (2007) assert that effective instrumental teachers always demonstrate consistent levels of affinity with pupils and effective interpersonal skills in their teaching.

It is advocated that progress-focused rather than outcome-focused teaching mentality would help instrumental teachers produce effective teaching (Cheng & Durrant, 2007). Schenck (1989) argued that effective instrument teaching requires the appropriate establishment of teaching goals. These goals should be clearly targeting children’s progress on both the instrument and their overall musical abilities. According to their research results, Karlsson and Juslin (2008) point out that the clarity of teaching objectives, specification of working tasks, and systematic organization
of teaching structure can have direct effects on teaching of expression in instrumental classes. Schenck (1989) specified that in order to optimize the instrumental teaching outcome, a number of criteria should be fulfilled by the teacher: First, the study of instrument music must be an enjoyable learning journey. Hence, to ensure students’ enjoyment in their learning the teacher him/herself must enjoy what he/she is teaching. Schenck (1989) specified that, “humor and enjoyment are necessary ingredients in the [instrument] learning process” (p. 19). A second goal for the teacher should be flexible and carefully formulated teaching in accordance with students’ needs and inclinations. Howard (1996) maintained that music teaching should be student-centred and should be conducted with appropriate regularity in order to optimize students’ learning outcomes. Cheng and Durrant (2007) assert that good instrumental teachers utilise various teaching strategies and spend quality time to help students conquer learning hurdles. Another goal is that instrumental music teachers, as life-long learners should always learn from each other, sharing their commonalities as well as maintaining their individuality. In addition, teachers should continuously enlarge their knowledge in all types of music in order to introduce students to both familiar and unfamiliar music genres. Cheng and Durrant (2007) point out that successful instrumental teachers always introduce a broad range of music types to students. Schenck (1989) also asserted that teachers must be aware that the ultimate outcome for instrument teaching is to enable students to perform in front of an audience rather than playing in the practice room or for him/herself all the time. Howard (1996) advocated that the best learning outcomes are produced through children’s frequent involvement in performances. To support this, it is very important that the teacher maintains his/her positive attitude so that the students can be influenced and encouraged through learning (Schenck, 1989). Rolland (1947) pointed out that “motivation and inspiration is the first duty of the teacher” (p. 59). Cheng and Durrant (2007)
maintain that good instrumental teachers are always encouraging, and care for their students’
general well-being. In conclusion, there is a consensus amongst researchers that instrumental
teaching objectives emphasizing the cultivation of students’ learning, the facilitation of an
environment conducive to learning whilst engendering independence in learning, “contribute
greatly to effective instrumental teaching” (Cheng & Durrant, 2007, p. 194). The practice of
these criteria by the music specialist observed in this study will be analyzed in detail in future
chapters.

- Instrumental teacher’s three duties

In terms of evaluating the suitability of the teacher’s goals for instrumental teaching for young
children, Schenck (1989) categorized the teaching objectives into three groups, illustrating them
in the following three duties: (a) teaching an Instrument; (b) teaching general Music aspects; and
(c) setting up a broad range of non-musical Pedagogical aims. The first category involves the
教学 of instrument care and underlying knowledge about the playing of the instrument. The
second category contains many teaching elements, such as the development of interest, reading
of music, playing by ear, music appreciation, music language, music composition, making music
together, performing for an audience, expressing emotions, and so on. The third category
requires the teacher to establish a wide range of pedagogical aims in developing children’s non-
music related skills, for example personality, concentration span, and even behaviour within the
social community. Schenck (1989) stressed that any successful or quality instrumental teaching
must have a balanced integration of all three categories throughout an entire teaching period,
spanning a term or a year.

In conclusion, there are many factors involved in producing effective instrumental teaching
which teachers need to be mindful of: establishing and re-establishing their teaching goals;
utilizing and incorporating various teaching methods; improving teaching techniques and materials; building a positive relationship with pupils, school staff members and other instrumental teachers; demonstrating strong interpersonal skills; conducting self-evaluation; facing and overcoming teaching difficulties; and being motivational and inspirational at all times. It is strongly recommended that teachers constantly weave these factors into their regularly based school instrumental teaching in order to enhance its effectiveness and optimize its outcomes (Schenck, 1989; Cheng & Durrant, 2007). As will be seen, the music specialist’s teaching, the centre of this study, is an appropriate example of integrating these factors in reality.

- String program

String instrument teaching has been a popular choice in many schools around the world as part of their music programs for a long time (Hamann & Gillespie, 2012). Waller (1944) explained that the development of a school string band requires less training on the teachers’ part and demands a smaller amount of effort. Moreover, the display of the string band would be easily accepted by the public with a great deal of enthusiasm. Hence, Rolland (1947) pointed out that the key of maintaining the success of the string program is the enjoyment the students get from their learning. He put forth that the quality class teaching of strings requires four prioritized goals, including good music reading ability, standard technique, fine intonation, and sufficient sense of tonality. With these teaching objectives in mind, a series of steps can be considered when delivering a string program successfully and optimizing its outcome (Rolland, 1947). Although an early study, it is worth noting Rolland’s steps as these can be indentified in the teaching of the music specialist in the selected primary school in this study. Since this discussion, many subsequent texts on school instrumental music have made similar points (Allen, Gillespie & Tallejoh, 1995). It should
be noted that his early discussion is not the result of formal research, but it could be argued that the life-time teaching of Rolland could be seen as a form of self-study.

A. Techniques

(1) Ensure the class is constantly occupied by different tasks throughout the entire lesson. This is also a good strategy of reducing the needs for classroom management. (2) At the starting point, unison playing is more recommended than part playing, and is better operated when accompanied by a piano or the teacher’s playing on violin. (3) Provide as much assistance as possible to every individual in the class, and check their progress through solo performances whilst accompanied by others’ pizzicato playing, singing or rhythm tapping. (4) New rhythms are to be introduced through tapping whilst new pieces will be learnt through pizzicato or singing. Always start the new material at a slow speed then pick up the pace cautiously. (5) Review the primary knowledge and skills on a regular basis to improve intonation, position and tone. (6) Constantly add in new concepts and working tasks to avoid the repetition of a routine over a long period of time. (7) Give emphasis to certain points but only one at a time (Rolland, 1947). In addition to this, Howard (1996) claimed that the incorporation of singing techniques – particularly those of the Kodály method – into string teaching has the potential for providing unlimited flexibility and creativity for teachers. Consequently, students’ learning outcomes in musicianship and music knowledge can be enhanced.

B. Class setting

(1) The class needs to be spacious at all times, with provision for spacing between every two students so that the teacher is able to move freely to assistant and evaluate students’ progress. (2) Provide a music stand for each student in order to develop students’ independence. Identify those who rely on copying others’ movements and provide assistance accordingly. (3) Tune the
instruments prior to the commencement of each class whilst explaining the tuning procedure with the class.

C. Motivation

(1) Maintain a positive attitude in the class all the time and provide instant words of encouragement where appropriate. Cheng and Durrant (2007) conclude that good instrumental teachers always have high expectations of students’ progress but never overly criticize students’ mistakes.

(2) Avoid any demand for perfection from young beginners by allowing enough time for them to coordinate. (3) The teacher needs to take a student-centred approach rather than focusing on materials (Rolland, 1947).

As will be seen, this is reflected in the case study that is the focus of this research study.

- Guitar program

The comparatively limited research into investigating the effects of school guitar programs on students has only touched upon a few areas, such as self-esteem and academic achievement (Michel, 1971). Guitar tuition in particular schools has the appearance of becoming a strong source of assistance to school’s overall educational performance (Seifried, 2006). Bartel (1990) acknowledged that well structured guitar lessons can create a positive supplement to the school’s overall music curriculum.

A case study was conducted to investigate the outcome of popular and rock music instructions in a public school’s guitar program. According to interview analyses, guitar classes provided a comfortable haven where students could find an outlet for stress and tension, whilst developing their individual character and personality (Bartel, 1990).

- Recorder program
It appears that the only research located on class recorder instruction in Australia has been historical. According to Ferris (1998), an experimental recorder program implementation conducted at a Victorian primary school in 1947 demonstrated the advantages the recorder had over other instruments in use in the school’s music program, including the fife. One particular advantage was that the recorder was able to be tuned, producing the complete range of chromatic notes, thus enabling “children to master not only the range of the instruments, descant to bass, but also to learn music notation by way of the instrument” (Ferris, 1998, p. 67). By the late 1940s, the recorder program gained recognition as being “the natural successor” of drum and fife bands at Victorian state primary schools (p. 64). As an instrument, the recorder turned out to be an innovative venture, proving suitable for the use of classroom music teaching as either a chamber or solo instrument with a traditional folk grounding (Ferris, 1998). The recorder also accommodated an intellectual repertoire not present in the tradition of other school instruments, namely, drum and fife. Another distinct advantage was that the recorder was comparably easier to master and affordable for children. The 1970s saw the recorder being utilized in Victorian primary school music programs in a similar fashion as the voice and became an effective tool in terms of assisting teachers to deliver music literacy tasks (Ferris, 1998). With the publication of *The Guide to Music in the Primary School* by the Education Department Music Branch in 1981, the recorder was utilised for purposes of integrated curriculum, in conjunction with guitar, voice and percussion instruments. In concordance with British and American practices at the time, the publication advocated the expectation that children were to develop musicianship, including performing and playing, whist “developing musical literacy in the process” for which the recorder was aptly suited (Ferris, 1998, p. 69). This suitability was reinforced by the influence of the Orff approach in the 1970s that had previously recognized the value of using the recorder in
conjunction with the Orff percussions in classroom music teaching. Despite the fact that the
Kodály method was fundamentally a choral and vocal approach, the adaptation of the method in
Australia in the 1980s incorporated the recorder to complement vocal programs “as a tool for
developing musical literacy” (Ferris, 1998, p. 69).
By the late 20th century, recorder tuitions in Victorian primary schools were often accompanied
by CDs, ruling out the necessity for teachers having to demonstrate for their students. As an
innovative teaching tool, the recorder had earned many music teachers’ respect for the use of the
instrument in school music education as it had proved successful in facilitating music literacy
teaching at a greater level than the traditional vocal approaches in use. However, teaching
recorder had often appeared to be difficult in class due to the fact that quality recorder playing
required great breath control as well as excellent motor co-ordination. The instrument was
designed for part playing and, therefore, playing recorders in unison in classroom music teaching
would have created a great deal of difficulty for teachers in terms of providing “semblance of
accuracy in tuning” (Ferris, 1998, p. 70). Thus, the implementation of the recorder program in
Victorian primary schools had “not been the universal panacea it was initially hoped to be” (p.
70).

5. Pull-out program

‘Pull-out’ is the term given to the practice in many schools in which students leave general
classes to attend individual music instrumental lessons. This practice is frequently questioned by
general classroom teachers who believe that students’ academic progress will be compromised.
The pull-out syndrome usually involves negative opinions, criticisms or complaints about
students being withdrawn from their regular classes for the purpose of instrumental
studies/instructions at non-music schools (Hash, 2004; Music Education Online, 2012). Pull-out
classes can occur within a set timeframe or in rotations. Such an issue has been targeted for a
long time by not only the general classroom teachers, but also by parents as well as school
administrative staff members. It is assumed that the pull-out syndrome would have negative
effects upon students’ school performance, particularly in academic achievement. On one hand,
music instrumental teachers have put in a great deal of effort in opposing the assumptions,
claiming that the pull-out program does not cause any deficits in students’ academic performance.
On the other hand, more and more researchers in the field of education have directed their
research focus on testing the effects of participating in instrumental activities during regular class
times on students’ academic performance (Hash, 2004).

According to Music Education Online (2012), “some claims have been made that there is a
cause-effect relationship between students’ higher achievement in the ‘basics’ and participation
in the instrumental music” (p. 1). A study was conducted to test these claims and the results
found that the introductory instrumental program does not cause any harm to students’ academic
development, even when students are withdrawn from classes teaching basics. In terms of
establishing a cause-effect relationship, the results of the study were inconclusive. However, it
was statistically established that students who were involved in instrumental programs showed
“as good or better academic growth (development) in Reading and Math”, in comparison to the
district’s student population in general (Music Education Online, 2012, p. 3).

Wallick (1998) conducted a study to test the difference on the achievement in mathematics,
reading, writing and citizenship between fourth graders who were withdrawn from regular
classes for a school string program and their peers who remained in the class at all times. The
results showed that the pull-out students outperformed their class peers in reading and citizenship
whilst no significant difference was found between the two groups’ achievements in mathematics
and writing.

In his study, Kvet (1985) intended to seek the difference of academic performance between
students who were regularly pulled out for the participation in instrumental programs and
students not involved in instrumental activities who remained in class. The research participants
were Grade 6 students from four public schools and the subjects being tested were mathematics,
language and reading. The results did not indicate any significant effects caused by the pull-out
syndrome on students’ performances in these three subjects.

Another study conducted recently examined the consequences of Grade 8 students being pulled
out from regular classes for school band activities in terms of their academic performances. Hash
(2004) reported that the results of the study supported that students pulled out from classes were
not negatively affected in terms of overall academic performance. Data was also able to indicate
that band students performed significantly better at test scores than those who had quit band before Grade 8 enrollment as well as non-band students. Overall, band students’ academic performance was comparable to the highest achieving non-band students with little variation.

In conclusion, previous studies have provided supportive yet limited grounds for research on the topic of pull-out syndrome, concentrating mainly on the links between pull-out programs and students’ academic achievements. Further investigations should extend the research scope so as to include the effects of pull-out on other disciplines (Hash, 2004; Wallick, 1998). The pull-out program is also implemented in the school observed in this study, and the effects on students’ school performance will be evaluated by a number of interviewees’ opinions presented in future chapters.

6. Public performance

Research into topics involving music performance has attracted increasingly more attention from researchers in the areas of music, education and psychology (Gabrielsson, 2003). Public performance and informance as two forms of music presentation have been practised extensively in current school music programs. Informance will be discussed in the following content. It is beyond the scope of this inquiry to present a detailed review of current research into performance tension and anxiety. However, a brief discussion is included.

Public performance involves an individual or a group of people presenting their skills in front of an audience for the purpose of entertainment and/or evaluation. As a part of school music
programs, public performance is involved in many areas, especially in classroom teaching, instrumental instructions, choral activities, and so on. Students’ participation in public performance in association with school music programs can help them gain experience in both musical and psychological domains. Ross (2011) acknowledges that performing music in public is an ideal means to prepare children for their public performances in other disciplines in their lives, such as public speech and presentations on difficult tasks.

Apart from musical activities, public performance is also involved in almost everyone’s life at different stages in various forms. The participation in performing music in public on a regular basis, especially in one’s early years, helps children develop skills and psychological readiness required for future public performances. These skills may include physical presentation, musical expression, self-confidence, ability to work with others, detailed planning and organizational skills, acceptance of compliments and criticisms, ability of working under pressure, and overcoming stress and anxiety (Ross, 2011).

Boucher and Ryan (2011) report that performance anxiety can be detected in young children’s music performance in public, the causes of which can be both intrinsic and extrinsic. The results of their study also revealed that children who had previous experience in public performance suffer less in their performance anxiety as compared to those who are new to such activity. Performance environments are variable, and the more children are able to familiarize themselves with this variability, the less they experience performance anxiety. Moreover, the frequency of participating in public performance also has the effect of alleviating children’s performance anxiety. Finally, the performing environment and frequency of performance seem to directly affect students’ learning outcomes, yet another factor which may decrease young children’s

An alternative way of presenting students’ outcomes in instrumental learning through their school’s music program is *informance*. Informance is defined as a form of music performance in which the audience’s participation plays an integral part. During an informance, an engaging environment is created between students and adults who were involved in the program from the outset (Doyle, Hotchkiss, Noel, Huss & Holmes, 2004). Nowmos (2010) explains that informance is both an informal yet informative way of conducting presentations, demonstrating students’ music learning outcomes at school. This particular form of presentation provides a focal point for students’ learning progress, and frees classroom music teaching from activities that are not performance driven. Kerchner (2010) puts forward that informance is often used in music ensembles for the purpose of “illustrating less visible student rehearsal experiences that serve as cornerstones for the ever-visible musical performances” (p. 15). Though informance is best used in music ensembles, there is a possibility of applying this form of presentational format in classroom music teaching. It may also help students develop their listening skills through performance and a means of systematically listening and understanding music (Kerchner, 2010, p. 15). There are various types of informance and one of them is presented as *school community informance*. Doyle et al. (2004) asserted that this type of informance allows a great deal of interaction between students and the school community during musical events, from which, not only students gain an opportunity to practise their performing skills and presenting their music learning outcomes, but also the school community benefits by engaging with the musical event. Nowmos (2010) asserts that unlike a traditional concert, an informance can provide a medium by
which parents are able to better understand music teachers’ educational goals, students’ learning processes and their children’s progress. It is suggested that informance as compared to traditional concert is a more suitable form for presenting music learning outcomes at schools, particularly in the early years of schooling (Nowmos, 2010). Public performance in conjunction with informance plays an important role in the music program at the selected school for the purpose of this study, the details of which will be presented in future chapters.

The chapter has provided a review of literature in relation to advocacy of school music education, efficacy in school music teaching, school instrumental instruction, choral programs in schools, pull-out program, and public performance. All these practices will be discussed further in future chapters as they are vital to the music program in the selected primary school. The next chapter will present the review of literature regarding two specific music teaching approaches – the Kodály method and the Orff approach – as they are both considered the most effective in classroom music teaching and are used extensively in the selected primary school’s music program.
Chapter Three

Literature Review Part (2)

The Kodály method and the Orff approach

In this chapter, a review of literature regarding the Kodály method and the Orff approach will be presented. The underlying rationale of focusing on these two particular music teaching approaches lies upon the fact that both methods have had a strong influence on music teaching, particularly at primary levels, both globally and in the school selected for this study. The NRSME (DEST, 2005) stated that along with several other methods, the approaches advocated by Kodály and Orff were not only influential on classroom practice but also had “an enduring impact on both the content and delivery of music education in the primary and lower secondary classrooms” (p. 15). An even more significant reason for investigating these two particular approaches is that the music specialist’s teaching at the selected school has a strong foundation of utilising both approaches, individually and in combination, in accordance with different teaching objectives and students’ age level.

1. Zoltán Kodály and his music education philosophy

Although the efficacy of the class music instruction method advocated by Zoltán Kodály is widely recognized, Caylor (1979) recommended the need for more research concerning its use in music education. In agreement with this, Houlanhan and Tacka (2005) stated that only “limited research exists on the role of the instructor in teaching music literacy to students” (p. 10). Blackford and Stainthorp (2007) presented an overview of international research into the efficacy of the Kodály approach which they found to be overwhelmingly positive:
Studies conducted in Hungary … the USA … and the UK… have all made various claims for the positive effects of a Kodály-based training programme both on the acquisition of musical skills as well as on other areas of cognitive processing and learning (p. 30).

Various benefits of the Kodály method including transfer effects, spatial skills, the ability of learning to read and reading ability, mathematical achievement, brain development, creativity, emotional sensitivity, and personality development will be considered in detail in the following.

- Pedagogical theories and principles

From the 1920s, Kodály’s colleagues and students started developing the well known “Kodály method”. Although Kodály was not the inventor, the whole method was developed under his systematically applied educational principles and guidance (Alsop, 2007; Zoltán Kodály (1882-1967), 2009).

a) Stimulus

The foundation of the Kodály method stemmed from Kodály’s being appalled at the low levels of the music literacy of the students entering the highest music academy in Hungary in the early 20th century (Choksy, 2000). Kodály realized that the system of music education during that period was “rootless and ineffective”, and was not grounded in local tradition but derived from the influences of the Austro-Hungarian Empire, under which Hungary was previously controlled. It was believed that the only ‘good music’ enjoyed by the elite was German and Viennese music (Kokas, 1969, p. 125; Choksy, 2000). Ironically, the only Hungarian folk music that music academy students were exposed to was the indistinct and weakened versions played by gypsies in cafés. Kodály’s major concern was the ever-growing distance between artists and the public.
He believed that Hungarian composers at that period did not have any connection with “their own people’s music” (Kokas, 1969, p. 125). To bridge this gap, Kodály instituted a program whereby pupils would develop an understanding of and passion for past, present and future classics which had a greater affinity with folk song than was generally accepted (D’Ombrain, 1968). It was Kodály’s dream to return the Hungarian musical heritage to its people and make all Hungarians musically literate, so that everybody, from all walks of life, could develop a recognizable appreciation of music (Choksy, 2000).

b) Folk music

Kodály turned toward Hungarian folk music, which he collected, analyzed and compiled in extensive volumes of Hungarian folk songs. Kodály believed that folk music played the same role in music learning as our mother tongue in language learning; therefore, one should learn the folk music of one’s own country before learning other music. Other characteristics of folk music for example, simple short forms, basic pentatonic scale, simplicity of the language and being able to represent a living art – had convinced Kodály that only the most authentic folk music was suitable for educating children (Choksy, 2000; Landis & Carder, 1972). Roulston (2003) stated that “rather than treat children’s singing games as inconsequential and immature forms of music, Kodály argued that even in their simplicity, there was much to be learned about the history of music … teaching of authentic Hungarian folk songs to children” was essential (p. 27).

Kodály hoped to revolutionize music education in Hungary. D’Ombrain (1968) quoting Kodály encapsulated his vision and passion for a reformation in music teaching in the following:

   Our musical education has meant seventy years of erratic wandering, and that is why it has produced no results. They wanted to teach the people music by ignoring, by throwing
a side, what the people know of their own accord. Yet, it is only possible to build on what exists, using the folk heritage as a foundation, otherwise we build on air (p. 486).

c) Music education for children, and teacher training

Kodály became involved in educating young children soon after he realized that making the whole nation musically literate should include everyone around him, and not just the educated upper-class (Choksy, 2000). Russell-Smith (1976) stated that Kodály was convinced that “any real appreciation for and skill in the arts must stem from the nursery; it was far too late to begin music training of any substance once a child was approaching adolescence” (p. 83). Kodály believed that everybody has the ability to learn music just as they are equally able to learn languages and the best instrument that one should start on is his/her own voice and the commencement age should be as young as possible. (Alsop, 2007; Zoltán Kodály (1882-1967), 2009). Quoting Kodály, Kokas (1969) asserted that “music education can only be successful if started early. Music education has the greatest effect from the age of 3 - 7 years during the most important period of the child’s intellectual and spiritual development” (p. 125). Thus music should be included during the earliest years in schooling. In 1925 Kodály became convinced that it was time to provide better music for young people so that they would no longer be distanced from their valuable music heritage (Houlahan & Tacka, 1998). Kodály had overheard some young ladies singing loudly and with great pleasure. The songs they sang were neither country-styled folk songs nor the modernized fine art songs but were the “Hungarian equivalents of Daisy, Daisy, Nellie Dean and I Do Like to be beside the Seaside” (Russell-Smith, 1976, p. 82). Kodály was not only disappointed by their choice in music and the way they performed, but was also appalled by the fact that these young ladies were students who would one day become teachers themselves (Russell-Smith, 1976). To begin with his mission, Kodály focused on
implementing his teacher-training principles. He believed that only qualified music teachers could deliver efficient teaching methods and outcomes. Kodály was largely responsible for increasing the length of the compulsory music programs in teacher-training in Hungary (Choksy, 2000). At the same time, Kodály declared that better music should be introduced to young people, including music teachers, in order to prevent future generations’ music education from being jeopardized (Russell-Smith, 1976).

d) Human voice and song material

Kodály, according to D’Ombrain (1968), emphasized that “percussion instruments and pentatonically tuned and barred instruments” should be integral to the beginner’s program. However, the human voice was the basic instrument for music education and music appreciation (p. 34). Kodály advocated that in general music education, the only instrument being used should be the singing voice (Kokas, 1969). In the words of Blackford and Stainthorp (2007), “Kodály stressed the importance of developing musicianship skills through the voice (and thereby developing the internal understanding of music) prior to learning an instrument” (p. 36). In terms of choosing suitable song material for effective music education, Kodály believed that song material of inferior quality had to be abandoned in favour of specific folk song material. He also stressed that the only music that should be used in teaching was the music which was highly artistically valued. (D’Ombrain, 1968). Choksy (2000) noted that in children’s music education, Kodály stressed the use of folk songs and necessity to compose fine and suitable music for children in order to bridge “folk music and art music” (p. 2).

e) Inner hearing, part-singing and sight-singing
One of Kodály’s primary principles is that children’s musical hearing ability could be developed to a high level if classroom music training was introduced at an early age. The Kodály method “sharpens, attunes and stabilizes the listening process to a point of culmination in musical terms where the individual is able to see what he hears and to hear what he sees” (Hoermann & Herbert, 1979, p. 18). Blackford and Stainthorp (2007) argued that “The development of so-called ‘inner hearing’ is emphasized through musicianship and methodology in Kodály courses” (p. 36). Russell-Smith (1976) confirmed this, stating that the Kodály method, itself was responsible for developing music learning through aural imagination, or inner hearing (p. 83).

To be able to establish and develop a child’s aural imagination, singing, or more accurately, partsinging, should be introduced to the child prior to any instrumental learning (Russell-Smith, 1976). According to Rainbow and Cox (2006), Kodály believed that only unison singing cannot help a child sing in tune. The proper way to learn singing in unison is to sing in two parts as “two voices correct and balance each other” (Kodály, n. d. quoted in Rainbow & Cox, 2006). Add to this point, Russell-Smith (1976) stated that “to sing one note in tune is to relate it to another” and part-singing, particularly, two-part-singing, should be introduced to children at the very beginning of their music learning life (p. 85). Kodály believed that part-singing enables a child to hear how a series of sounds sound together when they are related. Therefore, most of the pieces and exercises that he wrote for school use were in two-part or three-part singing forms (Rainbow & Cox, 2006).

Rainbow and Cox (2006) further stated that, part-singing in Kodály’s principles required strong ability in sight-singing without any assistance of instruments. Therefore, sight-singing became the essential element of vocal training experience. Kodály claimed that “Children must learn to read music when they learn to read” (quoted in Russell-Smith, 1976, p. 84). Russell-Smith (1976)
argued that sight-singing was a practical and ideal music learning approach and nobody could
develop a high-standard appreciation in music literature without being able to read and write
music. Ironically, the passive “appreciation lesson” had been regarded for a considerably long
period by many music educators as an adequate means to stimulate children’s musical awareness
(p. 84). It could be argued that this phenomenon still prevails in today’s school music education.
Bertram (2007) asserted that “CD players do most of the singing” as many kindergarten music
teachers had non-musical backgrounds and attempted to teach a subject of which they only had
limited training experience (p. 44).

Actually, the rationale for Kodály advocating the importance of sight-singing was based upon his
disappointment with many qualified musicians’ poor music reading ability as they “could not
read a tune without an instrument to help them” (Kodály, n. d. quoted in Rainbow & Cox, 2006).
He realized that to prevent poor sight-singing, children must be taught music properly. Kodály
discovered the strategy during his trip to England in 1927. Kodály went to England that year to
conduct his Psalmus Hungaricus, the first British performance of this piece. On his arrival, the
rehearsals, conducted by Cyril Rootham (the organist of St John’s College), impressed Kodály.
The excellence of the rehearsals, especially the chorus, created an unbearable contrast towards its
Hungarian counterpart. Such disparity immediately raised Kodály’s awareness of the well-
established English “choral tradition” in conjunction with its corresponding sight-singing
teaching history in the schools (Rainbow & Cox, 2006, p. 309). Most importantly, these two
aspects were largely implemented through Curwen’s Tonic Sol-fa method. Kodály adopted this
systematic sight-singing method as the “basis of a system designed to meet the special needs of
Hungarian schools” (p. 309).

- Adoption and adaptation of other methods
The Kodály method was based upon the influences of several co-existing approaches. John Curwen’s Tonic Sol-fa and hand signs developed from 1840s onwards in England, which already included the French rhythmic syllables invented by Chevé, Galin and Paris, were the major elements which supported the pedagogy (Russell-Smith, 1976; Rainbow, 1990). The combination of these earlier approaches became a feature of the Kodály method (Alsop, 2007). The sources of these borrowed approaches, however, have become a matter of contention. According to Rainbow (1990), the original intention of implementing the Kodály method was to teach music at schools in Hungary only, but, as was common with many other celebrated teaching methods, eclecticism became the basis of the Kodály method. Many of the sources of the Kodály method’s eclecticism were described by Erszébet Szönyi in 1966, where she attributed many of the influences of the Kodály method to numerous teachers from various parts of Europe. Many of these alleged borrowed approaches, however, had been brought into question by Rainbow (1990) who argues that Szönyi’s attribution of particular devices in the Kodály method to Curwen, Weber, Chevé, Jöde and Hundoegger, d’ Arezzo, and Jöde need to be examined closely. Szönyi’s misinterpretation (and in some cases mistranslation) of much of the developments associated with the Kodály method, particularly involving terms and techniques borrowed from other music educators and their alleged sources, had proven not only misleading but also incorrect (Rainbow, 1990).

- **International recognition**

Today, the Kodály method is becoming recognized universally. Houlahan and Tacka (1998) asserted that
Over the last several decades, interest in Kodály’s compositions and his philosophy of music education, particularly in the United States, has been growing as witnessed by the increasing number of conferences, seminars, workshops, and an expanding body of literature devoted to the composer” (Preface).

Gaál (1999), an instrumental teacher asserted that the combination of appropriate teaching material and proper teaching method can stimulate students’ music learning as it provides an enjoyable learning experience. These two elements are very well balanced in the Kodály method and applicable to music beginners, as well as professional musicians. Kodály adopted a developmental approach to the education of children playing authentic local folk songs on instruments, understanding the folk songs, and singing them.

Gaál (1999) added that another advantage that the Kodály method offered was that it provided “a multi-sensory approach to learning which uses aural, visual and kinesthetic approaches” (p. 2). This aspect enabled students to learn music using a range of activities, creating high levels of interest and enthusiasm. It also ensured that students had a thorough understanding of all musical elements before playing the piece on their instrument. Kodály’s principle of focusing on teaching musical elements to beginners rather than teaching them techniques effectively reduced the pressure of mind-numbing technical practices.

- **Challenges of the adaptation in Australia**

However, it is considered essential for any country where the Kodály teaching approach has been adopted, to collect, study, analyze and categorize the local folk music in order to adapt and implement the method successfully. Kodály pointed out that “countries, who wanted to adapt the
successful Hungarian music education method in their own countries, should do so by using their own folk tradition and children’s original songs” (Blackford & Staintorp, 2007, p. 30). Ban (1976) argued that changes of repertoire, as well as the theoretical content, and sequence of the curriculum, were anticipated in order to adapt the method successfully in Australia. The pentatonic scale was not necessarily the basis for the entire repertoire “as the nature of Australian folk music and the folk music of ethnic groups within Australia are more firmly based on diatonic scales” (p. 124). Hoermann and Herbert (1979) claimed that the Australian adaption of the Kodály method was required to be modified according to the needs of Australian children who have multicultural backgrounds and various accesses to media. Consequently, a few issues raised have demanded serious consideration. First of all, how does one interpret the definition of ‘folk music’ in Australia, a multicultural country? Secondly, how can the Kodály’s sol-fa method be appropriately employed in Australian folk music? Thirdly, what kind of influence do the media have on children who live in a very technological society? All of these are questions worthy of consideration.

In response to the first issue, Bridges (1996) claimed that most of the traditional songs in Australia, including bush tunes, originated in Britain and were not composed to serve the purpose of children’s music education, nor did the lyrics of these songs have much connection with people’s present lives. Furthermore, a number of well known nursery rhymes were written by American musicians rather than Australian composers. Bridges (1996) also maintained that the majority of school students in Australia came from a multicultural background, and hence, English was not necessarily their “mother tongue”. Therefore, music educators needed to resolve this issue by “teaching songs from non-English speaking cultures in their original language, [and] making up different words and activities for known tunes or inventing new songs” (p. 9).
Capitanio (2003) added to this point that it was almost impossible to research Australian folk music without borrowing from other cultures, mainly British and Irish, due to historical reasons. However, it is strongly against Kodály’s principle in that authentic folk music must contain both language and music from one culture. Choksy (1981) found that any particular language provides its own rhythmical stresses, for example, the English language is spoken in simple duple meter, and begins on an anacrusis. Despite originally being a British colony, post-war Australia has developed a multicultural demographic which has put music educators in a challenging situation in terms of providing authentic Australian folk music for Australian children.

Despite the challenges posed by multiculturalism, the Kodály method in Australia has become increasingly recognized and successfully implemented. Hoermann and Herbert (1979) maintained that the Kodály “program has provided educators around the world with an example of a long-term commitment to a structured program” (p. 27). It is further confirmed that the Australian implementation of the Kodály program “has all the components for training the young child to listen, to concentrate, to discriminate sounds, to recognize sequences and remember them” (p. 18).

- **Sequential approach**

There is not any settled format in the Kodály method although there is a well-established sequence of developmentally understood music concepts; however, a regular teaching procedure is always to be followed: singing—performing—listening to—analyzing—reading and writing—composing (Alsop, 2007; Zoltán Kodály Online, 2009). As will be seen, this is reflected in the case study that is the focus of this research study.
There is little locatable criticism of the Kodály approach. Palotai (1978) asserted that “critical
teractions to the method in Kodály’s native Hungary should prove interesting and informative”,
although few have eventuated (p. 40). Palotai (1978) reported on a radio panel discussion held in
Hungary in November 1972 that this discussion was regarded as the most comprehensive and
critical review of the Kodály method to date. At the end of the discussion, most of the panel
members either defended the efficacy of the Kodály method or had low opinion about it.
Accusations ranged from incompetence to criticisms of unscrupulous promoters and unmotivated
teachers. Even whole-hearted advocates of the method conceded that their expectations were
unrealistically high (Palotai, 1978).

- **General effects of the Kodály method**

As Blackford and Stainthorp (2007) argued, much research into the Kodály approach reported
clear benefits in many areas. According to Russell-Smith (1976), the intensive Kodály training
program could “stimulate an over-all awareness that more than compensated for the time lost
from non-musical pursuits” (p. 87). He further asserted that by the time students turned fourteen,
those who did undertake the intensive Kodály program demonstrated an average of two and a
half and even three and a half years advantage in many school subjects when compared with
peers. Russell-Smith (1976) reported that students were compared in a range of subjects that
included communication skills, numeracy, spatial ability, linguistics, history and geography.
Further positive effects were also seen in psycho-emotional maturity and social interaction skills.

In support of this phenomenon, Kokas (1969) observed that children of kindergarten age were
able to recognize the difference between “high and low, quick and slow, loud and soft” under the
Kodály based Hungarian music education system. Kokas (1969) drew upon numerous Hungarian
studies between 1962 - 1966, which had shown how school children who receive Kodály based music instruction were able to demonstrate significant improvements in “rhythm, sound observation, gymnastics and arithmetic abilities” (p. 127). He also mentioned that the Kodály students also demonstrated greater capacity in chest expansion in physical tests conducted by anthropologists (Kokas, 1969).

Music teachers in Hungary often found that children who undertook Kodály music instruction on a daily basis were higher achievers in reading and arithmetic, and had better study habits than peers who did not receive such instruction (Kokas, 1969; Hurwitz, Wolff, Bortnick & Kokas, 1975). Investigative studies in Hungary, according to Hurwitz et al. (1975), showed predictable effects of the Kodály method on areas including movement, visual observation, language learning, and spelling. It was further stated that the Kodály-based Hungarian music instruction demonstrated a positive impact upon normal children’s performances within an extensive psychological range, “including the stability and accuracy of sensorimotor rhythmic behavior, the sequencing of verbal symbols, the solution of problems of perceptual restructuring, and spatial abilities” (p. 172). A number of studies were focused on particular areas of learning and child development.

Hungarian studies undertaken in 1967 and 1973, as cited by Gaál (1999), support the belief that employing the Kodály method in music teaching at primary level has significant positive general benefits. These findings are not surprisingly given that there was select entry to the chosen primary schools. The observation that learning music by the Kodály approach affected the detail and accuracy of children’s school work was asserted enthusiastically. Similarly, Hoermann and Herbert (1979) sought improvements in school performance as the clearest indication of the potential effect of the Kodály approach and stated that, “Classroom performance is the main
source of evidence for the assessment of musical outcomes” (p. 13). Gaál (1999) citing Barkoczi
and Pleh (1982) quoted that “One of the most basic among these [procedures] is the flexible
application and interchange of the stricter, reasoning type strategies and the more playful,
divergent strategies of problem solving strategies even within one tasks” (p. 1). As a result, it is
an explicit attempt to bring together commonalities and differences in cognition and creativity in
music education. Such research resonates with the arguments advanced for school music in this
single case study.

- **The Kodály method and transfer effect – IQ enhancement**

Schellenberg (2004) considers the argument about whether learning music – in particular,
learning music under Kodály-based instruction – can possibly enhance children’s Intelligent
Quotient (IQ). The researcher randomly sampled 144 students aged over 6, who were divided
into four groups. Two experimental groups received either keyboard lessons or Kodály based
vocal instructions. The first control group received drama lessons while the second did not
receive any lessons at all. Schellenberg (2004) found an overall increase in IQ over all four
conditions. There were reliably greater increments in full-scale IQ in the experimental groups (i.e.
keyboard group and Kodály-based vocal group). This increase, however, was relatively small but
it did establish a distinct positive trend. There were certain limitations associated with this type
of study. Firstly, the experimenters used subjects split into four groups, resulting in 36 students
per group, representing a rather small sample size in each group. Secondly, according to transfer
effects as found in Schellenberg (2004), there is a greater transfer of skills from one domain to
another where there is a greater similarity in domains. It was further stated that, “music lessons
involve a multiplicity of experiences that could generate improvement in a wide range of
abilities” (p. 513). Therefore, any improvement in IQ occurring in the music groups may have
been attributable to near transfer IQ testing. This conclusion actually contradicts early Kodály enthusiasts’ statements concerning the efficacy of the approach, for example, Gaál’s report in his article in 1999 which will be presented in more detail later in this paper.

Pye (2008) acknowledged that many papers, books and research articles in the field of music education have “identified music learning as having a follow on, or transfer effect to other aspects of learning” (p. 43). Recent research into music and intelligence has relied on the work of Howard Gardner who proposed a theory of multiple-intelligence that takes the view that intelligence is not uni-dimensional but multi-dimensional in that there are many ways of thinking. Gardner asserted that there are several domains of intelligence including audio-visual, logico-mathematical, spatial, linguistic, kinesthetic, interpersonal, intrapersonal and musical and that these intelligences are inter-connected, and therefore, do not function independently. Gardner also argued that each particular intelligence is multi-faceted, a characteristic which further augments the complex nature of intelligence (Gardner, 1985; Cuskelly, 2007; Lane, 2009).

- **The Kodály method and spatial skills**

Researchers investigating the effects of music training on children’s spatial abilities (Hanson, 2003), have chosen Kodály-based music instruction as the independent variable in some studies. Hurwitz et al.’s (1975) American study, operated under their primary hypothesis that music training under the Kodály principles would “have an influence on the sequencing behavior and on tasks of spatial functioning as well” (p. 168). The research findings revealed that the experimental group where students were given intensive Kodály instruction “performed more effectively on both temporal and spatial tasks” than the control group (p. 48).
Hanson (2003) conducted a study over a period of 31 weeks with Kindergarten students (N=54) aged between five and six. Two experimental groups and one control group were used in the study’s design. Experimental group one received sequenced Kodály literacy-based music instruction, group two was exposed to beginner computer programs, and neither music nor computer instructions were given to the control group. The students receiving the Kodály literacy-based instruction demonstrated considerable improvements in music skills. Further results, however, revealed no major difference for the evaluation of spatial-temporal abilities amongst the three groups (Hanson, 2003).

- **The Kodály method and the ability of learning to read and reading ability**

Testing of reading skills has been mentioned frequently in research articles regarding the effectiveness of the Kodály method. Hurwitz et al. (1974) tested for the difference in reading readiness between the Kodály music group and a non-Kodály group. At the end of the first grade year, the Kodály group “performed more effectively … than comparable groups of first graders not receiving this music instruction” (p. 167). A similar study was conducted in Australia by Herbert (1973) that sought to identify differences in the developmental levels of reading ability between the children who received the Kodály program and others who did not. All First Year students from one of ten pilot primary schools were chosen to be the subjects of a survey. Students had learned music under the Kodály program over varying lengths of time with the longest timeframe spanning five school terms in 1972. All students were required to complete tasks over five test items, including a test of body concept by drawing a man; a test of perceptual forms by copying “geometrical shapes in sequence” and memorizing “partly structured figures in sequence”; “an auditory receptive test” through “a motor response to recall rhythmic sound patterns”; a test of digit span through “verbal response” towards the memory of “a series of
digits”; and a vocabulary test of the definitions of 11 words (p. 10). Hoermann and Herbert (1979) further quoting Herbert (1974), stated that, “the hypothesis for this survey is that the Kodály program, with its emphasis on auditory and visual patterning, and on the integration of visual, auditory, kinaesthetic, and motor modalities for learning, could effect a measurable improvement in functioning on some or all of these test items” (p. 10). The findings of this study established a significant difference of the performances in all tests except for the vocabulary test (Hoermann & Herbert, 1979).

Hoermann and Herbert (1979) drew attention to another survey conducted in 1974, where the literature reading ability of 280 Year 2 students from four primary schools was assessed. The students from one school where the Kodály program was offered were compared with the rest of the survey subjects who were high standard readers and who did not receive any Kodály music instructions. All students received two tests of reading, (Schonnel R3 and GAP). The outcomes of the study revealed that “the Kodály class had the lowest incidence of poor readers” (p. 11).

- **The Kodály method and brain development**

Gaál (1999) argued that learning music at an early age improves children’s development in many areas, including learning ability, memorizing ability and logical thinking. To evaluate his contention, he used a longitudinal research project, the results of which, to date, have not yet been reported.

Recently, Pye (2008) compiled a review of literature on the correlation between music learning and memory, whereby, it was mentioned that music training assists the development of left hemisphere skills. Such skills are further connected with the understanding of phonics and the development of short-term-memory when images are not provided. Blythe (2005) further states
that singing, which is the foundation of the Kodály method, is regarded as “an effective vehicle as it is often done from memory and practised by repetition” (p. 44). Pye (2008) also believes that song learning attained through games and repetition, as advocated in the Kodály method, improves children’s memorization ability.

Pye (2008) also reports upon the findings of research regarding the effects that music training has on memory capacity, including verbal memory, and long term memory. Ho, Cheung, and Chan (2003) stated that a significant difference in verbal memory between music training participants and non-musical trained participants was demonstrated. The findings further stated that the longer people receive music training the better their verbal memory becomes.

- **The Kodály method and creativity, emotional sensitivity and personality**

Gaál (1999) reported that a study conducted in Hungary between 1967 and 1973 revealed that extra Kodály music training also had positive effects on children’s creativity combined with emotional sensitivity, as well as the internal control of their personality. The findings also demonstrated that the Kodály method enhanced the student’s creativity to a higher level than what the measures of intelligence predicted. A greater correlation between creativity and intelligence was also shown.

Another 4-year-planned study was conducted by Kokas and research colleagues in Hungary in 1966. Their hypothesis was that the effects that the Kodály method of music instruction had on children’s personalities would be indicated by the improvements of children’s broadened interest and social skills, which further led to the development of children’s observational abilities and body movements. The research found that music study was advantageous in general and that “music groups have a better coordination” (Kokas, 1969, p. 133). It should be noted that early
studies into the effects of Kodály music education, particularly those undertaken by Hungarians, could be seen to carry bias.

- **The Kodály method and music intelligence development**

  Broadly speaking, three core areas of music intelligence are recognized and are highly valued: listening, performing and composing. Each of these core areas requires “specific skills and deep knowledge” and in turn does not operate independently (Cuskelly, 2007, p. 20). Musicians have drawn upon the skills and experience in each specialization to assist them working across other areas (Cuskelly, 2007).

  Apart from evaluating the impact of the Kodály music program upon educational outcomes, other studies set out to determine the program’s effects upon musical outcomes: “Classroom performance is the main source of evidence for the assessment of musical outcomes” (Hoermann & Herbert, 1979, p. 13).

  Hoermann and Herbert (1979) made reference to a study conducted by Wilkins in 1976 that revealed an advanced standard of children’s musical performance. Unfortunately, this study cannot be located but Hoermann and Herbert (1979) described it in some detail. The findings of the study revealed that the students from the Kodály group scored remarkably higher in most of the music-skill tests in the study than students who learned under non-Kodály music instructions. In most of the music literacy tests of the study, students from the secondary schools achieved higher scores than the Kodály students. However, the latter achieved surprisingly high scores in the tests of rhythmic memory, the Wilkins test of improvisation, and sight singing to match the secondary students’ achievements (Hoermann & Herbert, 1979).
A study by Beatty (1989) longitudinally investigated a comparison between Kodály-based music instruction and traditional public school music instruction and revealed a significant increase in skills in discernment of pitch and rhythm for both groups, with no significant differences for measures of tone or rhythm. The Kodály class, however, showed distinctive improvements in pitch-matching and echo-clapping than the traditional class.

2. **Carl Orff and the Orff approach**

The Orff approach is an internationally recognized music pedagogy initiated and promoted by Carl Orff, a German conductor and educator who is considered one of the best known composers in the 20th century. Orff believed that “the natural evolution is speech, rhythm and movement which are applied to melody through the use of voice and percussion instruments” (Holmes, 1966, n. p.). Based upon this belief and his personal educational philosophy, the Orff approach was devised, and has been considered essential in the field of music teaching for children because “it is natural, unsophisticated and within everyone’s capacity to learn and experience” (Webster, 1993, p. 24). It has had a significant impact on music education worldwide, via teacher-training courses, publications and its translations in various languages, classroom practices and even national curriculum in some countries (Taylor, 2000).

- **The Orff approach (Orff Schulwerk) and its philosophy**
  a) Inception of the approach

Orff’s ideas about teaching music to children germinated from his personal belief that any child is responsive to well presented music and has the capability of learning, transforming, reasoning and expressing creatively (Webster, 1993; Goodkin, 2001). The thought of integrating music, movement and dance began as an inspiration and an experiment at the commencement of Orff’s
teaching career together with Dorothee Gunther in 1924, and has now been regarded as the core aspect of the Orff approach. Whilst he was seeking an innovative music teaching approach, it dawned on him that music education should be associated with movement learning at all times (Webster, 1993). His curiosity about the application of his ideas concerning music education for children dated back to 1932, but it was not until sixteen years later that he commenced the *Orff-Schulwerk* (Orff-Schoolwork) which was eventually translated into English under the title *Music for Children* (Victorian Orff Schulwerk Association-VOSA, 2010, p. 1; Goodkin, 2001). This five-volume publication is of paramount importance. These volumes were co-prepared with his colleague Gunild Keetman and were meant to be examples of Orff’s fundamental style rather than a textbook (Webster, 1993, p. 11). Keetman began implementing Orff’s ideas involving teaching children music in groups, so much so, that by 1963 his *Schulwerk* approach gained recognition worldwide. It was Keetman who captured and developed Orff’s ideas and formed a comprehensive music teaching approach which is known today as the Orff approach. Essentially, then, the Orff approach, also known as *Orff-Schulwerk*, was created by Orff in association with others who worked with him and played vital roles in the whole process (Goodkin, 2001; Webster, 1993; Frazee, 1987). Orff always acknowledged the vital assistance rendered by his colleagues Gunther and Keetman, without which the *Orff Schulwerk* would never had been produced (Webster, 1993).

b) Philosophy and key elements

Orff believed that music education for young children should start as early as possible and that such education should not be delivered through mere singing or instrument playing but through the involvement of the whole body (Frank, 1964). In addition, the role that children play in music learning should be as “active participants in the music making process … rather than
observers‖ (Webster, 1993, p. 24). Children’s music learning should be play-oriented, as play is unstructured yet rhythmic to children. Teaching children music via play, using rhythmic and melodic drives, helps children cultivate the grounding necessary for their musical development (Webster, 1993). The Orff pedagogical approach enables children to learn music through both mental and physical engagement within which the experiences of dancing, singing, acting, and chanting are constantly integrated (Davies-Splitter & Splitter, 2006; Maubach, 2006). It also offers techniques which encourage students to sense music through music learning which is characterized by a broad spectrum of sensory perception (Pritikin, 2010). Webster (1993) asserted that the aim of Orff’s philosophical approach is to instill within children the ability to acquire and sustain music knowledge rather than teaching them knowledge per se.

Instrumentation is a distinguishing feature in the Orff classes wherein both pitched and unpitched instruments ranging from metallophone to chime-bar are used. Percussion instruments, especially those pitched with removable bars including reduced sized xylophones and glockenspiels, are sometimes known as ‘Orff instruments’ or ‘Orff-type instruments’ when the Orff approach is introduced abroad (Taylor, 2000; Holmes, 1966). Orff, in cooperation with musical instruments building experts, designed and developed a series of percussion instruments. These percussions are only struck with mallets or hands but are capable of producing delicate and mellow tone and timbre. Compared to the percussions of the modern orchestra, Orff percussions require fewer techniques, have a closer connection to non-Western cultures, and are easier to be manipulated by all children (Landis & Carder, 1972). Holmes (1966) further asserted that, “children are encouraged not only to become familiar with each instrument, but to be aware of the effect on the listener which it may produce by being manipulated in a certain manner” (n. p.). The recorder, a wind instrument, was also used in his teaching approach (Silsbury, 1968). Despite the
occasional use of the tones of the pianoforte in ensemble sound, this instrument is never used for instrumentation learning, or for singing accompaniment, the underlying reason being that its timbre does not mix with those of Orff instruments. In addition, the use of pianoforte in classroom music teaching is against Orff’s child-centred educational principle as it is the teacher playing the piano rather than the students (Landis & Carder, 1972; Holmes, 1966).

In conjunction with the impact that the ‘Instrumentaria’ has had on music education worldwide, the musical structures that the Orff approach provides have had an equally influential effect on music educators to this very day. Taylor (2000) asserted that “pentatonic scales, rhythm and pulse games, and ostinati derived from speech patterns, chants, poems and drones” are typical of the Orff structures (p. 214). Amongst all Orff’s pedagogical ideas, improvisation holds primacy. According to Frazee (1987), this viewpoint was even demonstrated in the most superficial reports of Orff’s earlier years. Compared to most of the traditionally conservative music teaching styles, the Orff program allows more space for “individual development”, which results in avoiding any occurrence of under-progress for the learner’s age level (Silsbury, 1968, p. 41). To further explain this viewpoint, Holmes (1966) asserted that the dominant characteristic of the Orff approach is the learner’s freedom to choose and create within the domain of “pulse, metre, phrase structure or musical form” (n. p.). The learner’s music vocabulary is built through explorations of different instruments, sounds, and the way the sounds are produced.

c) The Orff Classes

Orff classes comprise various fun and enjoyable elements which are designed for children’s learning in accordance with their level of cognitive development and experience (Frazee, 1987). Each phase of the Orff program “provides the stimulation needed for new and independent
growth, continually developing, growing and moving on to new and challenging activities” (Webster, 1993, p. 25). The approach’s pedagogical principles require Orff classes to provide as many experiences in singing, listening, movement, instrument playing, speech and rhythm as possible before offering any teaching of notation. Goodkin (2001) argues that what separates the Orff approach from other music teaching disciplines is “the experience of improvisation at the heart of the matter” and the aspect that its “creative tasks [within] the Orff classroom have a distinct flavor” (p. 19). Similarly, Bacon (1969) pointed out that the teacher’s imagination in conjunction with the learner’s musical talent determines one’s success on their music learning through the Orff approach.

A typical Orff lesson is conducted as an ‘artistic journey’ within which the beginning of the classes actually incorporates the end, and the acquisition of musical understandings are achieved through improvisation. Though developing children’s abilities of improvisation and composition are emphasized as focal points in the Orff approach, encouraging students to learn various musical elements, such as rhythm, melody, harmony, texture, form, etc., is also part of its core principle. Once learned, these concepts become a foundation for the pursuit of further development of creativity, including composition and improvisation of the student’s own music (Davies-Splitter & Splitter, 2006; Liess, 1966). Orff classes are often regarded as creative teaching/learning processes and they ensure that every new concept is “first hand, refined, developed and connected to” previously taught subjects (Stavely, 1999, p. 14). Within the classroom the Orff teacher assumes the role of a conductor providing prompts to an enthusiastic orchestra. The tasks are often completed by coordinating students as both instrumentalists and singers (Australian National Council of Orff Schulwerk (ANCOS), 2005). The Orff approach incorporates music, movement and dance, and enables both educators and learners to access their
intrinsic abilities and motivations for enjoyable music studying and performing (Orff-Schulwerk Association Singapore (OSAS), 2010; Webster, 1993). It not only develops the learner’s abilities of imagination and creation but also builds a “genuine partnership” between teachers and students through collaboration (Taylor, 2000, p. 214). This pedagogy is often recognized as a music-making approach which is basically hands-on and occurs within an atmosphere that is relaxed and without pressure. The approach emphasizes that an individual’s abilities of sensing “sound, rhythm, movement, order and repetition” are completely intrinsic, therefore, there is no demand for any pre-musical experience when participating in the Orff course (OSAS, 2010, p. 1; Liess, 1966). Instead, the aforementioned innate abilities will be recognized and developed gradually through the utilization of the “intricately structured” techniques that the Orff approach provides, such as speech, body percussion and musical games (Webster, 1993; Liess, 1966). In fact, it was Orff’s aim to help learners with varying degrees of musical ability to make their own music because he believed that every child is gifted with some kind of artistic skill (Webster, 1993). Orff classes also enable every learner in the class to participate in and to be fully occupied by its process. Learners usually develop a great deal of self-esteem and enjoyment when the entire experience of the Orff course comes together in a presentation finale (VOSA, 2010).

d) The Orff educators

Orff’s pedagogical ideas are quickly appreciated by teachers because these ideas provide set models of music education within a chronological and developmental structure (Taylor, 2000). Nevertheless, according to Goodkin (2001), the Orff teaching approach was never classified as a method per se because Orff himself “refused to systemize the path and turn it toward a method” (p. 21). In accordance with this, Webster (1993) stated that “rather than a ‘method’ of music teaching, Orff Schulwerk is an ‘approach’ to a general music education” (p. 25). Hence, each
teacher must create an individual curriculum when adapting Orff’s pedagogical ideas or implementing the approach in his or her classes. This is so, because the approach requires the educator to adjust his/her adaptation in accordance with students’ needs and to make the entire teaching/learning process participant-centred. (Goodkin, 2001; Webster, 1993). The curriculum must be “cumulative, sequential, integrated and progressive … moving from simple to the complex, from the part to the whole” (Stavely, 1999, p. 14). It was initially argued that teachers of the Orff approach may not be very proficient in basic music knowledge and skills but must have considerable imagination and creative abilities (Bacon, 1969; Frank, 1964). Taylor (2000) recommends that there is a strong impetus to more fully incorporate the principles of the Orff pedagogy not only in general music educational field but especially in “initial teacher education and in-service education” (p. 219).

To sum up, the Orff approach has had a significant impact on music education in various ways. Its pedagogical principles have enabled children to learn music and make music, and the impact of its ‘Instrumentaria’ has broadened the possibilities of classroom practice in performance and composition. Moreover, the Orff approach has been regarded as a component of the continuation of tradition, and has been included in national curricula in other countries. Both generalists and specialists benefit from the Orff approach in terms of its accessibility and its stimulation of artistic and musical creativity (Taylor, 2000). The Orff approach offers numerous opportunities for individual creativity in the preparatory stages, cultivating a feeling of ownership. The participants also appreciate the importance and meaning of effort, whether it is through individual means or team co-operation, and develop personal characteristics such as persistence, determination, charity and the ability to establish “trust and boundaries” (OSAS, 2010, p. 2). Such qualities can be transmitted into other aspects of young learners’ lives in their journey
towards maturity and finding strength through life’s challenges (Liess, 1966). The Orff approach is seen as having links to other learning domains such as foreign language studies.

- **The Orff approach and language studies**

Language and music are often considered as inseparable. That the way children take in music by using their intrinsic ability in conjunction with the incorporation of aural knowledge in their own living environment is similar that of their language development (Webster, 1993). It was suggested that children should absorb various types of aural experiences as provided within the family and community, and when such provision is lacking, this needs to occur at school. These aural experiences are vital because they provide a way of communicating in music (Webster, 1993, p. 26). The Orff approach is able to demonstrate the connection of language and music through incorporating folk songs, fairy tales and legends in children’s music-making practices (Liess, 1966). Pritikin (2010) states that the Orff approach advocates that music learning should begin with listening and creating rather than reading and writing. Such a theoretical approach applies to language learning as well, as language is firstly obtained through “hearing and making”, and reading and writing only commence at a much later stage of the language learning process (p. 1). Pritikin (2010) therefore concludes that the “sound/symbol connection” stressed in the Orff approach can be utilized in foreign language classes as a suitable teaching tool in order to transform traditional classes, wherein students will not hear the target language spoken by the teacher until a year or two later, into “communicative” classes, whereby students are able to hear the teacher speaking the target language from the very first lesson (p. 2). The Orff approach encourages students to experience rhythm of oral communication and physical dynamics as the best means to discover music. This system of music education utilizes the natural propensity to experience rhythm in speech through listening rather than through hearing,
which allows students to focus their minds on perceived sounds. Pritikin (2010) further asserts that the adaptation of the Orff techniques to the foreign language classroom serves the purpose of developing students’ independent awareness of the connection between sounds and symbols of the target language. The most efficient way for students to discover language rhythm is through the combined technique of “echo-clapping and the use of rhythm instruments” which is a core component in the Orff pedagogy (Pritikin, 2010, p. 5). It is stressed that the underlying rationale for adapting Orff techniques in foreign language classes is that it enables students to find the level of comfort conducive to enhancing literacy acquisition in the target language. This is facilitated through “echo-clapping” in a rhythmic manner and then reproducing the word(s) on a rhythm instrument. Pritikin (2010) concludes that the Orff-Schulwerk pedagogical approach enables students to learn sound and rhythm by tapping into their innate enthusiasm and keenness for vocalizing and engaging in physical movement. Though used traditionally to strengthen literacy skills in one’s original language, the Orff techniques can also be implemented efficaciously in foreign language classes in order to make language acquisition more enjoyable and more achievable.

- **Comparisons between the Orff approach and other methods**

Siemens (1969), in an early comparative study of what she terms ‘traditional’ teaching method and the Orff approach, found that there were considerable differences between the two. Siemens offered no clear definition of what might comprise a ‘traditional’ approach. However, from her article it may be understood that such classroom music would include singing, listening, music reading and playing instruments in teacher directed activities with little opportunity for creativity. Significantly, the group taught by the Orff approach had greater “interest and attitude”, selecting music as a favourite subject, and enjoying the participation in “rhythmic activities and part
singing” (p. 285). This positive response was not replicated in the other tests of music discrimination (Siemens, 1969).

- The Orff approach in Australia

According to Webster (1993), music education within Australia has often come under criticism by music educators for its reliance upon “other cultures for its inspiration and content” (p. 1). Over the last few years, there has been a movement towards acquiring a more defined Australian sense of identity. However, the need for incorporating more local music material in school music education is ongoing as children are to be more involved in their national culture through music. Webster (1993) recommended that Australian children’s speech rhymes, singing games and folk songs would serve this purpose. The Orff approach provides an opportunity for these music materials to be included to formulate a specific music teaching program which is distinctively Australian.

Webster (1993) claimed that by 1993, the Orff approach literature in Australia could be accessed through conference notes, journals, newsletters, and interviews, and yet, was not collected or presented systematically. The accessible information about the approach was generally acquired from copies of books on European and American adaptations of Orff Schulwerk, and the availability of articles involving the relationship between the approach and Australian scenario was extremely limited. Nonetheless, according to Maubach (2005), the Orff approach, as a creative and constructive pedagogical pathway, has contributed appreciably towards establishing foundations of modern music education in Australia. The Orff approach was introduced to Australia some forty years ago and has been adapted in all six states to date. The connection
between the Orff Schulwerk and Australian musicians and music educators dates back to the early 1960s (Webster, 1993; Gerozisis, 2002; Silsbury, 1968).

The Australian National Council of Orff Schulwerk Association (ANCOSA) was established in all states in Australia by 1991 (Gerozisis, 2002; Maubach, 2005). Webster (1993) concluded that despite the strong availability of general information about the Orff approach as well as the accessibility to children’s folk material, the literature on Australia’s adaptation of Orff Schulwerk, particularly on its associated problems, however, was very limited. A study by Webster (1993) demonstrated that there was a need for home-grown folk music material which is identifiably Australian in order to maximize the utilization of Orff Schulwerk techniques. It was also found that the provision of the framework and detailed explanation pertaining to the development of melodic and rhythmic concepts in Orff Schulwerk would be beneficial for pre-service teachers in terms of cultivating greater comprehension of the principles and methodology of the Orff approach (Webster, 1993, p. 9). Stavely (1999) summarised some of the previous research results regarding the effects that the Orff approach had on learning enhancement. The research revealed positive results in areas of language, information processing and brain structures, memory, and intelligence. Stavely (1999) stated that Orff classes enable both the student’s procedural and declarative memories to function so that the learning is long-lasting.

During a typical Orff session, students firstly explore a new concept through their senses, followed by experimentation by playing. Students will then visualize the new knowledge consciously through reflections before being invited to a final discussion about the concept. Stavely (1999) asserted that Orff classes often start with “imitation of skills and techniques” before the exploration of a new concept (p. 13). This teaching approach “establishes and revisits all the neural connections activated by the actions” which would eventually enable students to
create new ideas with the access to previously learnt knowledge (Stavely, 1999, p. 14). Differentiating or discovering similarities of notes, rhythmic patterns, or structures which are essential in the Orff approach can stimulate the brain to perform at its optimal level. In addition, the Orff approach enables the brain to build practical knowledge by processing both declarative and procedural memory functions simultaneously in terms of acquiring “musical intelligence” (p. 13). For Orff educators, the ramifications of the Orff pedagogy involve encouraging students in terms of behaviour, skills development, and acquisition of musical language and concepts. The Orff pedagogical approach also encourages students to apply general skills and specific skills gained from other disciplines to music learning (Stavely, 1999). In Orff classes, music learning is sensory as it integrates reading, listening, speaking, and moving faculties which facilitate the brain to perceive different information in specific ways. The Orff pedagogy, as a two-way interactive dynamic, also creates a nurturing and intellectually stimulating atmosphere which is conducive to encouraging students to confidently, creatively and practically apply their musical skills and knowledge to other disciplines (Stavely, 1999). As will be seen, the Orff approach has had a profound influence upon the music specialist at the centre of this study.

3. **Orff and Kodály**

Despite their individual teaching philosophies and procedures, the Kodály method and the Orff approach are related to each other in several ways (Landis & Carder, 1972). According to Silsbury (1968), during the Summer School held for the Orff training courses in 1968, a class conducted for children aged between eight and nine, demonstrated various points of intersection
between Orff and Kodály, especially in the area of children’s vocal development (Silsbury, 1968). Orff himself admitted that there was an “interrelationship” between Kodály’s educational principals and those of his own, with Kodály having possession of a collection of Orff instruments after a visit to the Orff Institute in Salzburg. Kodály even suggested that the very first instrument a child ever uses is “a xylophone with removable bars” (Landis & Carder, 1972, p. 59). Landis and Carder (1972) maintained that both Kodály and Orff were well aware of the limitations of contemporary music teaching methods and sought to overcome them. They both adapted what they believed were the most useful ideas from pre-existing methods into their own pedagogical plans, including Curwen’s hand signs that were essential to the Kodály method, and Dalcroze’s Eurhythmics which was a key component in the Orff approach. In terms of children’s music learning, Landis and Carder (1972) asserted that both Kodály and Orff believed that each child’s musical development progresses from “primitive musical responses to a highly developed level of musicianship” and that singing and movement always occur simultaneously with young children (p. 43). Folk music was important in both approaches because it was native and nationalistic, and therefore, was very close to children’s life experiences. Folk songs in pentatonic mode were considered as most suitable for early music education as they were natural and easy for children to comprehend.

The following illustrate the major divergences between the Kodály method and the Orff approach.

(a) Effective learning of the Kodály concept requires a great deal of time expenditure and comprehension, and the concept must be learnt in sequence and systematically. The level of frequency of having Kodály lessons is vital for the success of its learning. The Orff approach, on the other hand, was not strictly structured and was rather formless. A high level of ability for
improvisation, however, was required in order to learn the Orff approach successfully (Bacon, 1969).

(b) The Orff approach, a German oriented music teaching approach, was not as fully integrated in the German public educational system as the Hungarian Kodály method was in Hungary. Before the German Ministry of Education stated to recognize the value of the special music teaching method, Orff was mainly used in “community music schools” for children’s private lessons up until the late 1960s. In contrast, the Kodály method was used at all schools nationwide and created a revolution in Hungarian music education (Bacon, 1969, p. 53). The Ministry of Education in Hungary actually made it compulsory that every child had to learn music at school up until and throughout Grade Ten.

(c) It is important to realise when adapting the two methods, that either method has its difficulties which could be interpreted as their weaknesses. Early advocate, Bacon (1969) stressed that “the greatest difficulties with the Orff (approach) is that when the children see the instruments, they do not want to sing” (p. 55). Singing is the foundation for every music learner; therefore, teachers must be made aware that instrumentation should only play the role of accompaniment to singing when adapting the Orff approach. On the other hand, “the most difficult problem of the Kodály method is suitable material” (Bacon, 1969, p. 55). Because the literacy of the Kodály method is produced through a sequential sofege mode via songs, it is therefore essential to select songs accordingly whilst building a curricular approach to accommodate them. This involves a close examination of our own particular type of folk music which has the relevant qualities with simple rhythmic patterns but is difficult to locate within a limited range for learning purposes designed for beginners (Bacon, 1969).
In conclusion, the Kodály method cultivates literacy in music and has a proven history of success with the Hungarian nation; the Orff approach has the capacity to encourage a greater scope of freedom in children as individuals, whilst enabling greater self-expression and connection to the environment in which they live. Furthermore, the Kodály method is based upon discipline, sequencing, and has the quality of being authentically musical; the Orff approach is unrestrained, does not rely on stereotype, and gives rise to creativity (Bacon, 1969). Nevertheless, both approaches set their pedagogical principles upon the belief that every child is capable of literacy development. They both advocated the important role that folk music plays music education as a teaching material and the vital position that improvisation holds as a teaching technique.

This is the last of the two literature review chapters which have addressed research concerning aspects of school music teaching relevant to this case study. In these two chapters, a review of literature in the areas of advocacy of school music education, efficacy of music teaching, choral program, instrumental program, pull-out program, and public performance have been presented. Literature in relation to two particular music teaching methods, the Kodály method and the Orff approach, has also been reviewed. The thesis will now move on to Chapter 4 - an evaluation of the particular research methodological approaches employed in this study.
Chapter Four

Research Methodology

In this chapter, various methodologies will be reviewed, including qualitative, quantitative and mixed-research methods. The nature of this study has determined that a qualitative method is the one most appropriate. This qualitative study requires a phenomenological approach in order to gain greater insight into the research subject at the selected primary school. In terms of data collection, observations and semi-structured interviews will be discussed in detail in order to evaluate the rationale for utilizing such strategies for this single case study. Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis (IPA) as a data analyzing approach used in this study will also be discussed.

1. Three major educational research approaches

Qualitative, quantitative and mixed methods are often regarded as the three major methodological approaches used in educational research filed (Johnson & Christensen, 2004). Qualitative method is used to describe a research subject in a specific and comprehensive manner through words, objects and images, whilst quantitative method deals with an explanation of subjects being observed through numbers, classifications and statistics (Neill, 2007). Qualitative methodology focuses on the inductive element of the scientific method and is utilised to generate new theories and hypotheses, whilst quantitative methodology relies more on the deductive aspect of the scientific method because it focuses more on theory and hypothesis testing (Johnson & Christensen, 2004). Qualitative research attempts to investigate details of “unquantifiable, personal, in depth, descriptive and social aspects of the world” while
quantitative research intends to find out what is able to, “be measured or quantified” (Winter, 2000, p. 7). Qualitative researchers seek “illumination, understanding, and extrapolation to similar situations”, and generally involve themselves with the research subject in order to collect rich, specific and most recent data, and to analyze this data through exploration of the underlying theme (Hoepfl, 1997, p. 48; Winter, 2000). In contrast, quantitative researchers seek “causal determination, predication, and generalization of findings”, and need to distance themselves from the research subject and be as objective as possible in order to collect data for hypothesis testing which needs to be analyzed precisely through statistics (Hoepfl, 1997, p. 48; Winter, 2000).

Data-collecting tools often used in qualitative research include interviews, observations, document reviews and visual data analysis, whilst experiments, quasi-experiments, tests, and scales are usually utilized in quantitative research (Mackenzie & Knipe, 2006).

In the field of educational research, qualitative method has gained credibility as a suitable research instrument. It has been argued that there is a greater need for more qualitative studies that address the social environment of the classroom in accordance with quantitative approaches, as educators’ knowledge is not contingent on the corpus of factual information, but relies on that which is “practical, interactive and responsive to wider political and social change” (Bourke, 2007, p. 8).

As the term implies, mixed-method research involves the combined utilization of both qualitative and quantitative approaches. The nature of the qualitative research method limits its causality whilst in quantitative research a weaker reality is revealed. Hence, both methods overlap to form a combined method enabling the weakness of one method to be compensated by the other’s strength (Johnson & Christensen, 2004). The mixed-method approach has become more accepted and commonly used in the field of educational research because its flexibility of methods-
application is able to accommodate complex research designs (Creswell, 2003; Mackenzie & Knipe, 2006). This approach also allows the researcher to manipulate both qualitative and quantitative methods either simultaneously or successively for the purpose of concentrating on one research theme (Johnson & Christensen, 2004). By using mixed method, educational researchers are able to employ multiple theories, research paradigms and methodologies, and therefore it is believed that “by combining two (or more) research methods with different strengths and weaknesses in a research study, you can make it less likely that you will make a mistake” (Johnson & Christensen, 2007, p. 35). Mixed-method researchers indicate explicitly that they use both inductive and deductive components of the scientific method in their research (Johnson & Christensen, 2007). Despite its advantages, mixed-methods will not be employed in this solely qualitative enquiry.

2. Qualitative research

According to Burns (1995), “qualitative forms of investigations tend to be based on a recognition of the importance of the subjective, experiential ‘lifeworld’ of human beings”, and researchers usually have general ideas about what is to be investigated before research begins (p. 11). Qualitative methods tend to describe a world within which “reality is socially constructed, complex and ever-changing” (Bourke, 2007, p. 11). The nature of qualitative investigations is often decided by the research itself, there are no pre-existing or established tests used and the hypotheses and findings may not be necessarily revealed (Bresler, 1995; Winter, 2000).

Classic qualitative research is conducted through several particular forms of data collection by the primary data-collecting ‘instrument’, the researcher. These forms of data collection often include “in-depth interviews, observation, field notes, and open-ended questions” (John &
An interesting feature of qualitative research is the inductive process where hypotheses and foundational theories are generated through the collection of data resulting from fieldwork. In some cases, “after inductive hypotheses and a tentative theory have been generated from initial observations, the observable consequences of these are often deduced and then tested through additional observations” (Johnson & Christensen 2004, p. 17).

As a means of collecting data, observation views behaviour as a constant, interactive and social phenomenon occurring in a given context, situation or natural environment. Qualitative researchers observe behaviour in its natural setting without interfering so as not to disrupt the natural order of the phenomenon under observation. It should be noted that observation itself may cause some change in the phenomenon but this is minimized by the researcher’s repeated and eventually unremarked presence. Observations often focus on the dynamic continuum of behaviour which is “seen to be more situational and context bound than generalizable. Different groups are said to construct different realities or perspectives, and the focus is on how patterns of behaviour vary from group to group and from situation to situation” (Johnson & Christensen, 2004, p. 17). The researcher assumes a broad, holistic view as if observing through a wide-angle lens so as to capture as many levels and features of the research subjects’ behaviour. For example, the author will seek to identify if there are particular conventions in the adaptation of a particular music teaching method. Bresler (1995) stated that the relationship between the researcher and the research subject is the underlying assumption of the qualitative paradigm. The researcher is not seen as separate from the subject and is part of the reality of the study. The qualitative researcher needs to immerse him/herself in the culture of the subjects being observed rather than being a distant observer in order to understand the nature of the reality within which the research subjects live and interact (Johnson & Christensen, 2004; Bresler, 1995). In other
words, qualitative research is experiential so that the researcher must get close to the research subject and experience their world in order to have a more in-depth and intimate understanding. In this regard, the qualitative researcher becomes the actual instrument of data collection instead of numerically based measuring equipment associated with quantitative research (Johnson & Christensen, 2004). Citing Max Weber (1968), the very famous sociologist, Johnson and Christensen (2004) asserted that understanding through empathy enables the researcher to develop a more in-depth appreciation of the subject through the subject’s own viewpoint. In essence, qualitative researchers must put themselves in their subjects’ shoes. Because qualitative researchers are part of the reality of their study, they must be attuned to and mindful of their own particular prejudices and scrutinize them via systematic data collection and analyses (Bresler, 1995).

In terms of data analysis, the qualitative researcher seeks and identifies recurrent themes, patterns and overall trends through media, such as images, words and levels of classification. Results are based upon the data gleaned from the subject can then be projected as a generalization or representative of a particular group within the overall population. The final report is constructed as a narrative describing the context of the study’s focus, including reference to actual quotations from the research subjects and is usually presented in descriptive form, explaining what the findings are and how the findings are interpreted to make sense (Johnson & Christensen, 2004).

According to Callaghan (2000), “Various types of qualitative research are named according to their focus: descriptive research, historical research or philosophical research, for example” (p. 41). This research will be classified as descriptive research as its focus will include the description of the current situation of music education in Victorian primary schools, as well as
the evaluation of the suitability, applicability and efficacy of the Kodály and Orff methods in classroom music teaching in Victoria.

In summary, qualitative research is the common choice of methodological approach for educational researchers as it enables the study to collect in-depth, detailed data from a holistic perspective, whilst generating greater understanding of the phenomenon observed as it allows a greater affinity with subjects through the researchers’ ability to understand through empathy (Johnson & Christensen, 2004). Qualitative approaches are designed to have a greater sensitivity and adaptability to the numerous reciprocally “shaping influences and value patterns that may be encountered” (Bresler, 1995).

There are several different approaches that come under the category of qualitative research methodology. These approaches share similarities in aforementioned qualitative features but differ in their research aims, issues and methods of analysis. In the following, the author will explain in detail the four methods that resonate with her research, including phenomenology, ethnography, grounded theory and case study, bearing in mind that this study will be a phenomenology case study. The underlying rationale for this is because the research is deemed the most suitable as a phenomenological case study can explore and describe the essence of primary music education from both the educators’ and learners’ point of view, despite being virtually undocumented in the literature of music education.

- **Phenomenology**

There are five major types of qualitative research, including historical research, case study, grounded theory, ethnography, and phenomenology, and amongst which, phenomenology is considered as primary (Johnson & Christensen, 2004). Phenomenology was established in the
early 20th century. It is a descriptive research approach which is philosophically-oriented, as opposed to methodologically-oriented. Phenomenology is a social science which studies people with the intention to investigate and portray phenomena in people’s lifeworld and lived experiences so as to discover the meaning of such phenomena for themselves (Bourke, 2007; Mostert, 2002). Smith, Flowers and Larkin (2010) defines phenomenology as “a philosophical approach to the study of experience” (p. 11). This philosophy provides researchers with fertile ground for generating ideas into investigating and understanding human beings’ major experiences in the lived world. When one talks about phenomenology, he/she must consider the work of four major philosophers in this area: Husserl, Heidegger, Merleau-Pony, and Sartre (p. 12).

According to Smith et al. (2010), Husserl’s theory was based upon his belief in that the examination of experience should be about its actual incidence and nature. He suggested that researchers should focus on the nature of each particular experience without categorizing them with pre-existing definitions. Husserl established the framework for the examination of human beings’ lived experience, discovering the core of the experience. As a student of Husserl’s, Heidegger believed that his divergence from his teacher’s work was more phenomenologically based. Heidegger’s major work, Being and Time, is concerned with the establishment of the essential nature of ‘Dasein’ – “the uniquely situated quality of ‘human being’” (p. 16). His major interest in the area was to interpret the concept of ‘the world’ which is directly used and produced by individuals without being theoretically known, as well as human beings’ engagement in the world and their connections with their surroundings. Like Heidegger, Merleau-Ponty emphasized knowledge about the world within contextual settings and in accordance with the quality of interpretation. However, he addressed the issue through
descriptions of the representative nature of people’s connection with the world from which people form their own viewpoint towards the world. Merleau-Ponty’s theory explored the primary nature of human knowledge about the world, emphasizing the importance of both physical and observable practices of people’s existence in the world. Sartre expressed his agreement with Heidegger, stating that human beings are immersed in the developments in the world. However, his emphasis was placed on human beings’ progression rather than their pre-existence, concerned with what people would become instead of what they are (Smith et al., 2010).

Phenomenology seeks to discover the essence of the subject’s experience without any form of social and cultural meanings attached to it. As an exploratory method, phenomenology requires open-mindedness within the researcher in order to allow any unexpected aspects to manifest (Mostert, 2002). According to Lester (1999), phenomenology is involved with the observation, interpretation and analysis of experience from the subject’s perspective. However, Mostert (2002) clarifies that what phenomenological research deals with is people rather than subjects, because human beings are replete with attitudes, beliefs and values, and associated with experiences, social and cultural influences. Augmenting this point of view, Bresler (1995) states that Phenomenology is the study of persons, as the notion of subject is not able to reveal the individual differences nor able to represent the uniqueness of human beings. The aim of the phenomenological perspective is to clarify that which is specific in nature, identifying phenomena through the perceptions of the research subject in a given situation. Instead of generating new information, phenomenology values and further explains the implicit meanings of phenomena by uncovering different levels of cultural, social, moral and ethical influences which people encounter in their given environment (Mostert, 2002). Phenomenology as a
research methodology has been transferred from philosophy into the context of education and has been commonly used in the area of educational research (Barnacle, 2001, p. 1). Phenomenological approach is often associated with qualitative research instruments and is interpreted as identical to the concept of lived experience. This approach deals with the quality, value and impressions of experiences as opposed to any empirical approaches that are concerned with characteristics of what, when and why. Phenomenological research has the advantage of greater engagement with the interaction between “theory and practice, and abstraction and immediacy” over other theoretical frameworks (Barnacle, 2001, p. 6). It is also recognized that phenomenological studies are able to contribute more valuably in certain educational areas, such as inclusive education (Bourke, 2007).

When a researcher is attempting to study how one or several individuals experience a phenomenon, the study is then regarded as phenomenological research, in which open-ended interviews and reflective journals are often used as primary data-collecting instruments (Bresler, 1995; Johnson & Christensen, 2004). Hence, this is why phenomenology is not field-oriented nor is naturalistic, as “conducting interviews and obtaining journals are not natural activities, but strategies intended to facilitate reflection” (Bresler, 1995, p. 12). Phenomenological approaches are based upon a research perspective of “personal knowledge and subjectivity” with emphasis on the significance of personal understanding and interpretation (Lester, 1999, p. 1). Thus, phenomenological research is cogent in understanding individual experience in a subjective manner, capturing the nature of people’s behaviours and motivations, and “cutting through the clutter of taken-for-granted assumptions and conventional wisdom” (Lester, 1999, p. 1). Because the phenomenological approaches are especially efficacious in revealing individual’s experiences and perspectives from their own viewpoint, they support the questioning of pre-established and
mainstream perceptions. An integral aspect of this type of qualitative research is that the researcher is more interested in understanding the subject’s personal opinion towards his/her experience of the phenomenon. This requires the researcher to establish a close relationship with the participants during the research process in order to interpret their viewpoints and experiences more accurately (Johnson & Christensen, 2004). According to Marcelle (2005), the initial phase of phenomenology is sometimes regarded as *descriptive phenomenology* because of its evidential, reflective, and descriptive features to that which is encountered including objects. Metaphorically speaking then, Marcelle (2005) further adds that if this aspect of phenomenology is the trunk, realistic phenomenology, constitutive phenomenology, existential phenomenology, and hermeneutical phenomenology are the four successive limbs, further ramified into more diminutive branches and twigs.

Over recent times, hermeneutic phenomenology has become the focus of research in many areas, including education. Generally, hermeneutic phenomenology endeavours to reveal hidden meanings in lifeworld phenomena and assumes the interpretive task to comprehend subjects’ lifeworld experiences “of the phenomena of interest” that can throw light upon ways of worldly existence through phenomenological processes (Cole, 2010, p. 1). It is this orientation towards interpretive practices that creates a major distinction between research that is purely phenomenological and which seeks rich descriptions of the lifeworld within day-to-day experiences, “and hermeneutic phenomenological research that seeks to understand these worlds from participants’ perspectives” (Cole, 2010, p. 1). From a hermeneutic point of view, “human experience is context-bound and there can be no context-free or neutral scientific language with which to express what happens in the social world” (Bresler, 1995, p. 11).
Two essential elements of Phenomenology must be mentioned, and these are Lifeworld and Lived experience. Lifeworld is the everyday world people already live in which is pre-established (Mostert, 2002). In the lifeworld in which one exists there is lived experience, which is the experience a person lives in at a given time in a given situation. It is practical and pre-given, and involves the entirety of life. It is argued that lived experience within one’s lifeworld is regarded as the very core of phenomenology, without which there would not be any “phenomena to investigate and interrogate” (Mostert, 2002, p. 2). Lived experience is also regarded as the starting and ending point of phenomenological studies (Bresler, 1995).

To sum up, phenomenology as a qualitative method has been used successfully in the field of educational research and is an interpretive study of phenomena as human beings experience them; investigates the nature of a phenomenon from a descriptive point of view as to how the phenomenon appears in consciousness; appreciates and interprets meanings which already exist implicitly in lived experience as well as provides possibility to allow new meanings to emerge; and recognizes that reality is generated within human experiences (Bourke, 2007; Mostert, 2002). According to Bresler (1995), “Phenomenological investigation requires the skills of listening attentively, probing and facilitating the articulation of nonverbal experiences into linguistic constructs” (p. 15). It is advocated that every educator should seek a phenomenological affinity to their own lived experience in order to gauge the meaning of the phenomenon, “and to find a language in the research process which can ‘contribute to one’s pedagogical thoughtfulness and tact’” (Van Manen, 2002 as quoted in Bourke, 2007, p. 12). In the area of education, phenomenological research is regarded as profoundly valuable for serving the purposes of sensing students’ realities and their lifeworld, and in addition, enhancing teachers’ ability to recognize the pedagogical significance of circumstances and interactions with their students.
(Bresler, 1995). The approach of phenomenology is effective in bringing to the surface profound underlying issues and providing a mechanism by which subjects are given a voice (Lester, 1999). The author’s phenomenological case study was conducted to reveal how students from a chosen government primary school, demonstrate understanding of music concepts and musical skills. Therefore, this study is recognized as an example of phenomenological research. Many ideas generated from phenomenology are in alignment with two other important qualitative research approaches ethnography and grounded theory. Although these are not employed in this study, their approaches resonate strongly with phenomenology and initial considerations of both these research strategies informed initial research decisions.

- **Ethnography**

One cannot talk about qualitative methodology, especially within the area of educational research, without mentioning the concept of ethnography - another commonly used approach that focuses on creating a holistic description of the culture that a community generates, and functions and interacts within (Johnson & Christensen, 2004; Burns, 1995). Ethnographic research entails the detailed monitoring of the dynamics of a particular group of subjects, incorporating interaction and communication within that group, culminating in what is termed “a cultural description” (Moustakas, 1994, p. 1). Ethnography is a broadly accepted practice within a range of studies possessing their own intrinsic histories. It entails taking records of lived social experience within a community as well as discovering and examining cultural and social issues concerning how subjects live within a particular lifestyle, complete with customs, rituals and beliefs, which is subject to both intrinsic and extrinsic agents of change (Willis & Trondman, 2000). Willis and Trondman (2000) further stated that the essential element in ethnography is
experience, in which its understanding and representation centralize the method both theoretically and empirically.

Ethnographic research is a process of “presenting, explaining and analysing” the culture which targets experience with the aim of studying and writing about social sciences and human practices in a comprehensive manner (Willis & Trondman, 2000, p. 6). The ethnographic researcher takes into consideration the relationship between theory and ethnographic research of cultural and social change. Rodrigues-Junior (2005) argued that as a system of inquiry, ethnography is viewed as the combination of theory and method in order to investigate phenomena with an educational basis occurring intrinsically and throughout areas of study involving language and literacy. Ethnography as a distinctive educational research approach does not only exist as a way of conducting research but also as a means of developing theory and understanding of the world wherein ethnographers explore the cultural similarities of schools or school communities through their research (Morrison & Pole, 2003).

- Grounded theory

Like phenomenology, grounded theory attempts to understand and explain the subject(s) of the research. Grounded theory is a type of research method whereby the theory is generated from data, rather than being created beforehand. In other words, grounded theory is data-driven rather than theory-driven (Davidson, 2002). Callaghan (2000) stated that grounded theory is also “a particular type of naturalistic inquiry” and its design emerges as the research develops (p. 41). In grounded theory the collection of data is continuous and co-exists with analysis which enables the emergence of the study’s design significance, whilst providing greater focus for the study (Callaghan, 2000). This method is inductive as it progresses from specificity to generality. It
follows then, that the main aim of grounded theory is to elaborate upon an explication of a phenomenon by recognizing essential components of that phenomenon, “and then categorizing the relationships” of those components to the framework, setting, and procedure of the observation, interview, and so forth. (Davidson, 2002, n. p. n.). It also aims to proceed from the specific to the more general without sacrificing the qualities of the study’s uniqueness. As data collection and data analysis are deliberately connected, grounded theory enables the analysis of previous data to guide and facilitate impending data collection. Consequently, the researcher is able to increase the depth and richness of “recurring categories as well as to assist in providing follow-up procedures in regards to unanticipated results” (Davidson, 2002, n. p. n.). For example, the emergent theory from the result of the observation will provide a direction for the approach to be taken for the semi-structured interview component of the data collection. The researcher will then have a clearer focus concerning the most appropriate means of conducting the semi-structured interview.

In the area of music education research, grounded theory is regarded as an appropriate methodology to be utilized as “it is well suited to research in aspects of music education where concepts, attitudes and the relationships between people or phenomena are important” (Callaghan, 2000, p. 44). It is suitable “for investigating social interactions in classroom, professional and community music-making settings; for research into teaching practice and teacher training; and for inquiry into the musical values of students and teachers” (Callaghan, 2000, p. 44). The most common format for qualitative inquiry is case study.

- Case study
The most common research strategy in qualitative research is the case study. A case study is the study of individual cases, or groups of analysis which are essential to the understanding of the method being examined (Burns, 1995; Wellington, 2000; Crawford, 2006). Case studies are commonly used in sociological, medical, educational and legal studies. A case study’s subject often involves “a person, an event, a group, an organization, a classroom, a town, a family” (Yin 1984, p. 2). Case studies are often chosen to seek answers for why and how questions, and to investigate situations where the researcher has no intention to exert control or mediate within them (Yin, 1984).

According to Burns (1995), “The case study has had a long history in educational research” (p. 312). He also acknowledged that case study had gained increasing recognition in qualitative research. Stake (2005) perceives case study from a different point of view whereby rather than being a methodological choice, it is “a choice of what is to be studied” (p. 443). He asserts further that, “As a form of research, case study is defined by interest in an individual case” (Stake, 2005, p. 169). He classifies case study into three types – intrinsic case study, multiple or collective case study, and instrumental case study.

(1) Intrinsic case study

If the study is undertaken because the researcher is only interested in understanding one particular case, this research is then classified as intrinsic case study. The purpose of undertaking this type of case study is not to generate any theory or to generalize any phenomenon but is purely based upon the researcher’s interest in identifying a particular case’s individuality, peculiarity and normal, everyday aspects (Stake, 2005).

(2) Multiple or collective case study
Multiple case study is the extension of instrumental case study which will be explained in detail in the next point, however, the researcher’s interest in one particular case is less vested. Therefore, several cases are jointly examined “in order to investigate a phenomenon, population, or general condition” (Stake, 2005, p. 173). The cases chosen may be similar or dissimilar to each other and the understanding of the collection of the cases will possibly lead to a larger and deeper understanding of the study (Stake, 2005).

(3) Instrumental case study

An instrumental case study is when the research is undertaken to produce a generalization or to “provide insight into an issue” (Stake, 2005, p. 171). The case chosen to be examined is often representative of other cases, which helps in assisting the researcher understands of related cases, and facilitating the researcher’s pursuit of his/her interests in other phenomena (Stake, 2005).

The purpose of the writer’s study is ultimately to investigate one particular primary school practising the Kodály music teaching method, the data collected from which to be utilized as an indicator to generalize about the efficacy of the Kodály method in other Kodály schools which can then be promoted as a general music education method throughout all government primary schools in Victoria. Therefore, due to the nature of this study, the instrumental case study has been chosen as the most appropriate research methodology to be employed.

- Single case study

In terms of single case study, Stake (2005), argues that what we can learn from a single case that is relevant to the likeness and unlikeness with other cases we are familiar with through comparison. This approach provides an opportunity to collect deep and complex data. The researcher’s study, as well as being an instrumental case study, also comes under the
classification of a single case study because only one particular school is going to be examined. A single case study can offer insight if it is well-chosen and valid. Further, a critical single case study can be one in which a theory/concept can be tested. In some ways this study can be considered a critical case study in which it seeks to chronicle one primary wherein the music program is highly effective and to understand how and why this happens.

- **Reliability, validity, and generalisability**

Stenbacka (2001) stated that as reliability is concerned with measurements, reliability has no place in qualitative research. Validity in qualitative research has been defined in many different ways as the concept is often complex, cannot be simply described, and is questionable in terms of being applicable in qualitative research. However, to qualitative researchers validity is always needed as “some kind of qualifying check or measure for their research” (Golafshani, 2003). Winter (2000), citing Maxwell (1992), acknowledges that there are five types of validity according to varying phases of the research, including Descriptive, Interpretative, Theoretical, Evaluative validity and Generalisability.

Further citing Maxwell (1992), Winter (2000) stated that Generalisability is considered as an aspect that clearly separates qualitative research approach from quantitative research approach.

Qualitative research concerns itself with the meanings and experiences of the ‘whole’ person, or localized culture… [it] almost exclusively limits itself to ‘internal’ generalisations, if needed it seeks to claim any form of generalizability at all (Winter, 2000, n. p. n.).

The question “Do the findings of this particular case apply to all related cases?” often arises when generalizability is involved in case study. The answer is “not necessarily”, as all cases are
different but a detailed explanation of a single case can illuminate other cases, and thus the findings of a single case study can be indicative. It is still arguable that any “generalisable statement” in qualitative research is invalid or inaccurate as the findings of one particular case may not be able to accurately describe the phenomena of other related cases (Winter, 2000, n. p. n.).

According to Crawford (2006), one cannot talk about validity without mentioning two other concepts: internal validity and external validity. Internal validity is maintained if the research design is sound, while external validity is achieved if the sample used for the study is representative of the overall population. If the external validity is good then the results of the study will be more readily generalized to situations, conditions and populations (Wiersma, 2000; Burns, 1995). Various approaches of data collection are recommended to be employed in order to construct validity (Yin, 1984). In this study semi-structured interviews and observations are utilized for the purpose of validity establishment.

- **Triangulation**

Burns (1995) defined triangulation as “the use of two or more methods of data collection in the study of some aspect of human behaviour” and is a “commonly used technique to improve the internal validity” (p. 272). Stake (2005) stated that triangulation is often referred to as a procedure through which researchers use multiple views to explain and illuminate the meaning of any observation or interpretation. By accepting that exact replication of observation or interpretation is not possible triangulation can also be utilized to explicate meaning by recognizing the multiplicity of ways the case is be examined.
Triangulation involves using procedures designed to ensure validity and this is achieved by utilizing a multifaceted approach in collecting data (Stake, 2005). Triangulation is a means by where findings or conclusions are supported by drawing upon evidence from numerous sources, such as interviews, questionnaires, participant observations, other experimenters, etc. Therefore, one particular study is examined from many different angles (Stake, 2005). In accordance with the nature of this study, triangulation will be utilized as part of the primary research methodology.

3. Data collection

This phenomenological research will employ, like many other qualitative methodologies, a number of sources of data including observation and semi-structured interviews. Callaghan (2000) stated that education researchers “use all types of qualitative data (interviews and field observations, documents of all kinds, videotapes), but may also use quantitative data and combine qualitative and quantitative techniques of analysis” (p. 43). However, quantitative data are not collected in this study. In the following, there will be, firstly, consideration of semi-structured interview, and secondly, presentation of observation.

- Semi-structured interviews

Interviews are commonly chosen as a means to collect data in qualitative research, especially in the areas of behavioural and social science. The core of an interview is the question-answer speaking between the interviewer and the interviewee (Mishler, 1991). Structured interview, semi-structured interview and non-structured interview are the three major types of interview research method (Centre for Health Services Development, 2007). According to Burns (1995), interviews have the following strengths:
(a) Flexibility; (b) Response rate; (c) A face-to-face interaction assists in the establishment of rapport and a higher level of motivation among respondents; (d) A useful method when extensive data is required on a small number of complex topics; (e) Probing may be used to elicit more complete response; (f) Observation of the respondent’s non-verbal communication and environment are possible; (g) Greater flexibility is afforded to the respondent; (h) The interviewer is able to control the sequence of the items; (i) This approach is useful in obtaining responses from people who would find a written response impossible; (j) Individualized appreciation can be shown to the respondents (p. 361).

For the purpose of this case study the most appropriate interview type will be semi-structured interview as it is more flexible and focuses on the research topic. Semi-structured interviews target a series of main themes that provide the interviewer with the answers to certain questions from the respondent. Even though the semi-structured interview makes allowances for supplementary information from the respondent, it is important to focus on key themes (CHSD, 2007). Before the interview is conducted, the interviewer sets up a series of questions in accordance with the issues investigated on an “interview schedule” (Smith & Osborn, 2003, p. 56). The interview schedule, however, does not dictate the interview but only provides a guideline instead. In this case study, the primary interviewee was the music specialist at the selected primary school as her perceptions on school music education and practices used in her teaching were the core of the phenomenological research. Supplementary interviews were conducted with several different people at the selected school, including the school Principal, Assistant Principal, violin specialist, and school librarian. Other teachers in the school were invited to participate but chose not to do so. Their views were represented, to some degree, by
the Principal and Assistant Principal. The reason for choosing these people to be interviewed was because every one of them plays a different, yet important role in the school’s music program. Hence, their opinions on the music specialist and the music program, along with their perceptions of school music education were regarded as significantly valuable in terms of gaining a comprehensive and thorough understanding of the subject of the single case study: the music specialist and her music program.

Semi-structured interview is based upon a rather flexible structure. It is conducted through gathering answers of open-ended questions to initially explain the issues being addressed in the study. Bresler (1995) asserted that open-ended interviews allow those interviewed to tap into modes of thought and enable the exploration of detailed experiences that are usual vague but have a profound impact on their lives. Instead of slotting data into pre-established categories, the aim is to uncover meaning of a personal nature. In this case, questions such as “How important do you think music education is at Primary level?” or “What are your feelings regarding classroom practice of the Kodály method?” might be asked initially. In order to pursue further details of the issues in question, the interviewer or interviewee then possibly leads the interview towards other directions within the thematic context of the issue(s) being addressed (Britten, 1995; Smith & Osborn, 2003).

In a semi-structured interview, the investigating topic is determined in advance and helps to set up the initial stage of the data analysis. The questions utilized in semi-structured interview are often open-ended which allow interviewees to perform naturally within the topic and with less hindrance (Burns, 1995; Smith & Osborn, 2003). This type of interview is commonly used when the researcher is clear about the issues being addressed before the research is conducted. Most of the time, the main issues are generated by the problems that the research intends to investigate.
through the study. It is implicit that the issues addressed in semi-structured interviews are commonly understood by both interviewer and interviewee and an atmosphere is to be created within which the interviewee may feel free to “challenge the interviewer’s understandings” at any level of any particular issue (BERA website, 2009, p. 2). This provides some level of clarification when meanings or conjectures are not in concordance between the interviewee and the interviewer. Further, interviewees may be given the questions prior to the interview to trigger reflection and in-depth responses.

To sum up, semi-structured interview “facilitates rapport/empathy, allows a greater flexibility of coverage and allows the interview to go into novel areas, and it tends to produce richer data” (Smith & Osborn, 2003, p. 57).

- Observation

Observation is commonly used in qualitative research, particularly in case studies, and “is a technique derived from anthropology” (CHSD, 2007, p. 2; Burns, 1995). It requires the researcher to immerse him/herself into a group of people in order to explore in detail how they understand their world through “observing what they do and how they relate to each other” on an everyday basis (CHSD, 2007, p. 2). By immersing oneself into the studied group and become a part of the group’s culture without revealing the observer’s identity and purpose of the study, the researcher is able to gather data from an unbiased view point and the data is not usually readily available (Burns, 1995). Through observation, the researcher is also able to experience for him/herself “the subjective dimensions of the phenomena they study” (Johnson & Christensen, 2004, p.18). There are two forms of observation, formal and casual. The formal type requires the observer to “measure the incidence of various types of behaviour during certain time periods” (Burns, 1995). In this qualitative case study, the observer conducted a series of in-depth
observations at the selected primary school, particularly in classrooms and different violin
groups in order to investigate various types of teaching behaviours demonstrated in the music
specialist’s teaching. Hence, the majority of the observations the research was engaged in the
study were qualified as formal observations. The casual form of observation often happens after
the majority of data being collected and is usually completed through a visit (Burns, 1995). The
researcher also employed this type of observation through appointment visits to the particular
school being studied when extra data was required to be obtained.

4. Data analysis - IPA

The collected data and the research findings of the author’s study will be analyzed in accordance
with Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis (IPA). IPA is a comparatively new but
increasingly accepted method of inquiry (Smith, Flowers & Larkin, 2010; Reid, Flowers &
Larkin, 2005). According to Crawford (2006), IPA is commonly used in areas such as “health,
clinical and social psychology, particularly in the UK” (p. 53). Though having its originated in
psychology, IPA has been increasingly taken up by researchers working in related fields of “the
human, social and health sciences” (Smith et al., 2010, p. 1). It has also been successfully
employed in music education research by researchers from the Faculty of Education at Monash
University, Australia (Crawford, 2006).

Smith and Osborn (2003) stated that IPA aims to investigate the participants’ perceptions of their
world, which can be either personal or social. Smith et al. (2010) adds that IPA is a qualitative
phenomenological research method that examines the understanding of people’s most important
experiences in their lives. Following Edmund Husserl’s direction in discovering innate character
or intrinsic quality of “experiential content of consciousness”, IPA does not attempt to classify
particularly lived human experience, however significant, with previously instilled definitions or excessively nonfigurative categories (p. 12). Smith and Osborn (2003) put forth IPA is not a prescriptive approach but is flexible and includes an awareness of the role of the researcher as an interpreter. Smith et al.(2010) further explains that researchers exploring this particular research approach realizes that experience is most likely to be accessed through the participant’s description of the experience; as such, the researcher is required to interpret the experience from the participant’s point of view in order to gain the most accurate and thorough understanding of the experience. IPA is idiographic and aims to capture and explore the meanings that participants give to their own experiences (Smith et al., 2010; Reid, Flowers & Larkin, 2005). It relies upon small samples which are purposefully rather than randomly selected, and is dedicated to detailed investigation of particular cases. Small-sized and sensibly standardized samples allow the researcher to examine both “convergence and divergence” within the samples in detail (Smith et al., 2010, p. 3).

IPA is undertaken on any generated text. Thus, the first step in this analysis is to transcribe the interviews. Once this is completed, the transcripts are read re-read carefully. Marginal notes are made to identify significant aspects the respondents are saying (Smith, Jarman & Osborn, 1999).The notes are then used to begin to identify emergent themes. From there emergent themes more over-arching themes are developed and from this a narrative representation of the participants understanding is created (Willig, 2001). This is written up and direct quotations are used to illustrate specific points. Smith and Osborn (2003) further state that “a detailed IPA analysis can also involve asking critical questions of the texts from the participants, such as the following: What is the person trying to achieve here? Is something leaking out here what wasn’t
5. Selection of research site

As stated in Chapter 1, the school that is the research site for this study, was selected after an online search. It was hoped to locate a primary school where there was a strong music program and it was anticipated that general class teachers would be involved in the delivery of such a program. The researcher is based in the northern suburbs of Melbourne and it was decided that to facilitate frequent visits, the school should be in that geographical area. It was reasoned that a school with a good music program would be presenting music concerts. For this reason, an online search was made using the terms ‘primary school music concerts’ and various names of suburbs. Further the researcher was seeking a state supported school as potentially being more representative of the provision of music in Victorian schools. As a result of this search, one school came to the attention of the researcher. On further investigation via the school website it was discovered that this school had a strong music program and was a state-supported school. Upon investigation it was revealed that the school had made the decision to allocate resources to fund a specialist music educator to run the music program. Having found no state school with an equivalent program offered by general class teachers it was decided that the selected school would be the research site. Before contact with the school could be made, ethical permission was sought from both Monash University and from the Education Department in Victoria (see Appendix A). Having gained ethical permission, the school was contacted and the project was explained to the school principal to gain his permission. At this point, the first site visit occurred.
In this chapter, a discussion of the suitability and applicability of the methodologies employed in the researcher’s research were presented. The nature of the study determined a greater application of the qualitative method to be utilized throughout the entire research. Semi-structured interview and observation were chosen as the most suitable tools in order to facilitate comprehensive data collection. In the area of data analysis, IPA was employed as a means of enabling the author to capture and interpret the information given by respondents as accurately as possible. The next chapter will present a discussion about the history of the inclusion of music education in Victorian primary schools for the purpose of contextualize the case study of the selected primary school’s music program. The Arts in the recently released national curriculum and the Victorian curriculum framework will also be outlined.
Chapter Five

Context for the Research

In this chapter there will be a discussion of the history of primary school music education in Victoria to contextualize this case study of the selected government primary school. The recent national curricular development in the Arts will be outlined to demonstrate what the present expectations in music are and how the selected primary school is positioned in comparison. Finally, the current Victorian curriculum framework (Victorian Essential Learning Standards - VELS) will be summarised. When compared with past and present understandings, it will be evident that the primary school selected for this research is researchable.

1. Primary school music education in Victoria

Educational authorities of the colonial era in Australia were keen to acculturate future generations in as many ways as they could, and music, particularly in the mode of classroom singing, was believed to serve this purpose. Stevens and Southcott (2010) asserted that “the introduction of school music [in Australia] had a strongly utilitarian basis founded on the belief that music could be great value as a humanizing and civilizing influence on society in general and on children in particular” (p. 176).

During the early stages of the development of the educational system, Victoria, along with New South Wales and South Australia, was responsible for its own provision of education at primary level and this has persisted to this very day. The then junior schooling was mainly supported by church entities, owners/managers of private schools and personal tutors (Stevens & Southcott, 2010). In 1851, the dual Denominational and National boards were set up. At the time, music
education was mostly delivered by generalist classroom teachers, who, unfortunately, were lacking in basic music skills and vocal training experience. Subsequently, music as a subject started to lose its place in the general curriculum and was soon reduced to an additional subject status within the extra curriculum at primary schools. It was also around this time that the authorities within the Victorian educational administration made the decision to enlist freelance singing experts to counteract the inadequacies in musical skills and knowledge of generalist classroom teachers (Stevens & Southcott, 2010).

Since 1862, music education in Victorian primary schools, again, started to deteriorate when the combined Denominational and National boards were replaced by the Council of Education. The major cause for this regression was the introduction of a payment by students for the singing tuition they received at school. In fact, the fee system was meant to counterbalance the considerable cost of the maintenance of music specialists – the freelance singing experts - at public schools (Stevens & Southcott, 2010). A decade later, the fee scheme was put to an end when a new system was introduced by the Victorian Education Department, delivering “free, compulsory and secular” schooling (p. 175). As a result, music instruction was provided at no cost at Victorian government schools, being delivered by either singing specialists or general classroom teachers licensed for singing instruction.

Despite the difficulties that the educational administrators had experienced in providing basic education in colonial Victoria, the need to include music education at schools has prevailed as an ongoing issue amongst parents, educational authorities and the public in general (Stevens & Southcott, 2010). When the singing specialists were dismissed from schools on the goldfields in 1859 because of school funding inadequacy, public reaction was one of condemnation. However,
by the end of the 1860s, educational authorities began to acknowledge the recreational importance of music in schools. At the early stage of the development of music curriculum, teaching singing was assumed to be better delivered by way of note instead of by ear, and this assumption was based upon “contemporary English and Irish curricula” (Steven & Southcott, 2010, p. 178). In the 1890s, music still retained its status as a compulsory subject in the curriculum of state schools but was only taught by classroom generalists because of the withdrawal of all paid music specialists due to economic downturn. As a consequence, students were only taught to sing “by ear” rather than “by note”, and furthermore, “the vulnerability of music as a school subject taught by specialists rather than generalists in government elementary schools continues to be a significant factor in school music education to the present day” (Stevens & Southcott, p. 175).

Having been compulsory since 1872, music in schools by the 1920s started to incorporate music appreciation and listening, as well as “percussion band activities” (Stevens & Southcott, 2010, p. 179). Stevens and Southcott (2010), further pointed out that various types of instrumental programs, including “the Manby group violin teaching method in Victoria” were established in schools (Stevens & Southcott, 2010, p. 179). This development was perpetuated with the advent of the school recorder program by the mid 20th century, followed by “the Orff Schulwerk and Kodály approaches in the 1960s and creative compositional approaches from the early 1970s” (p. 179).

In 1872 Victoria became the first colony in Australia to have a compulsory primary schooling system in place. Music was included as a mandatory subject from the very beginning of the establishment of the schooling system, utilizing vocal activities as fundamental teaching methods
(Stevens & Southcott, 2010). However, when Victoria entered the modern era, in particular during the period from 1930s to the 1950s, the development of music teaching in schools was very limited. At that time, the only widely used music teaching resources appeared to be tuning forks and songs printed on the back of the School Papers, with teachers having undergone only little training in music (Strating, 1997). However, there have been some positive aspects gained towards the development of school music teaching at times. In their overview of music in general education, Australian Music Education Information and Resources (AMEIR) (2012) report that under the support of the first Supervisor of Music in Victoria, Alfred B. Lane, in 1923, a group of music educators commenced their secondary and primary teaching at schools. These specialists then formed what is known today as the Music Branch in 1940.

According to Ferris (1998), the very first school recorder program was established in a government primary school in 1947, operating amongst students from grade 3 to 6. The advent of the recorder program in school music education challenged the dominant position that singing had held for a long time and provided a combination of instrumental and vocal methods in school music teaching. However, the recorder program was not the pioneer of school instrumental programs. Fife groups and drum bands had already entered the school music field prior to the recorder’s arrival. Strating (1997) reported that singing materials at schools before the 1940s were only available in folk songs of British and European origin but became strongly reflective of patriotic and nationalistic themes during the 1940s. It was at the same time that the solfa system and staff notation, which had been adopted during the 1920s and 1930s, started to diminish when ABC radio musical broadcasts became widely accessible at most primary schools in Victoria by the late 1940s. Not only did the musical broadcasts have a strong impact on primary music teaching; the ABC song books in conjunction with Teacher’s Handbooks also
proved to be of significant value, offering assistance to teachers who had insufficient music knowledge or teaching experience. Ferris (1998) stated that in the 1960s, recorder learning was required to be taken as a mandatory component of the music education courses by the majority of the teacher trainees in Australia. At the same time, recorder learning became the only instrumental program operating extensively at government primary schools, and had gained strong support from the Education Department Music Branch, “whose staff advised schools on repertoire, tone and technique and ran annual workshops” (Ferris, 1998, p. 68). The thematic change of the school singing materials remained until the 1970s when they shifted the focus to “Australian natural and cultural symbols” with a greater target emphasis on children, and it was around the same time, recorder reached the status of being used equally as much as voice in schools as well as an assistance for music literacy teaching in classrooms (Strating, 1997, p. 3; Ferris, 1998).

From the 1960s and onwards, music education started to develop at Victorian government primary schools, further developing throughout the 1970s and reaching fruition in the 1981 publication *A Guide To Music In The Primary School*. In this publication, recorder was incorporated in the curriculum in conjunction with the use of voice, guitar and percussions (Ferris, 1998; Strating, 1997). This new document paved the way for “the establishment of the Primary Developmental Music Programs and further publication of Music Through Listening and Music Through Playing” (Strating, 1997, p. 7).

The Music Branch that had been established in 1940 was then enlarged in 1975 to accommodate 107 specialist music instrumental staff members, and three years later. Three years later, however, the implementation of a new school system saw the dissolution of the Branch but, at
the same time, a provision of 236 positions of primary school music teachers and “regional music advisers” was created (Australian Music Education Information and Resources (AMEIR), 2012, p. 1). This revised system also failed, however, mainly because the positions once held by generalists specializing in music were replaced by other generalists who specialized in other areas of curriculum (Stevens & Southcott, 2010). Furthermore, all of the teaching positions along with the majority of the consulting positions created in the new scheme only survived a period of four years before being abolished by yet another change in policy in 1982. Most of these music specialists at primary schools either procured “on-staff ‘tagged’ music positions” wherever available or resumed as generalists in the classroom. Further dismantling and phasing out of administrative bodies, central positions of supervision and non-fixed positions of music teaching continued throughout Victoria. On the positive side, however, Strating (1997) informed us that the early 1980s Victorian Ministry of Education set up a series of trial music teaching programs throughout the state under the title of Primary Developmental Music Education Program (PDMP). It was anticipated that music specialists were to work with generalist classroom teachers “within specific networks” in order to create and put into effect educational music programs. Strategies designed to address problems associated with teachers who lacked music knowledge and training experience were finally provided in the pilot programs. Although occasionally diverging from the original mission, the PDMP had a huge influence upon school music education in Victorian primary schools, the effects of which are still felt today (Strating, 1997). In hindsight, it can be seen that a great deal of development has occurred in school music education in Victoria since the beginning of the 20th century. However, the climate of economic volatility and government austerity in the late 1990s put music education at risk of losing ground. Cutbacks at that time saw the dismantling of the Music Branch, reallocation of resources to
schools, increases in class sizes and lack of funding for music specialists. These issues, in conjunction with many others, persist to this very day creating uncertainty for the future of music education in Victorian state primary schools (Strating, 1997).

The three historical lessons which have emerged from the development of implementing “music in compulsory schooling” since the colonial era serve as a guide for policy decision making for today’s school music education (Steven & Southcott, 2010, p. 185). Firstly, there are unavoidable economic limitations governing the provision of primary school specialist music teachers. These constraints in conjunction with changing curricular policy create further vulnerability in delivering school music education at primary level, and this vulnerability remains to this day, with a particular susceptibility to economic recession (Stevens & Southcott, 2010). In agreement with this viewpoint, Strating (1997) warned that, “we are in danger of slipping back to darker times” (p.7). This could be seen in the dismantlement of the former Music Branch, its resources being sold off to schools or channeled elsewhere, enlarged class sizes, and diminished funding for music specialists, as a result of global budgetary stipulations.

A second historical lesson has been learnt from the need for generalist primary teachers to be recipient for extensive and in-depth music education training during both “pre-service and in-service education” in order to optimize their ability to deliver quality school music teaching (Stevens & Southcott, 2010, p. 179). With the provision of adequate levels of generalist teacher training in music, there will be a greater prospect of securing the position held by music in the curriculum. Thirdly, there is another lesson to adhere to, in that advocacy for the compulsory inclusion of music education in the primary level curriculum should be maintained by all music educators. It is a common practice amongst many schools in general, including Victoria, to
categorize music as an Arts subject, thereby devaluing music education and reducing its provision. Stevens and Southcott (2010) rendered a clear and strong criticism in condemning a system that, by neglecting music, fails to provide children with a comprehensive education.

As in a number of other countries, Australia, with a particular focus on Victoria, still suffers from a series of historical and ongoing problems in terms of providing music education in government primary schools. The Victoria Music Workshop Report, commenting on the Stevens report of 2003, observed that students in Victorian schools could have missed out on music education completely within their 13 years school completion. It is recommended that the lessons of the past should be taken into consideration “in the formulation of future policies in school music education” in order to “maintain the musical culture that has taken so long to establish” (Stevens & Southcott, 2010, p. 185; Strating, 1997, p. 7). A recent response to this call has been the attempts to develop a national curriculum.

2. The Arts in the Australian Curriculum

In contemporary societies, perceptions, interpretations and expectations of education are constantly developing. Corollary to this, curricula have been subject to a constant review and restructure (Carlitri, 2011; Mark, 2002; Burton, Horowitz & Abeles, 1999). The word *curriculum* is often understood as a framework or plan for both teaching and learning which involves aims, contents, strategies and assessments generated from the essence of knowledge and skills (Howard, 2003; Pinheiro, 2011). The National Review of School Music Education (NRSME) (in DEST, 2005, p. 41) defines *curriculum* as “a broad educational concept encompassing what is intended to be taught and learnt; what is implemented in the classroom and school; and, what is attained”..

In the same document, attention was drawn to the need for the Australian
Government to assume a direct role in the stimulation and support of quality music education throughout schools at a national level, by way of, for instance, “initiating curriculum projects” (DEST, 2005, p. vi).

In the past twenty years there have been several attempts made by successive federal governments to initiate some form of national curriculum in Australia before this most recent push (Cosaitis, 2011). In 1989 the Hobart Declaration on Schooling clearly stated that, as one of the national goals for schooling, students should develop “an appreciation and understanding of, and confidence to participate in, the creative arts” (Ministerial Council for Education, Early Childhood Development and Youth Affairs, 2011). In the early 1990s, according to the Music Council of Australia (MCA, 2009), the Arts were excluded in deference to the priority placed upon areas such as literacy and numeracy. Despite the fact that the National Affiliation of Arts Educators (NAAE) fought this decision successfully reinstated the Arts and recommended the inclusion of five individual art forms in the Australian national curriculum, a change of federal government in 1993, unfortunately, resulted in the abandonment of the concept of a national curriculum. Thus, the content of school curricula remained the purview of individual State education authorities. MCA (2009) summarized what then occurred. In 2005 the NRSME made nearly 100 recommendations pertaining to music education curriculum which the Federal coalition government began to implement. This process was again stalled by a change in government.

Nonetheless, the desire for an appropriately formulated curriculum across the nation remained. Within this, it was considered vitally important to reform specific disciplines. For example, the then status of school music education in Australia amongst states and territories differed substantially in terms of “relevance, level of detail, usefulness and currency” (DEST, 2005, p.
42). In 2009 the initial Shape papers of the Australian Curriculum for English, Mathematics, Science and History were firstly released in May, 2009. Initially, these four subjects “were the only subjects suggested to go national” (Education Today, 2009, p. 1). This new curriculum was to be “delivered in an online environment for school authorities, schools and teachers for implementation” and the evaluation and review processes have been operating to examine the curriculum “based upon implementation feedback” (Australia Curriculum, Assessment and Reporting Authority - ACARA, 2009, p. 1). It was hoped that the implementation of the Australian curriculum (K-10) would be “well underway in 2013 across the country. For some states and territories, 2011 will be a pilot year, with the experience and advice from participating schools used to guide implementation in the remaining schools in subsequent years” (ACARA, 2009, p. 2).

In May 2009, it was decided by the ministers from state, territory and federal levels that The Arts would also be included in the Australian Curriculum (Education Today, 2009). The process of devising the Australian Arts Curriculum commenced with a paper which positioned key elements, incorporating definition of the Arts, curriculum organization and structure for senior level courses, as well as the relationship of Arts with other areas of learning and disciplines. The draft paper was designed to provide a framework for future Arts education for students from Kindergarten to Year 12 (ACARA, 2010). The curriculum was intended to enable “creative, engaging and rigorous learning for all young Australians” (The Arts - Initial Advice Paper, 2010, p. 1).

According to the Consultation Feedback Report On the DRAFT Shape of the Australian Curriculum: The Arts (ACARA, 2011), the draft paper was released for public consultation between October 2010 and January 2011, garnering 166 written submissions in addition to over
1,600 online questionnaire responses nationwide. Over 50% of the online survey respondents were from New South Wales, and the majority of the respondents represented Visual Arts and Music. Findings, comments, and suggestions for the consultation were provided by three major stakeholders, including individuals, education institutions and arts organizations, and authorities of curriculum and systems at state/territory level. Some directions provided in the draft paper have gained strong support from respondents, such as the individual position the Arts holds in the national curriculum; the inclusion of the five Arts subjects: Dance, Drama, Media Arts, Music and Visual Arts; the importance of all Australian school students being entitled to Arts education in all five forms; and the correlation between the Arts industry and school education (ACARA, 2011).

In response to an analysis of the extensive consultation feedback, the Shape of the Australian Curriculum: The Arts was published on 7 August 2011. This document was “intended to guide the writing of the Australian Arts Curriculum from Foundation to Year 12” with the expansive direction it provided on the “purpose, structure and organization of the Arts Curriculum” (ACARA, 2011, p. 2). The following changes made in the Shape paper can be considered significant:

(a) The language used in the Shape paper has less jargon, and is more straightforward and consistent.

(b) The term Foundation (F) has been used to replace Kindergarten (K) when describing the first year of schooling.
(c) Two generic organizing terms - making and responding - are used as structural components instead of the originally proposed three organizing strands of generating, realizing and responding.

(d) The graphic symbol which represented the recursive and simultaneous intertwining of the three strands was no longer included in line with the conflation of generating and realizing into the simpler ‘making’.

(e) The terms apprehending and comprehending, which were referred to as two “complementary processes” in the draft, have also been removed from the Shape paper (ACARA, 2010).

(f) Years 3-8 Music learning comprised one single band in the draft paper but are subdivided into Years 3-4, Years 5-6, and Years 7-8 in the revised document.

(g) The development of aesthetic knowledge has been described in more detail.

(h) The new Glossary which only contains five key terms represents a marked reduction from the previous one which held 20. This change is contrary, however, to the feedback from respondents which recommended that the list needed to be enlarged to accommodate more specific terms.

Both the draft paper and the Shape paper proposed Arts education for all school students from Kindergarten/Foundation to Year 12, throughout Australia. There are a number of important issues addressed in both papers.

In the draft paper (ACARA, 2010) it was proposed that all school students are entitled to access education in all five art forms with equitable allotment from Kindergarten to Year 8. Schools are to provide programs in all five Arts subjects and to determine how the Arts curriculum is

---

3 The terms Kindergarten, Foundation and Preparatory have been used interchangeably to identify the first year of schooling before students enter Year 1. Primary schools continue to Year 6. Secondary schools encompass Years 7 to 12.
delivered in accordance with the availability of their resources and specialist teacher(s).

Although the final Shape paper (ACARA, 2011) maintains the principle of students’ entitlement to all five art forms during their schooling, this has been reduced to “from Foundation to the end of primary” years. Students at Years 7 and 8 will be given an opportunity to “experience some Arts subjects in greater depth and to specialise in one or more Arts subjects” (p. 4). At this level, schools are not required to provide programs in all five Arts subjects, and may make joint decisions with state/territory authority to determine the delivery of the Arts curriculum. At Years 9 to 12, students are expected to have the opportunity to study one or more Arts subjects as a specialization (Cosaitis, 2011).

Burton, Horowitz and Abeles (1999) asserted that an ideal Arts curriculum is interpreted as one that provides sequential and detailed “teaching in several art forms” for students throughout their entire schooling (p. 44). Burton et al. further argued that school students should be offered “a critical mass of arts subjects” within which students must be enabled by the school to access comprehensive studies across these subjects (p. 45). In this light, the Shape paper could be considered as a step forward from the current Victorian curriculum in which five art forms are only offered as electives at different year levels according to the school’s individual circumstances. According to the Victorian Essential Learning Standards (VELS), schools are only required to choose two from the five art forms to teach, and that is why Dr. Peter Hill, the executive of ACARA, believes that “some students had missed out in the past because the curriculum had been focused on one or two art forms” (Topsfield, 2010, p. 1). Topsfield (2010) in quoting Dr. Hill comments on the new Arts teaching system proposed in the draft Shape paper, saying that “the great benefit about this approach is that by the time students reach the point in their school career where they are given a choice about specializing in one particular art form,
they can make an educated decision” (p. 1). Further, according to Topsfield (2010), the co-chairman of the Australian Teachers of Media, Roger Dunscombe, states that, “the proposed curriculum gave every student a taste of all the art forms” (p. 1). This aligns with the assertion in the Shape paper that all school students in Years F-6 will be able to access the education of all five Arts subjects. MCA (2010) recognizes that this should enable “art forms to support each other” and further assist learning in non-arts subjects (p. 4). Furthermore, it is emphasized that primary learning in five art forms needs to be experienced individually, and therefore a separate curriculum for each art form must be provided (MCA, 2010).

The draft paper (ACARA, 2010) has proposed that the minimum duration of arts learning is to be 160 hours in each year band (K-2, 3-4, 5-6 and 7-8) with accessibility for necessary learning in addition to central learning. In the Shape paper (ACARA, 2011), the allocation of time for Arts education is clearly stated as “a school-based decision” (p. 4). The teaching hours for each year band are suggested in the Shape paper as a guide to the writing of the final National Arts Curriculum. Students from Foundation to Year 2 are entitled to 120 hours across the year band; 100 hours are allowed for Years 3 and 4 students with the same allotment for students at Years 5 and 6; the hours are to be increased to 160 across Years 7 and 8; and students at Years 9 and 10 are also entitled to a total of 160 hours throughout the year band.

Comments on the proposed allotment of time for Arts education have been controversial. On the one hand, Topsfield (2010) maintains that, “The national curriculum will devote as much time to media arts … as it does to traditional arts subjects such as music and visual arts” (p. 1). She further asserts that “Every child from kindergarten to Year 8 will be required to study two hours a week of media, drama, music and visual arts under the next phase of the national curriculum” (p. 1). Within the current curriculum under the VELS system, duration of hours of Arts learning
in each level was not specified, whereas it is clearly defined in both the draft paper and the Shape paper. This could be seen as advantageous as it will provide a minimum time allotment for students to receive quality learning in each art form at each year level. It might also provide a more clearly defined time framework for teachers within which they will be able to devise lesson plans which are more sequential.

On the other hand, with the 100 to 160 hours proposed to cover the entire year band level, it is not specified as to whether it is an overall duration for all Arts subjects or if it is an allotment for each individual art form. According to Marian Strong, President of Art Education Australia, “teachers would have only about 20 minutes a week to devote to each area from kindergarten to year 8” (Arts Education Australia (AEA), 2010, p. 1). Strong further maintains that all five art forms being crammed into two hours per week seems a significant contrast to two hours per week being offered to Geography alone which Strong considered “unteachable” (p. 1). It would seem that the duration of a 160 hour-maximum allocation meant that to cover the overall arts, teaching would need to be distributed amongst five Arts subjects within a time frame of two years. It therefore could be suggested that the duration for teaching each of the five arts could be individualized and possibly extended for greater practicality and efficacy. Commenting further on this issue, the MCA (2010) recognizes that all five art forms will be given equal treatment in terms of time allocation in the draft Shape paper, however, the proposed duration of 160 hours over a period of 24 months, or 36 months for K-2, (i. e., 24 or 16 minutes, respectively, per subject per week) is clearly insufficient. MCA (2010) further states that although equal allotment will be given to music education, ACARA needs to be more forthright in its delivery on a regular basis all year round. Furthermore, ACARA will not be responsible for stipulating the actual teaching time, their proposal for time allocation being regarded as conceptual only. ACARA’s
proposal, however, is not adequate enough to create any satisfactory outcomes in accordance with quality music education, and is therefore considered impractical in realistic terms (MCA, 2010). In tandem with the NAAE, MCA argues that ACARA needs to establish their curriculum on the basis of 3-hourly allocation (i.e., 180 minutes) for all five art forms per week. This equal division will provide an average of 36 minutes for each subject weekly. It is recognized that the time allocation for music education should be increased as students advance from one year-level to the next (MCA, 2010).

In the draft Shape paper, it was proposed that students at primary levels beyond year 2 will have access to the Arts through both “integrated curriculum and art-form-specific approaches” (ACARA, 2010, p. 10). As will be seen the allocation of time for music at the selected primary school in this case study compares favourably with the national recommendations. It could be argued that implementing “art-form-specific approaches” in schools during early years of schooling will enable students to build a solid foundation in each of the five major Arts subjects, giving them the access to quality and professional learning in specific arts areas. According to the current curriculum in Victoria, VELS takes an integrated curriculum approach for students at all year levels, whereas the proposed approach in the draft paper is to be implemented in conjunction with art-form-specific curriculum. However, in the recently released Shape paper, the “art-form-specific” curriculum has not been offered for students’ studies at primary level. Only at Years 7-8 are students to be provided the opportunity to embrace Arts studies in greater detail and to “specialise in one or more Arts subjects” (ACARA, 2011, p. 4). The combined method proposed in the draft paper is considered a more suitable approach, especially for students in primary years, in terms of satisfying their needs for experiencing Arts learning in both a formal and specific manner within an integrated and specialized form. However, at the
selected primary school, it appears that the school has elected two Arts taught by specialists (Visual Arts and Music).

It seems to be a significant advancement that the draft Shape paper (ACARA, 2010) has proposed that the future National Arts Curriculum will be devised to accommodate both specialized arts teachers and generalist classroom teachers. This aspect is confirmed in the recently released Shape paper. The underlying rationale of this proposal will hopefully provide a level playing field so that generalists will have greater encouragement to enable them to deliver music teaching more confidently in accordance with their level of musical skills. This also will hopefully culminate in a more balanced and consistent delivery of quality music education on a national level.

The use of the word ‘imagination’ in the draft paper appears rather frequently but has been reduced dramatically in the recently released Shape paper. It is universally recognized that the arts and imagination are inextricably linked. For example, it states that students will “imagine” and create musical projects through experiencing music composition, improvisation, and arrangement; students “imagine” and discover music works through body movement, vocal experience, and instruments playing; students “imagine” and act in response to both others’ and their own music works by thoughtfully listening throughout the entire class by way of their complete involvement (ACARA, 2010, p. 17). In this aspect, the selected primary school is meeting the expectations of the national curriculum statements.

The use of the word ‘imagine’ might be considered somewhat abstract and therefore capable of creating confusion in terms of teachers’ evaluation and assessment of students’ performance. The word ‘imagine’ does provide a positive perspective when encouraging students to picture the
ideation of their intention to produce music as an antecedent to actual music production and appreciation. Conversely, the word has been de-emphasized in the recently released Shape paper to the point where throughout the entire paper it is only mentioned three times.

It appears that the importance of music education has been strongly recognized in both papers. The draft paper maintains that music is an individual art form as well as a means of connecting human thoughts and activities with the world. Music learning enhances school students to understand better and more deeply about the meaning of the existence of music and how human beings “experience, engage with and interpret” the world through music (ACARA, 2010, p. 17). The draft (ACARA, 2010) asserts that “Young Australians need to learn how to make and read complex meaning in art work” through being exposed to both individual learning and group learning under continuous and progressive music instructions (p. 21). The draft also states that the learning of music is ongoing, requiring students to reproduce their techniques, contents, and comprehension at standards of ever-increasing strength and sophistication throughout their educational journey (ACARA, 2010). In the recently released Shape paper (ACARA, 2011), music is described as “an aural art form” and will be explored and studied by students in conjunction with all other Arts subjects (p. 14). As will be seen, the emphasis on aural understanding underpins the music program at the selected primary school.

In The Arts - Initial Advice Paper drafted in early 2010, each arts form in the draft Shape paper has been defined and overviewed in order to clarify its contribution to arts learning for all Australian school children. Though these definitions did not actually appear in the recently released Shape paper, they are considered useful. Respondents to the Consultation Feedback Report (ACARA, 2011) noted the importance of identification of developing particular music skills for each band; inclusion of clearly expressed references pertaining to aural and listening at
each year band; incorporation of students’ music appreciation experience as audience members; and the utilization of both traditional and contemporary music technology and terminology.

The draft Shape paper (ACARA, 2010) further stressed the importance of music learning by stating that people’s beliefs and behaviours can be formed by the engagement with music and the results can be seen at very early periods during human development. Music, as an all-encompassing characteristic of present-day life, can satisfy people’s various needs for psycho-emotional, bodily and cognitive development at differing stages throughout the lifespan.

Engagement in music is playing a significant role in this highly technological world as our various daily activities are both supported and accompanied by it and many of the memorable moments of one’s life could not be notated without it (ACARA, 2010). All of these aspects of music and its value will be evident in the data presented subsequently.

- **Structure, scope and sequence of the Australian Arts Curriculum**

In both the draft and the final Shape paper, a structure, scope and sequence for the Australian Arts Curriculum are considered essential. This structure should recognize the individuality of each art form and its unique characteristics in terms of terminology, knowledge, learning process, techniques and so forth. Furthermore, the structure also identifies the connectivity between the Arts and the common expectation that in all forms of Arts learning there needs to be making and responding. This practical emphasis is identified as essential in effective school music programs.

(1) The rationale of forming the structure of the Australian Arts Curriculum

The “key question” of “What do we do when we engage in the Arts?” provided in the draft paper forms the underlying impetus for forming the proposed organizing strands (ACARA, 2010, p. 7).
This key question is the fundamental motivation for identifying an organizational structure which is able to successfully direct arts education in state schools. In addition, it could be assumed that this key question is applicable to both arts learners and arts educators. Primarily, in order to be able to provide a practical, reliable and effective arts education system, the curriculum must be built upon factual knowledge of what students should achieve and what they are able to do during their arts learning process (National Standards for Arts Education (NSAE), n. y., p. 2). Knowing the answer to the question “What do the students do when they engage in the Arts?” will then entail the other important question: “What do the teachers do when we engage in teaching the Arts?” thus enabling teachers to provide appropriate arts education to better serve the needs of students. This second question, then helps us determine “what a good education in the arts should provide [that being] a thorough grounding in a basic body of knowledge and the skills required both to make sense and make use of the arts disciplines” (NSAE, p. 2).

To be able to build a curriculum which enables the delivery of the aforementioned ‘good education’ system, would necessitate recognizing the current problems which Crabbe (2010) believes mainly concern the inconsistency amongst the current arts curricula implemented in different states. She claims that, “across Australia there is no coherence in the music curricula used by different systems in different states. Once music is firmly included as a key learning area in the National Curriculum, the Australian Government must ensure that a music curriculum for the whole country is created by the National Curriculum Board” (p. 1). This sentiment may have prompted Professor McGaw, Chair of the National Curriculum Board, when he said that the benefits of a national curriculum are significant, including consistency across Australia for both students and teachers who move states as well as the possibility of
achieving a higher quality curriculum by drawing on expertise across the nation

*(Education Today, 2009, p. 1)*.

Despite its absence in the final Shape paper, these are still important concerns.

(2) The structure of the Arts curriculum

The writers of the national curriculum documents were aware that in many schools, Arts curriculum would be delivered by generalist teachers. To avoid ambiguous and contradictory terms, non arts-specific language was used, such as “generating, realizing, responding – incorporating apprehending and comprehending”, throughout the draft (ACARA, 2010, p. 8). Ultimately, the Shape paper employed two organizers, “making and responding” (ACARA, 2011, p. 5). These will form a structure which is suitable for generalist classroom teachers. The organizers are overarching and may occur in a cyclical manner rather than as individual straight lines, meaning that the process of one organizer sometimes involves the addition of the other as they are interdependent in arts learning.

The draft paper (ACARA, 2010) provided a table in which specific examples of activities are given to each art form in order to assist teachers to understand the three strands more appropriately. These examples are specified in the categories of Generating and Realizing, but all art forms share the same examples in Responding as it is believed that “responding activities are common across all art forms” (ACARA, 2010, p. 9). In the Shape paper (ACARA, 2011), as mentioned previously, only making and responding are maintained. It asserts that in the Arts curriculum, “*making* will be described in art form-specific ways within each Arts subject” whilst “*responding* will be described in more general terms, which will be applied across the five Arts subjects” (p. 5). These ideas offer teachers useful guidance in arts programs but are very broad.
Discussion about National Curriculum

Whether a national curriculum should be specific or general is often debated amongst educators. Ferrari (2010) argues that a national curriculum should encompass central learning elements in each subject, therefore, detailed descriptions of knowledge were not considered necessary. He maintains that “the Australian curriculum would set out an essential common framework that allowed the states and territories to provide more detailed syllabuses, and schools and teachers the flexibility to tailor it to suit their students” (p. 1) Commenting on this, NRSME (DEST, 2005) asserts that the interpretations of the actual meaning of curriculum generate confusion amongst educators. On the one hand, it is expected that curriculum should provide specific detail in content, whilst on the other hand, there is the expectation that curriculum should target wider, more generalized conceptual descriptions (DEST, 2005). Adding to this point of view is the contribution of a music teacher quoted by the MCA (2010):

Music learning in the arts cannot be described. The curriculum is ultimately developed by teachers in the classroom and shaped by the students themselves…there is a fantasy abroad that a curriculum must afford all teachers this freedom and therefore should not be detailed (p. 9).

However, some other teachers offering their opinions to the MCA have said that the statements and standards for achievement should be specified for each year level in the National Curriculum, otherwise the document would appear “so broad as to be utterly meaningless” as what the VELS system is (p. 9). Ferrari (2010) observed that ACARA had first provided a curriculum which was overly detailed, advocating greater content and eliminating the freedom for implementing the curriculum in accordance with each state’s particular educational circumstances. The overall
consensus amongst educators of core subjects is that the new curriculum is overly crammed with subject matter and does not allow enough time for “deeper and more extensive study” (Ferrari, 2010, p. 1). This somewhat critical viewpoint raises the issue that the future National Arts Curriculum should provide an overall direction of educational efficacy without creating any possibility of constraining the individual’s delivery of education when adapting the curriculum. This is consistent with the current National Standards for Arts Education in the United States which provides a vision of competence and educational effectiveness, but without creating a mold into which all arts programs must fit” (NSAE, no year, p. 3). Demonstrably, tensions exist concerning just what a curriculum should encompass.

The Shape paper is structured around the generic organizers, the key elements which have provided a broad, yet definitive guideline for future arts learning. At the same time the Shape paper does not seem to create any possible constraints for the implementation of the curriculum in each state. In Australia the states and territories are responsible for the implementation of the curriculum. The delivery of Arts education is also to be determined by schools rather than standardized curriculum governance (ACARA, 2010). This approach, it would seem, is left to the flexibility of each and every school’s own particular policy, rather than stipulating a central uniform approach which is less practicable in delivering quality arts education at all schools on a national basis (Cosaitis, 2011).

It would seem that the reality of Arts education being delivered by both generalist classroom teachers and specialists in Australia calls for a sensible division between both specific and generalized contents in any future national curriculum in The Arts. Major issues which need to be addressed include the appropriation of time allotment for each individual art form; utilization of language which accommodates both specialists and generalist teachers; incorporation of
3. The Arts in the Victorian Essential Learning Standards (VELS)

In Victoria, the current curriculum guidelines are the Victorian Essential Learning Standards (VELS). The Arts (Dance, Drama, Media, Music and Visual Arts) are considered to have some commonalities as well as individual identities.

The following is a brief outline of the learning focuses the five Arts covered in VELS:

- In Drama, students work as an ensemble to explore cultural diversity by sharing experiences and observations through improvisation and role-play about a familiar situation, maintaining a diary of personal reflections throughout their performance making.

- In Art, following several lessons exploring line, tonal rendering, perspective and foreshortening as ways to represent and define form, students work from direct
observation of people/places/objects and create the illusion of space and form on a two-dimensional surface.

- In Dance, students learn and present dance sequences from different cultures and styles.
- In Media, students video or photograph two alternate interpretations of a short visual narrative, to present the story from the point of view of two characters, using variations in lighting, camera angle and shot types.
- In Visual Communication, students explore the potential of symbols and cartoons and elements of shape, line and colour to fulfill a design brief.
- In Music, they listen to and discuss excerpts from music that explores the aural aesthetics of musical representations of air and earth.

In order to demonstrate these skills, students will be able to, for example, use processes of rehearsal, reflection and evaluation to develop skills in refining and shaping their works to effectively communicate their intended aims, and experiment with imaginative ways of creating solutions to set tasks. They maintain a record of their exploration and development of ideas and problem solving processes; for example, in a visual diary, on video or in an electronic journal.

In the Standards, Music belongs to the domain of the Discipline-based Learning strand and has two dimensions:
a. Creating and making (focusing on ideas, skills, techniques, processes and performances and presentations)

b. Exploring and responding (focusing on context, interpreting and responding, criticism and aesthetics).

For Levels 1, 2 and 3 (Preparatory, Years 1-2 and Years 3-4 respectively), students should experience Creating and Making in the performing Arts (Dance, Drama and Music) and Visual Arts (Art, 2-D/3-D and Media) disciplines, either individually or in combination. Standards for the exploring and responding dimension are introduced at Level 3. At Level 4 (Years 5-6) and 5 (Years 7-8), students should have continuous individual and combined experience in at least two Arts disciplines (Dance, Drama, Media, Music and Visual Arts/Visual Communication). At Level 6 (Years 9-10) opportunities should be provided for students to undertake sequential development of learning in the Arts disciplines they have studied in Levels 4 and 5 (Victorian Curriculum and Assessment Authority (VCAA), 2005b).

It is clear that the language used in VELS for the discussion of musical ideas is neither detailed nor musically specified. That is to say, only the most general musical terminology is used, and consequently, music teachers do not get enough real information in order to guide their teachings (Southcott & Hartwig, 2005). Watson and Forrest (2005) agreed that, “fundamental music content matter is no longer explicit for the teacher” (p. 275). This new curriculum was required
to be implemented by all schools in Victoria in 2006 after the initial year of validation. In VELS, the learning focus and its corresponding progression points given for Music “are very general and open to wide interpretation” (Southcott & Hartwig, 2005, p. 144). When Music is addressed on its own with more specific expectations, it is again grounded into non-musical terminology. Southcott and Hartwig (2005) further stated,

In Victoria, there was once a music syllabus that was outcomes-based and written using tonic sol-fa terminology – something that a Kodály teacher would recognize and, with some amendment, employ (p. 147).

In the selected primary school, two of the five art forms – Music and Visual Arts - have been chosen to be taught, but both by specialists. Drama and Dance are also included in the music program but within a limited range in accordance with the needs for the teaching of music. The specialist-operated music program has been running at the selected school since the music specialist’s arrival about 14 years ago. Every student at this school receives a 50-minute music class on a weekly basis. The music curriculum is regarded as highly effective and comprehensive, encompassing major components of music literacy, singing, music appreciation, and creativity. Both the teaching approaches advocated by Kodály and Orff have been extensively and successfully adapted at different levels in accordance with various teaching objectives. In addition to the incorporation of percussion instruments in all music classes, a sophisticated
instrumental program has also been running as an important section of the music program throughout the years. Recorder, guitar and violin are the three major instruments involved in the instrumental program, and the user-pays-oriented violin groups have been regarded as a feature of the school’s music program, if not of the entire school. The full-time music specialist is a highly qualified musician, experienced music educator and a successful music education advocate. Her excellence in music teaching abilities in conjunction with continuous outstanding teaching outcomes have allowed her expectations of students’ performance and achievement to not only meet the standards suggested in both the national curriculum and VELS, but also to exceed them.

In this chapter, a discussion of the history of the inclusion of music education in Victorian primary schools was presented. In addition, the recently released the *Shape of the Australian Curriculum: The Arts* as well as the Arts in Victorian Essential Learning Standards have been outlined. In the following chapter, an introduction of the selected primary school, the music specialist and the music program will be presented. Opinions on the school’s music program and the specialist provided by different parties involved in the program will also be the focus of the next chapter.
Chapter Six

The Music Program at Happyrock Primary School

In this chapter there will be an introduction of the selected primary school, the music specialist and her music program. Opinions provided by the school Principal, Assistant Principal, violin specialist and school librarian on the school’s music program and the music specialist will also be demonstrated.

1. Introduction to Happyrock Primary School

Located in a residential area in the north-western suburbs of Melbourne near Tullamarine Airport, Happyrock Primary School (HPS) was established in 1970. The school is situated beside a local Secondary College, diagonal to a local Kindergarten, with which they share a history of partnership over the years. The suburb in which the school resides has a large number of families with young children, with two other primary schools nearby, one a state school and the other private. The current enrolment at HPS lies between 410 and 420 covering year levels from Preparatory to 6. The class setting at HPS includes both individual classes and combined classes. For instance, there are three Year 3/4 classes and two 5/6 classes currently in operation.

The website of HPS advocates that its core purpose is the provision of a safe and secure learning environment in which students’ academic, social, physical and emotional wellbeing are supported, nurtured and developed. (The website is not identified to maintain the anonymity of this study). The school offers a comprehensive and sequential curriculum based on the Victorian Essential Learning Standards. The school is well-resourced, as are its classroom programs. The goal of HPS is to ensure that students realise their full potential, in an inclusive environment that
encompasses both special needs students and high achievers. Specialist programs provided at
HPS include LOTE (Language Other Than English) - Italian, ESL (English as a Second
Language), Physical Education, Visual Arts, and Performing Arts.

There are three well maintained buildings in the school, including a newly established
multipurpose building which accommodates a gymnasium and special rooms for Music and
LOTE. A computer equipped Library, ICT Centre, canteen and areas for general activities are
also available for students at all grade levels. Classrooms include central heating, air
conditioning, and wall-to-wall carpet. Junior classrooms include decked al fresco area
extensions. When visiting the school the corridors are decorated with children’s art works and
photographs of past achievements. The school grounds are well maintained and fully equipped
with multiple sporting and recreation areas, much of which is protected from the elements by
extensive shaded shelters. A central feature of the school grounds comprises a Market Garden
which has a curricular focus on students’ cultivation of fruit and vegetables.

Happyrock Primary School staff members are professional and caring, valuing the provision of
high standard education and student wellbeing. This culture is enhanced by participating parents
in all areas of the school’s programs, including Parents and Friends association, classroom
programs, committees, School Council, canteen and a variety of other school operations serving
the overall functioning of the school. The school takes pride in its social and convivial
atmosphere and the fine reputation it has earned within the community. HPS maintains a strong
belief in the bond between the family and the school as an integral influence upon children’s
learning and development.
When walking in the school, the first impression one may get is the level of tidiness, cleanliness and orderliness. The school Principal is very friendly and hospitable, upon initial meeting expressing his great appreciation for the music specialist’s hard work in music teaching and the considerable effort she has contributed towards the school’s development. On the school website there are photographs including five of which are music activities. The music program, referred to as the Performing Arts Program on the website, is regarded as a major focus of the school curriculum and consists of both vocal and instrumental learning activities. In conjunction with annual concerts, senior/junior/chamber choirs and tuition in violin, guitar, recorder and percussion are conducted on a regular basis. This chapter will present general understandings of the school music program at HPS as held by the music specialist, school Principal, Assistant Principal, violin specialist, school librarian and the students in Year 4.

2. Introduction of the music specialist

At a very early age, the music teacher, now middle-aged, had a strong inclination towards learning music. A major influence in her desire to practise music came from her church wherein she was heavily involved in singing. Though willing to pursue singing, she was directed by her first private music teacher to take piano lessons instead as, at the age of ten, it was decided she was not ready for vocal training. She began piano lessons in conjunction with a small portion of singing under private tuition. In Year 8, she began to learn violin at high school wherein a comprehensive music instrumental program was offered to every student. Her lack of commitment to her piano studies saw her failing her Grade 6 exam, but did eventually attain Grade 7 under a new instructor whilst completing Year 12. After her graduation at high school she was admitted to the University of Adelaide where she completed a Bachelor of Music.

\[\text{Grading performance qualifications offered by the Australian Music Examination Board}\]
majoring in Music Education. Her tertiary studies provided an ideal opportunity to indulge in her passion for playing a variety of musical instruments, culminating in the completion of an Honours Degree, first class, in Music Education. The music teacher began teaching piano on a private basis for local children when she was in her mid-teens. In her first year of undergraduate studies, she was conducting choral activities at local schools. Her primary school teaching experience was gained whilst completing her Bachelor Degree during what she terms ‘teaching weeks’, which involved teaching once a week over a rather lengthy period.

Following her Honours Degree, the music teacher completed a Diploma of Education at Adelaide College of the Arts and Education before moving to Melbourne where her teaching career continued at various schools for approximately eleven years. For practical reasons which suited the previous school during her 11-year term, the music teacher took on recorder learning under two different tutors, achieving Grade 8 before commencing studies in AMusA. It was also during this time that she was heavily immersed in a number of Orff and Kodály training courses and workshops at various levels. This immersion provided the rationale for her to recognize the need for seeking teaching methods that would assist in her future teaching. Subsequently, her engagement in training courses prepared her well for her eventual music teaching career. After this the music teacher took family leave but was largely involved in private teaching during this time. Her return to school teaching was on a part time basis. Her current position with HPS extends over a 14-year period. When she initially arrived at Happyrock Primary School, a music program was already in operation. The music teacher was appointed to maintain the pre-existing program but found it necessary to institute her own teaching methods in order to fulfill the requirements of the school’s development. She has enjoyed her tenure at HPS to this very day.

---

5 Associate in Music Australia, a high level performance qualification offered by the Australian Music Examination Board.
and is prepared to continue her career at this school for as long as she can for a number of reasons. Firstly, the music program has been established and maintained according to her own design; secondly, the support she has received from both the Principal and the staff has proved invaluable; thirdly, the relationship which has been cultivated between her and the students is precious to her; and finally, the flexibility of the position enables her to fulfill her roles in both career and family.

3. An overview of the music program at Happyrock Primary School

The music program at Happyrock Primary School (HPS) was established some thirteen years ago by a classroom teacher who felt strongly about the need for having music education at the school. Over the years, the music program has been amended, developed and refined by the current music specialist in accordance with the school’s mission statement, students’ background and the local community’s culture. The program has now become an essential and prominent component of both the curriculum and the school’s profile. Weekly-based classroom music tuition is offered to all students at the school by the music specialist. Musical instruments are also introduced in the classes, including tuned and non-tuned percussion, guitar and recorder. Students from Years 3 (7-8 years old) and above are given the opportunity to participate in group violin classes on a ‘user-pays’ basis. The school also enjoys a comprehensive choral training program consisting of three major choirs. In conjunction with the Junior and Senior choirs, which are compulsory for all students from Years 3 to 6, there is an audition-based chamber choir which is also run by the music specialist.

Performing Arts holds an important place in the school curriculum, providing opportunities for all students to participate in regular performances in front of a variety of audiences on different
occasions, including annual concerts, school assemblies, and numerous community events. Furthermore, the music teacher (Music Teacher Interview (MTI), 15. 12. 2011) states that the music program at Happyrock Primary School not only focuses on developing students’ performing abilities, but also aims to establish and enhance students’ multiple music skills in various ways. Music making, in conjunction with music literacy and music appreciation, is introduced to students as early as preparatory level. The difficulty and complexity increase in accordance with the development of students’ musical skills, knowledge and understanding through their sequential learning. By the time students reach Year 3, their ability in music-making is sophisticated enough to enable them to accomplish difficult tasks in composing, improvising and arranging activities. For example, students in Year 4 (8-9 years old) are able to compose a double-melody piece in rondo form with pentatonic notes with the rather complicated rhythm patterns learnt previously. The task is to be accomplished by students in groups of three or four with the assistance of two xylophones in each group, and is to be completed by the end of a school term. Each group’s progress is recorded, saved, and played back on the music teacher’s laptop computer on a weekly basis. The record of the final version of each group’s composition, along with other groups’ records, will then be compiled and produced into a CD for each student to keep and appreciate. Through the engagement of the entire process, students are given opportunities to gain experience in music language learning, music appreciation, music-making, instrument playing, music recording and editing and, more importantly, being a team member.

Developing music literacy also holds a focal point in the music program at HPS. The music teacher asserts that the development of listening, reading and writing skills is foremost considerations of any music education, particularly at her school (MTI, 15. 12. 2011). Aural activities not only enable students to learn classroom music effectively, but also establish a solid
foundation to support students’ instrumental learning and choral activities. To ensure the quality and effectiveness of students’ violin learning and choral activities, music literacy has been a major focus in every component of the music curriculum, particularly in lower grades’ classroom music teaching. Activities involving reading and writing rhythms, notations, and sections of songs, as well as sound discrimination, imitation, comparison and reproduction, and so on are continually stressed in every music class from preparatory level to Year 6. Students are also constantly engaged in singing songs, echoing vocal or instrumental phrases on voice or instruments, and producing sound effects to enact scenarios.

According to the 2012 Term 1 Music Curriculum which will be presented in Chapter 7, students at preparatory level are to visualize, listen to, read, and write rhythm names of ta, titi, and za. By the end of the third school term, students are expected to identify learnt songs from reading rhythms on flashcards, and in the fourth term, simple rhythm patterns are to be recognized and copied in writing by the students. At Year 1 level, the music specialist leads the class to read rhythms of known songs with the addition of sol-fa. Line and space notes on staff are also introduced in the first school term. Plastic staff sheets are provided on which students can place special stickers to familiarize themselves with line and space notes. Singing names sol, mi and la are introduced and consolidated through the second and third terms, and students are to copy the notes onto the plastic staff sheets from the whiteboard, eventually transferring them to written notes on manuscript. Two-count note and tie are also the learning elements during this period but with concentration on the relationship between symbol and sound. By the end of the fourth term, students should be able to write songs, e.g. Bee Bee, Kangaroo, Mr. Sun, etc., with both rhythm patterns and notes, on the whiteboard with the teacher instead of in their notebook by themselves. In Year 2, students are to revise writing of sol-mi and sol-la songs with rhythms, and to learn the
reading and writing of the rhythm name *tikatika*. First beat accent is introduced through visualizing teacher’s demonstration, and when simple time signature is taught only one number is introduced. By the end of the fourth term, students are expected to read and write themes from previously learnt songs and new Christmas songs. In Year 3, music literacy places its focus on reading and writing sections of songs students have sung previously and the simple pieces they play on the recorder. Students are encouraged to read simple rhythm patterns on the whiteboard and transfer them onto body percussion and un-tuned percussion instruments. They then are led to read simple melodies and present them on glockenspiels and recorders. The drawing of treble clef is also taught in the first term of the school year. In Year 4, Mozart becomes the central theme of the music course, hence, students are required to write and sing melodies written by Mozart in accordance with their level of musicianship. The other focal point at this year level is 12-Bar Blues, with the expectation that students are to write out basic patterns of this music form by the end of the second term. In Years 5 and 6, music literacy is enhanced through the learning of a complex piece, e.g. Marimba March, in conjunction with the compositional activities on various topics. In the first term of Year 6, students are to write the opening to Rock Around the Clock. During the interim prior to their graduation, music literacy places its entire focus on compositional activities in various forms.

The HPS music program is characterized by its extensive incorporation of a broad range of music learning elements, and is taught by the music specialist who has expertise in recognizing different levels of achievement amongst students. High achievers are constantly challenged and refined whilst maintaining their passion for music performance. Furthermore, this music program focuses on teamwork, so much so that high achievers, who the music specialist understands, characteristically have an inclination for solo performance, are encouraged to work and interact
with others to make music together whilst never losing their advanced level of music performance individuality.

4. Opinions on the school’s music program

Apart from the music specialist herself, other participants in this study, including the school Principal, the violin specialist, the Assistant Principal, the librarian, and students, are also essential in terms of maintaining and enhancing the music program. The opinions of all these interviewees will be incorporated into the thematically presented discussion of this music program. There will be a brief introduction of each individual and their broad views.

(1) The school Principal

- Introduction

The school Principal described himself as having a rather limited music education background. Despite having received very little formal music education, he has always felt an enthusiastic appreciation of music and in his own words has “a fairly eclectic taste in music” (Principal’s Interview (PI), 17. 08. 2011). Throughout his primary education at a Catholic school, music was only taught once a fortnight and only consisted of singing. He described that the songs taught were either traditional or religious. In his secondary school which was also Catholic, he only received music education in years 7 and 8. During his Diploma of Education years at a teachers’ college, the music education he received he considered unremarkable, consisting of theory “with a little bit of practice in classrooms”, which he felt was somewhat inadequate (PI, 17. 08. 2011). As a teacher, in his previous schools the Principal experienced different examples of music programs in each school. In his own case he was a classroom teacher and music education was relegated to specific music teachers responsible for music programs. The Principal is grateful for
the *Building the Education Revolution*\(^6\) program which has provided the school with a much needed gym, with additional rooms which have been put to good use accommodating a few other subjects, including music. Prior to the establishment of this new building, music had always been taught in a multi-purpose room inside the main teaching area. With the facilitation of the gym, music could now be taught in a privately remote area away from other classrooms so that noise interference was no longer a problem. Consequently, this allowed the music teacher to deliver music lessons in an unrestricted environment which provided all the freedom and scope she required.

- **Opinion on the school’s music program**

According to the school Principal, he inherited the music program at Happyrock Primary School when he became Principal three years ago (PI, 17.08.2011). He states that he is only too happy to continue in the tradition of his predecessor and maintain the wonderful music program his music specialist has so skillfully created and perpetuated. He believes that the program is well structured and comprehensive, engendering music appreciation, skills, singing and various other learning forms. In his own words, the music program at Happyrock “is just magic” (PI, 17.08.2011). The Principal makes no attempt to hide his passion and exuberance for the school music program and his recognition of the pervasive effect it has had on his students and the school’s remarkable reputation.

- **Opinion on the music specialist**

The Principal was emphatic in his appraisal of his music specialist who is in charge of the overall program. He describes her in glowing terms, particularly in reference to her promotion of the

---

\(^6\)The BER program is the single largest element of the Australian Government’s $42 billion Nation Building, with around 24,000 projects to be delivered in every community across Australia (DEEWR, 2011, p 1).
school music program “at every possible opportunity” (PI, 17. 08. 2011). He draws attention to how she is constantly approaching him (the Principal) whenever there is a special event at the school, and how she is proactive and always trying to utilize the school music program to accommodate his plans to enhance the school. The music teacher has also brought to his attention cases where children of challenged socio-economic background who show potential of musical talent are recommended for deferential consideration in terms of financial support, thus enabling them to pursue their musical aspirations. One girl, who is currently enrolled in the top group of the violin program, is experiencing difficulties with getting financial support from her family in order to continue the violin learning. Unlike other beginners, this student only joined the program when she was in Year 4 which was a year later than others, but she had managed to jump two levels within a short period of time to be in the top group. Because of her talent and keenness of learning violin, the music specialist had decided to work with the Principal and the student’s family in terms of providing any possible support to enable this student’s stay in the program. Till this very day, this student is still in the program enjoying her lessons.

- Opinion on performances and community’s response to the music program

The Principal believes that the music program also enables his school to be prominent in the community by virtue of public concerts and various performances in shopping centres, retirement villages and kindergartens. In terms of performances within the school, the local high school’s auditorium has been used for their annual concerts. The Principal was exceptionally proud of how the concerts are arranged with mixed year levels, creating a highly successful support system between younger and older primary students. He also talked about the Buddy
Program\(^7\) in place in his school which involved partnering preparatory children (‘preppies’\(^8\)) with Year 6 children. The rationale for this was explained by the fact that the Year 6 students were graduating from the school whilst the preppies were finishing their very first year of schooling, “so it is more of a celebration thing”, and, in his opinion, music activities provide these students the best opportunity to implement the Buddy Program (PI, 17. 08. 2011).

The Principal is especially proud of the extremely positive feedback he gets from the parents of the school music performances. He recalls with great enthusiasm how a particular performance combined elements of the visual arts and the performing arts, where children were dancing and singing whilst displaying the masks they had made for the performance. The next day, the school’s telephone line was kept constantly busy with comments of praise from numerous parents, regaling the performance with “that was magic, that was magic, that was magic” (PI, 17. 08. 2011). The Principal was also keen to point out that at no stage has there been any parent who has complained about their children’s participation in the music program as having been at the expense of their numeracy and/or literacy education.

(2) Assistant Principal

- Introduction

The Assistant Principal (AP) joined the team five-and-a-half years ago. Her role at Happy Rock Primary School covers many areas, but her major duties include daily organization, timetabling, curriculum development, professional development and learning, and the student welfare program. The AP position at Happy Rock has been her very first principal role in her entire teaching career, and prior to this she was an acting leading teacher at the previous school.

---

\(^7\) A system whereby upper graders participate in, or complete activities/projects with their partnered lower graders at primary schools.

\(^8\) ‘Preppies’ is Australian slang for children in the Preparatory year of schooling, age from 4 to 5.
However, she was the Acting School Principal at Happyrock Primary School for eight months covering the interim between the previous principal’s departure and the current principal’s arrival.

Personally, the AP enjoys quite a rich musical background because of her family’s influence. She plays piano and guitar, and was very interested in dancing at one stage. “But I haven’t done anything useful in music”, she jokingly says, “apart from supporting music programs in schools” (Interview with Assistant Principal (IAP), 05. 03. 2012). However, the music education she received at primary school was rather basic, which she substantiates by saying “We were like all the 50s and 60s products - we just listened to the broadcasts” (IAP, 05. 03. 2012.). She did have appreciable experience in music learning at a public secondary school she went to, recognizing, however, that “that is not the case for all children. That was more luck with a very interested music teacher and me as an individual but not something that was born with the system that promoted that” (IAP, 05. 03. 2012). The AP completed her initial tertiary education at The Teachers’ College prior to her completion in a Master of Education (Mathematics) at the University of Melbourne. The music course provided at The Teachers’ College only “involved playing an instrument, writing a bit of music and learning about music education” (IAP, 05. 03. 2012). Her music education background also involves her experience as a parent because the primary school her children attended had “an absolutely fantastic choir” (IAP, 05. 03. 2012).

- Opinions on and involvement in the school’s music program

The AP is very happy with the overall music program at her school, believing that the program “is working almost as well as you can expect it to work in this context” (IAP, 05. 03. 2012). So far, from her point of view, the music program has helped the students develop a great sense of

---

9 The Australian Broadcasting Commission broadcast weekly school music programs for the years identified.
pride in both their school and themselves. She asserts that the development of the school’s music program involves a great deal of good will and hard work from the music specialist, the Principal and the Assistant Principal herself.

The AP’s involvement in developing the program and participating in students’ performances was extensive in the early years of her career at HPS. She helped the music specialist set up the chamber choir and decide on the uniforms. She also contributed to the planning of the violin program and assisted the music specialist when taking the students out in public to perform. However, over the years her main effort was to coordinate all the plans and activities into timetables, which now have become included as part of the regular routine. “I really can honestly say that I’ve tried to support [the music specialist] every step of the way with organizational and budgetary considerations” (IAP, 05. 03. 2012).

The ideal music program, as far as she is concerned, is a choral-based program like the one her children were involved in at their primary school. According to her description, the program at that school was run in a military-like manner. The music teacher there ensured that every student was a member of the choir and had produced excellent results continuously throughout the many years her children attended. She explained, “It [was] very, very disciplined, and organized. We all, including parents, had to be very committed to it. And that’s the kind of thing I want to develop here” (IAP, 05. 03. 2012).

When the AP first came to HPS, the choral program at the time consisted of a Years 3 / 4 choir and a Years 5 / 6 choir. She saw the need for the enlargement of the choral program, and therefore assisted the music specialist with establishing a chamber choir and having a “proper uniform” for each member (IAP, 05. 03. 2012). From her point of view, the chamber choir
provides a great opportunity for those students who are gifted in singing to develop their talent in a free-of-cost manner. The uniform is also designed to enable the members to look good, special and professional, as well as to make them proud of themselves and to achieve “something that is really a little bit out of the ordinary” (IAP, 05. 03. 2012). The AP is well aware of the fact that many students at her school are talented in music, but unfortunately, are experiencing either financial hardship and/or family dysfunction. She, therefore, believes that the only chance for these students to promote their talent is through the opportunity provided by the school which they thoroughly deserve. “I’m very happy with the fact that we’ve now established a chamber choir [and that] we have a lot of enthusiasm” in the other two choirs because they are “inclusive” (IAP, 05. 03. 2012).

The violin program is another part of the overall music program that makes the AP proud. Her enthusiasm in supporting the establishment of the violin program originated in the school’s ownership of a number of violins and the fact that the music specialist, herself, was a fine violinist. In addition, the violin specialist’s willingness in joining the team further consolidated the AP’s confidence in the violin groups being run successfully. The AP firmly believes that with all this in place that the barriers to the students’ participation in such programs were overcome whilst alleviating the financial burden on parents at the same time.

As far as the AP’s concerned, the music program at HPS is a means for the school to access the community, evaluating the program as “interesting but a bit outside the square” (IAP, 05. 03. 2012). More importantly, the inception of the program has provided a characteristic benchmark for the school which distinguishes itself from other schools. She believes that the best way to keep this program running is “to remove as many disincentives as [they] could and try to provide incentives as much as possible” (IAP, 05. 03. 2012). She asserts that another benefit of having a
A successful music program at the school is to provide an opportunity for those students who are talented in music but may not be good at literacy or numeracy to “get a real buzz from being good at something else. It balances their development” (IAP, 05. 03. 2012).

In terms of the pull-out syndrome, the AP admits that complaints from classroom teachers do occur but are only occasional and quite understandable. She explains:

Most of [the generalist teachers] accept that we’ve organized to minimize disruption and they are good with that. We do still have that tension between the requirements to do literacy / numeracy, and to do some music. So we’ve compromised slightly on that. We shifted out chamber choir to the last thing on Monday and we don’t take a whole session out of kids’ learning time, we only take out about 15 minutes maybe 20. Again, staff like us are really respectful for the work [the music specialist] does, and they do understand that it has been a fantastic and successful program in a whole lot of different ways, so they do appreciate that too (IAP, 05. 03. 2012).

- Opinion on the music specialist

The AP describes the music specialist as a “fantastic” and “very talented” teacher (IAP, 05. 03. 2012). There is a steady communication between the music specialist and the AP regarding all aspects involved in the school’s music program. The Assistant Principal explains, “Generally, we are in agreement although we do occasionally have this clash with interest in terms of how much time I’m prepared to allow [her] to take out of the curriculum for children, especially 5s and 6s who already have a very, very crowded curriculum and lots of interest” (IAP, 05. 03. 2012).

- Response from the parents and the community
In terms of the feedback received from the parents regarding the school’s music program, the AP’s response is simple: “They love it”, she says in an excited manner (IAP, 05. 03. 2012). However, her tone turns somewhat serious when the subject changes to the community side. According to the AP, the current enrolment at HPS is around 420, and that the music program has played a significant role in increasing the number. It is important for schools to maintain viable student numbers, “So part of our embarking on this program is to stem any loss of students; the [music] program is excellent for that because it’s public, you get out there, it’s so interesting and exciting to see children who sing well, behave well, play some instruments, especially from a public state school” (IAP, 05. 03. 2012). She concludes that the students also benefit from the community’s response towards their school’s music program, making them proud of the recognition they receive for the great efforts they have put in.

(3) The Violin Specialist

- Introduction

The violin specialist has been teaching at Happyrock Primary School as a contracted teacher for some five years. She comes to the school every Wednesday and teaches during and after school hours. She has spent most of her life teaching violin both at schools and privately. Continuous participation in intensive training courses and workshops have kept her knowledge in violin performing and teaching up-to-date and, consequently, made her a well-known, professional and experienced violin educator.

- Opinion on the school’s music program

The violinist stresses that the music teacher’s classroom music program has made her violin teaching much easier because the students have been given a very solid foundation in music
language, aural skills and critical listening (Violin Specialist Interview (VSI), 23. 11. 2011). She says that “I wouldn’t come in and do a big program like this in a school and start it off if there wasn’t some sort of support of music and [the students] had no idea of pitch” (VSI, 23. 11. 2011). Students’ learning of a new piece does not start from reading notes but from singing, utilization of hand signs and body percussions instead. The violin specialist concludes her feelings towards the school music program by saying “I’m amazed at the way the kids can learn and how easily they can learn here” (VSI, 23. 11. 2011). She further expresses an intense passion for her career at Happyrock Primary School, primarily because she receives pronounced enjoyment from the students’ enjoyment, as generated from both their learning in classes and performing on stage. Her pleasure in teaching at this school is enhanced by the students’ consistently outstanding stage performances on various occasions, where the children are always looking good and sounding their best.

- Opinion on the music specialist

She has known the music teacher since 1982 and has worked together with her in school violin programs ever since. They had taught at two other schools prior to their tenure here at Happyrock Primary School. At previous schools, the music teacher’s teaching focused on classroom music programs in conjunction with violin teaching and other music programs, whilst the violin specialist fulfilled her career mainly with string programs. She believes that the music specialist is a “marvellous music teacher” because the effective classroom teaching she conducts has built a solid foundation for facilitating students’ violin learning and further maximizing their results (VSI, 23. 11. 2011).

- Opinion on students’ performances and community’s response to the music program
Amongst the many positive aspects about the school’s music program, being involved in a high frequency of performances throughout the year is what the violinist enjoys the most. All violin learners are strongly encouraged to participate in various types of performances, from which they gain valuable experience in both playing individually and in groups (VSI, 23. 11. 2011). The violinist stresses that the return of the graduated students to participate in school performances also plays an important role in encouraging current students to become involved in violin learning. She often receives positive feedback from parents after performances and school concerts, especially those of graduated students, expressing high praise for the way in which performances/concerts were organized and how well the students were prepared.

(4) The school Librarian

- Introduction

The school librarian in Happyrock Primary School was specifically interviewed because of her frequent involvement in the school’s music program. The librarian has enjoyed her tenure at Happyrock Primary School for some eleven years. Apart from fulfilling her library duties, she is also heavily committed to her role in the school music program. The music teacher has appointed her as the ‘stage manager’ for all the concerts and performances held within and outside the school. Controlling background music and organizing stage productions are the major duties required of her role. Music has always been an important part in the librarian’s life, and this can be seen in her continuous participations in choral activities since childhood, guitar learning experience, and the strong music background of both her children and her husband.

- Opinion on the school’s music program
She points out that the music program at HPS is quite remarkable. Unlike some other schools’ programs wherein students merely sing songs all the time, their program has provided opportunities for every student to engage in professional choral activities, learn different instruments, and participate in numerous concerts throughout the years (LI, 23. 11. 2011). The librarian observes that students who are trained in other musical instruments under private tuition are strongly encouraged to demonstrate their skills in front of other students and parents on many different occasions. This approach differentiates the school’s music program from that of neighbouring schools which are either singing-focused or “pretty basic” (LI, 23. 11. 2011). The excellence of the school music program could also be seen in the continuation of graduates’ music learning: “We have many students here that are playing instruments at high school, continuing on” (LI, 23. 11. 2011).

- Opinion on the music specialist

The librarian has been working with the music specialist since her commencement at Happyrock Primary School. Both her children had received intensive music training under the music specialist during their attendance at the school. She believes that the music teacher “has brought more to the school as in [students] are not just singing, [they are] playing more instruments” (LI, 23. 11. 2011).

- Opinion on performances and community’s response

The librarian believes that the school music program has reached out to the community under the music specialist’s operation and, consequently, is attracting students to the school. In her own words “this is bringing students to our school because they know [that] they are [not only] going to learn the everyday thing that is required in going to school but music as accompaniment which
people love to say “my children go to this school, they learn to play an instrument, they learn to sing a song, and they are learning how to read music, even” (LI, 23. 11. 2011). As a feature of the music teacher’s program, community performance has created a diversity of benefits. Primarily, students are given an opportunity to gain experience in performing in front of a variety of audience groups. Furthermore, through constant exposure in the community, the school has created an image for the public as being an institution which not only provides great education but also excellent music teaching. Moreover, the music teacher’s community performance approach also involves parental participation in the form of assisting and watching. Such participation enables parents to familiarize with their children’s progress in music learning whilst providing further support to the development of the school’s music program. Last but not least, the advocacy of the necessity and importance of school music education is demonstrated through the community performance. Subsequently, those parents who are preparing for their children’s enrollment in primary education will take music education into account when choosing schools. This is exemplified in the case where a particular lady from the community helped with the stage lighting system and was so impressed with the entire performance that she expressed a strong interest in enrolling her daughter in Happy Rock Primary School because of the outstanding quality of the school’s music program, despite the fact that her daughter was only three years old at the time.

(5) Students’ responses towards the school’s music program

The establishment and development of a school’s music program involves several parties’ participation and contribution, for example, the school’s administrative panel, teaching board, parents school committee, school council, etc. However, the students, around which everything else revolves, remain the core of the music program. The affinity children have with music is
suitably illustrated in “For young children, music just is, and the songs and sounds of their environment brings them joy, solace, safety, and a sense of identity” (Whiteman & Campbell, 2009, p. 495).

It is important to investigate the students’ perspectives on the school’s music program in order to obtain a comprehensive view of the overall program at Happy Rock Primary School. To explore this perspective, as part of their class activities, every student in Year 4 is given a piece of paper in which two tasks regarding their understanding of music are to be completed as homework. The first task is to complete a sentence starting with “Music is”, and the second task is to draw a picture about “Music and me”. There is no provision for names on the paper, and the students are instructed not to put their names down before the paper is handed out to maintain confidentiality. Thus the researchers were grateful to receive this data from the music specialist teacher. Ethical permission to interview children was not sought as it was decided that adequate data could be gathered through this assignment that collected attitudes to music in a non-teacher-directed manner. A number of responses appear in Appendix C.

- Response through the completed sentence

According to the responses to task one, students’ perspectives on music are positive in each and every case. Students’ responses are grouped according to the following five categories: Psycho-emotional, Philosophical, Visual and Audio, Aspirations, and Educational.

(a) Psycho-emotional effects: Music is “fun and a great way to learn and you get pumped up listening to cool songs”; “a great way to get out your expression”; “having lots of fun by singing, listening, and playing”; “a great way to calm you down”; “an excellent way to show your talent”; “all about loving the songs”; “a life everyone loves [and] a way of
getting not angry‖; “my favourite subject”; “fun and you won’t get bored”; “a way of getting over being angry”; “a way to feel active, a way of feeling happy and cool”; “when you are sad put on a nice song”; “something awesome and cool”; “a way of feeling happy”; “singing your heart out”; “very exciting”; “a very popular thing”; “enjoyable and relaxing”; “doesn’t stress your out”; “something that makes you emotional”; “fun and amazing because I like to sing”; “something that solves all your problems when you [are] sad or angry”; “when you are down, music can change your whole life”; “fun to learn and fun to sing that means music is fun for everyone”; “calming and relaxing”.

From this section, the impact the music learning experience has had on the students can be understood in the following ways:

(I) Students gain a great deal of excitement from their music classes. According to their statements, music learning at HPS is a fun journey through which students not only feel happy, amazing and active but also ‘awesome’, ‘cool’ and popular. Such responses indicate that the music specialist’s teaching style and the techniques she uses are very engaging and encouraging. They also reveal that the repertoire she carefully chooses is age-appropriate and suitable for most students’ tastes. **Victorian Music Workshop Report (VMWR) (SMAG, 2007)** suggests that music curriculum should regard the development of music literacy as a focal point, including the development of students’ reading, listening and interpreting skills via instrumental or vocal activities. Furthermore, the material used in this process should “Reflect students’ needs and interests” (p. 25). In the same document, In the **VMWR** (SMAG, 2007) Gill points out that all children in Australia are entitled to receive top quality music teaching delivered by well trained music teachers who are able to provide a “broad range of repertoire at an appropriate depth” (p. 32).
(II) On the other hand, music creates a soothing atmosphere for students’ learning experience. This effect can be seen in students’ participation in activities, such as singing or instrument playing in particular types of music. Moreover, the music specialist’s instruction in music appreciation also plays an important role in influencing students from a therapeutic perspective. Hence, students are able to choose certain types of music to relax themselves when they are feeling angry, stressed, sad, or emotional in other ways. Some students report that their self-esteem is elevated through music activities. This effect is supported by *Pediatrics* (American Academy of Pediatrics (AAP), 2009) who states that music is a source of entertainment and distraction, providing children with an outlet to and a means of coping with tension, boredom and problems. This is consolidated by numerous studies which have found that there is a strong correlation between emotions and music at various age levels.

(III) Music learning also helps students with their self-expression. For example, some students report that through singing, they are able to express what is in their mind and heart. Music, it seems, also gives them the confidence to articulate their thoughts and feelings. This effect is supported by stating that music, along with movement, provides young children the ability to express themselves even earlier than the development of their language skills.

(IV) For most students, music in HPS is regarded as an enjoyable subject, and for some students it is their favourite subject. The most commonly reported music activities are singing, music appreciation and instrument playing. It is important to know that some students love music because the subject enables them to bring out their talents. This response demonstrates that the music program at the school is able to provide adequate provision for musically gifted students to more fully develop their innate skills. VMWR (SMAG, 2007) states that “where particular

---

10 Interestingly, although included music notation in their pictures (often for decoration effect), no written responses identified music reading or writing. This reflects the very practical approach undertaken by the music specialist.
students have demonstrated high levels of interest or talent in music, including instrumental and vocal performance…they should have access to sustained programs and opportunities that will maximise their talent and skills” (p. 16). In the interview, the Assistant Principal (AP) explains that for those ones who are good at music as well as numeracy and/or literacy, the program may enhance their overall school performance. For students who are talented in music but may not be good at numeracy and/or literacy, the music program provides a “balancing effect” which helps them elevate their self-esteem and may provide the potential for improving performance in other subjects (IAP, 05. 03. 2012).

(b) Philosophical effects: according to the students, music is “a way to find the inner you”; “in our soul”; “my whole life. I love music because I get to experience a whole lot of things”; “is part of the huge world”; “a big part of my life”; “inspiring... and makes a better way of life”; “a good way to help you be a better person”; “fun, but you learn from your heart not from your brain. Music comes from the inside not from the outside”; “a beautiful thing to do in life”; “what you feel and what’s in your heart and soul”; “life and our future”; “a way to be true to yourself”; “peaceful, bad and good music”; “how the world works and warming up your world”; “what made the King of Pop and is what keeps our spirits up”; “the best thing ever created for everyone any age”.

Compared to the previous section, statements grouped in this category are more meaningful and, at times, even abstract. This can be substantiated by Whiteman and Campbell (2009), stating that “Music for [young children] is an experience beyond words, where words may simply not suffice to explain its meaning” (p. 495). It is the observer’s interpretation that most of these responses are generated from the guidance the music specialist provides in her teaching, especially in music appreciation. Song lyrics that the students are exposed to may also have a strong influence
in shaping these thoughts. *Pediatrics* (AAP, 2009) cites Knobloch-Westerwick et al., stating that children may not have the full understanding of lyrics but do recognize “enough to obtain a general idea the messages they bring” (p. 1489).

(I) Some students describe music as a media through which they are able to see and experience the world. This can be related to the previous year’s music teaching theme, *Around the World*. All students were involved in a global range of indigenous music singing and instrument playing activities. In the school annual concert, students dressed up in different national costumes in accordance with the origin of the song as presented in its native language. These responses reveal that the music program at HPS is an illustration of the Australian Council of State School Organization (ACSSO) (2005) who advocated that school music education and experience in music learning should develop an “appreciation of cultures via different forms of musical experiences” (p. 7). Victorian Essential Learning Standards (VELS) (Victorian Curriculum and Assessment Authority) (VCAA, 2009) also indicates that “The Arts are unique, expressive, creative and communicative forms that engage students in critical and creative thinking and help them understand themselves and the world” (n. p. n.).

(II) Some students believe that music is their life and future. It shows that music is playing a significant role in these students’ daily lives and will continue to accompany them in the future. This could be interpreted whereby the music specialist’s passion for teaching music and music itself influences her students who in turn become impassioned with their music learning experience to the point where music assumes spiritual significance throughout their lives. For some students, it seems, music lives in their heart, spirit and soul, and is acquired through their emotions rather than cognitively. Within music there is the means to find the real inner self. Referring to comments obtained from parent and family input, ACSSO (2005) states that
music education (as one aspect of the arts) facilitates the development of the human soul against this horribly mundane learning environment we are currently fostering. The commitment to learning at a slow and steady pace which is a benefit of learning music, can be transferred from the musical experience into the whole of life (p. 7).

(III) Music itself can also be encouraging to some students who would like to grow up to live a better life or to be a better person. During the interview with the Assistant Principal, the issue of HPS experiencing a demographic change is emphasized several times. According to the AP, a considerable number of students at the school are from families that are experiencing significant financial difficulties and/or family dysfunction. It is quite probable then that some of the very same students who provide the aforementioned responses may come from such families experiencing said hardship. Children’s particular and personal circumstances can be a major factor in orienting them towards music which somehow reflects or complements their life experience. This is supported by *Pediatrics* (AAP, 2009) which asserts that though children may display the tendency to be somewhat limited in their understanding of song lyrics, their music appreciation is “related to the experiences lived by the listener” (p. 1489). The AP further points out that it is challenging, yet important for all staff members, including the music teacher, to pay extra attention to those students who are experiencing family difficulties to help them achieve more in other areas rather than, for example music itself, through the learning of music. The music specialist can be regarded as a successful model in this regard through the aforementioned students’ responses. Her teaching materials and techniques are carefully chosen in order to facilitate a sufficient provision of positive and encouraging elements required in both classroom teaching and activities of all kinds. She also helps them build a happy, healthy and positive regard to life whilst motivating them with her enthusiastic nature. To support this perspective,
Gill states in *VMWR* (SMAG, 2007) that music educators “need to guide [students] to a world of music that is broader and deeper than they ever dreamed and to let them know that their lives can be richer and more satisfying by a hundredfold if only they had the opportunity to study music properly” (p. 34).

(IV) The positive effects that music program creates are described by some students as inspiring, whilst for others they experience a sense of feeling at peace. For some students, the journey of music learning is a thing of beauty, which can likewise transform their world into a warm and beautiful place. This particular phenomenon where music is experienced as an emotional experience is contrary to Gill’s observation that school music education relies “basically on how children feel about what they hear or requiring children to express opinions about aspects of music which fall completely in the domain of the subjective and have no chance of being substantiated in any way with any musical evidence” (SMAG, 2007, p. 31). Concurring with this critical viewpoint, the observer believes that the music program at HPS demonstrates a successful model which enables students to think and understand how music works through music literacy learning and aural training etc, simultaneously, allowing them to express their feelings and emotions towards different types of music in relation to their daily life through music appreciation and various activities.

(c) Visual and audio effects: Music is “all around, even in TVs and radios”; “everywhere”; “my life and every [where] I go I hear it”; “something nice to listen to”; “great to listen to”; “all around you [and] is in the air”; “something they do all around the world”; “it makes a fabulous sound”. The message of these responses is that which expresses the all-pervasive incidence of music and its capacity to entertain visually and aurally. This type of appreciation of music relates to the music specialist’s entertaining
style of teaching which stresses the enjoyment of music which all can experience. The responses also reveal that students are constantly surrounded by all types of music within and outside the school. On a practical level, the music for the ‘musical bell’ at HPS which replaces the conventional school bell, is carefully chosen and changed periodically, and has the effect of enhancing the school’s music climate both entertaining and motivating students at the same time.

(d) Effects upon aspirations: the students wrote that music is “good for children to learn if they want to be a music teacher or a musician when they are older”; “is a great way to learn lots of songs so you can be famous”. The former response could be interpreted as the music specialist creating a role model for the image of a successful and respectful music teacher, and therefore, has the effect of motivating some students to emulate her in terms of career aspiration. The later response is indicative of a large number of students who regard music learning as a means to an end, if not towards actually becoming famous. This type of response which alludes to the glamorous side of music learning aspiration is quite common amongst primary school students. The excellence of the music specialist’s proficiency in teaching music may have the effect of cultivating music learning skills of such high calibre, that one or even a handful of students may achieve some form of public recognition, or even stardom.

(e) Educational effects: For the students, music is “a great way to learn new songs”; “a great way to learn to play different instruments”; “singing Christmas carols”; “something [that] can make you learn more words from different songs”; “If you play instruments it will make you smart, if you practise then you learn more”; “a great way to experience more and know what music is and then you can listen to more music”; “something that
gives you confidence and future skills”; “good for children to learn”; “fun to learn all the music you don’t know”; “inspiring when you play instruments and sing so you can learn more about instruments and get a high pitch music”. Statements grouped in this section focus on music learning, demonstrating a range of benefits that the students receive from their experience through the school’s music program.

(I) The most direct benefit can be seen as learning new songs and playing different instruments. These two factors are the actual focal points of the school’s music program. Students at all levels are involved in extensive singing and instrumental activities. Some students provide specific responses in this regard as learning music can develop their technique, enabling them to attain high-pitched vocal skills. Other students place emphasis on learning the ability to sing Christmas carols.

(II) As an extension of the previous point, some students seem to realise that what they learn from the music program are actual skills which may have application in their future lives. Moreover, it is very important that some students actually point out that music learning helps them expand their vocabulary, as they are constantly learning new words and terms through extensive singing activities. This is consistent with ACSSO (2005) who contends that “Music education and musical experiences foster many skills within the individual and group - some of these being: Acquisition and extension of language development” (p. 7).

(III) Improvement in self-confidence is also stated as an important positive effect of music learning in many students’ responses. Self-confidence is a recognizably important component of character and self-esteem, attributes which are helpful, if not essential to achieving success in music learning and other subjects.
(IV) Some students feel that the music they are introduced to is good for children to learn. This kind of response, again, reflects the music specialist’s ability to appropriate her teaching style and select music according to the age levels she teaches. Gill asserts in the *VMWR* (SMAG, 2007) that good music teachers “are not intimidated by fashion, gimmick, relevancy or political correctness and will teach substantial, worthwhile and balanced repertoire which offers an ever-increasing source of revelation by virtue of its being studied” (p. 32).

(V) A small number of students believe that learning music increases their intelligence and that more practice will enable them to learn more music and therefore creates a perpetual loop of cognitive enhancement. This recognition of the positive effects of music learning indicates a belief that students hold in terms of maintaining that ‘music makes you smart’ in general. There is awareness amongst students then, that practice in music learning is necessary as it helps them achieve optimal result.

- Response through the picture of “Music and me”

Almost all pictures involve a self-portrait of the student, most of them accompanied by notes in different values, clefs, instruments (such as guitar, drum, violin, recorder, glockenspiel, keyboard, and percussions), headphones, iPods, or a microphone. All figures in the drawings are smiling, singing, playing an instrument, or performing on stage. Some responses involve music in aspects of daily functioning, such as driving, listening to the radio, interacting with others, or playing sport. The statements made by these drawings convey the message that the music program at HPS provides a broad spectrum of activities which affects students’ lives within and beyond the classroom. The music program not only provides students with the skills and tools necessary for music appreciation and learning, but also gives them the means by which their lives are enriched and their career prospects in the field of music are enhanced.
This chapter has presented the background to the school music program at HPS which will be further described in greater detail in several specific areas in the following chapters.
Chapter Seven
Classroom Music and the Choral Program at HPS

In this chapter there will be a discussion of the selected primary school’s classroom music teaching as well as an outline of its choral program. A curriculum chart (see Appendix B) will be presented as an example of the entire curricular system whilst the observations of a Year 4 class and a Year 5/6 class will be described in detail to exemplify the music specialist’s classroom teaching routine. The rationale for choosing these two particular classes was due to their representations of the music specialist’s style of teaching, illustrating specific pedagogical strategies she uses for particular objectives whilst demonstrating the regular procedure of her general classroom teaching.

1. Classroom music program

The classroom music program at Happyrock Primary School (HPS) has enjoyed a highly successful history for some fourteen years or more. The teacher who started the program was a classroom generalist and an active advocate of school music education. The motivation for her starting the music program was her passion for music and the strong belief that all students at this school should have access to music education. However, the limitations of the generalist’s music skills and teaching experience saw her retire in the knowledge that someone specializing in music performance and teaching needed to succeed her in carrying on the music program (MTI, 15. 12. 2011). The current music specialist whose advent saw the inception of the current music program then fulfilled this role. Though acknowledging her predecessor’s ability to establish a good foundation for the music program, the current music specialist is also critical in that she believes previous classes were run in a regimented manner and constrained by time
limitations. The music specialist believes that music learning should be conducted in a relaxed environment which allows for freedom and flexibility. This mode of classroom music teaching appears to be a more suitable adaptation to the school’s culture, and is considered more conducive to cultivating students’ creative abilities and encouraging them to be more engaged in extra-curricular activities.

The music program at HPS has a very strong emphasis on the Kodály approach which aligns with the music specialist’s preference for a vocal basis at the levels of Kindergarten to Year 4. Teaching content covering these year levels includes the following areas: folk songs, children-friendly contemporary songs, rhythm names, solfa, and hand signs. These aspects are learnt, practised, and reinforced through various activities, such as singing, singing games, moving to music, percussion playing, improvising, and composing. A core approach at first, the Kodály emphasis then gives way to accommodate other music teaching approaches after Year 4, e.g. musical and instrumental learning, but singing and notation writing are still practised on a regular basis. The reason why the Kodály philosophy is no longer practised as a central teaching method beyond the early years is because many students beyond Year 4 coming to the school from other schools do not have any Kodály learning experience in their earlier years of music education background. For example, in a Year 6 class of 28 students there might be fewer than 10 students who have had previous music learning experience under the Kodály method. The music specialist deemed that it was potentially divisive to have to return to the basics of the Kodály method for the new students while trying to maintain the interest level of children who had been in the school longer.

At HPS students at Years 5 and 6 are heavily involved in a composition project which is to be completed with the assistance of glockenspiels. It is at this stage the Orff approach becomes
more applicable for this level’s curriculum. Students are grouped in threes or fours according to their own preference, and two glockenspiels are given to each group. This way of grouping students is conducive to students developing self-organizational skills, whilst providing them the obvious benefit of working with those with whom they feel more comfortable and, therefore, should be more able to produce better teamwork results. The composition is to consist of two harmonized melodies using five pentatonic notes and all the learnt rhythm patterns. The entire project serves the purpose of developing students’ composing skills and, at the same time, reviewing previously learnt knowledge in a comprehensive manner, especially in areas of notation and rhythm patterns. After two weeks of preparation and practice, each group’s work is recorded in the teacher’s laptop computer on a weekly basis, and specific feedback is provided by the teacher in terms of developing and improving students’ work for the following week’s recording. This approach enables the entire project to progress at a steady pace, provides students a clear direction for further developing and refining the composition, and creates an opportunity for students to listen to and comment on others’ works. The final work is performed on two glockenspiels accompanied with percussion instruments chosen by the group and played by students other than the glockenspiel players. The recordings of the completed compositions are compiled in a CD which is then given to each student to take home. By doing so, each student’s achievement in the project is appreciated and valued in a tangible and memorable way, a pleasant reminder enabling parents to have greater insight into their children’s progress in the music learning at school. It also serves as a means of advocating the music program within and outside the school.

The 2012 Term 1 Music Curriculum at HPS has been attached in Appendix B. The entire curriculum is established and developed completely by the music specialist herself. Only one of
the school terms is presented as this is a sufficient representation of the breadth of the school music curriculum.

The following observations were conducted for the purpose of gaining insight into the music specialist’s implementation of her curriculum to provide a deeper understanding of particular teaching methods and techniques utilized in various teaching tasks, the social and learning culture created in the classroom, and identifying the overall dynamic generated between the music specialist and her students.

(1) Class observation No. 1

Date and time: 08/09/2011 Thursday from 11.10 am to 12 pm
Year level: 4
Number of students: 22
Class subject: Preparation for Annual Concert

The focus of Year 4 classroom music is the musical and this year’s production is *The Sleepy Mandarin* (Diamond, 1982). The following is an observation of one of their preparatory sessions:

At the beginning of the class, the music specialist reminds students about some decorative Chinese lanterns sitting over in the corner of the classroom and also about the many colourful pictures from the previous week’s concert for ‘preppies’, Year 1s, 5s and 6s which are to be stuck on the wall in the near future. By drawing students’ attention to decorations in the classroom, she generates a sense of belonging and affinity for the learning environment which becomes an effective teaching tool in itself. As part of the lesson plan, directing students to the Chinese decorations creates an effective means of bridging Chinese culture with the lesson.
plan’s theme of the musical *The Sleepy Mandarin*. In keeping with this teaching strategy, she then suggests getting some more posters for greetings in different languages to be used in the next concert (for Year 2s, 3s and 4s) as they had worked very well in past concerts. This demonstrates the music teacher’s awareness of multiculturalism which is particularly relevant to the school’s diverse cultural background. Her tactic for using greetings in foreign languages as decorations in school concerts has the effect of encouraging students to further value the mixture of cultures which makes up the school and the society within which they live. The specialist proceeds to explain that the lanterns are to be used for their upcoming concert because the class is going to perform *The Sleepy Mandarin*\(^{11}\) (by Diamond, 1982). She tells the class about where the lanterns will be hung and how the stage is going to be decorated, e.g. two lanterns will stay on each end of the stage with posters in-between them; more posters will also be hung at the front of the stage. At this point, everybody in the class is excited about the upcoming performance of the musical due to the music teacher’s enthusiastic and colourful description of the stage arrangement. As Ernst (1965) pointed out, enthusiasm is of paramount importance in classroom teaching, and in this case it can be seen as a powerful stimulant in generating students’ curiosity about the musical. To ensure a successful performance, the music teacher is prepared to transpose the entire piece of *The Sleepy Mandarin* down to F major rather than using the original Key G major. She is willing to spend some time during the holiday practising the accompaniment in the new key and explains to the students why she needs time to practise for the key changing, and this is, ostensibly, indicative of her high work ethic and dedication to her profession. This is because, like all other pianists, her fingers have muscle memories after having been practising a piece in a certain key for a long time, so when key changing is required her fingers easily make mistakes. This strategic aspect of teaching effectively draws students’

\(^{11}\) *The Sleepy Mandarin* was composed by Eileen Diamond and was published in Chappell Music, London, 1982.
attention to both old and new keys of this particular musical, and also highlights the need for intensive practice on key changing and fine piano playing. The teacher then outlines the lesson plan for the class, i.e. having a run-through of the entire show, working with individual voices whilst the rest of the class will do some drawings in their music books about their ‘ideal stage’ of the show. Making known the lesson plan provides students with the actual content, specific expectations and outcomes, which has the effect of better preparing students for the tasks ahead and maintaining their focus.

The entire class is then moved close to the piano, the music teacher warning students not to upset her computer positioned on a chair. She reminds the class about how many individual roles there are in the show as well as informing them of the rather lengthy duration of the show so that students can be prepared for their long performance in standing position. The music specialist stops playing piano after the first section to make sure that every student can be seen by her from the piano. She constantly reminds students about singing with feeling and emotion rather than shouting thoughtlessly. Singing every word clearly is also stressed and the consequence of not doing so, i.e. the audience not being able to understand properly, is clearly explained. The music teacher’s demonstration of attention to detail is a means of further ensuring a successful performance, providing students with a model of approach to music studies which instills within students’ a sense of responsibility, professionalism and aesthetic appreciation. The first run-through lasts nearly 10 minutes. During the rehearsal, some students cause interruptions through misbehaviour and noisiness which prompts the teacher to stop the music and discipline the students accordingly. She does not merely tell the students to stop misbehaving but explains the serious consequences of their interruption, i.e. she and the rest of the class lose the spot and cannot pick the music up easily, and if this happens in the show, it could be disastrous. By taking
such a disciplined and reasoned approach, the music teacher establishes a model of behaviour which ensures smooth running, cohesion and quality rehearsal/performance. The music teacher comments on the run-through positively but reminds the chorus to remain focused whenever they are not singing.

She introduces her brand new coloured pencils to the class and asks the students to draw a picture on their music books about how they want the stage set up. She also makes it clear that the character *Sleepy Mandarin* must be depicted on the same picture with the stage. This strategy provides students the opportunity to employ their creative skills, originality, the ability to work independently and within groups, and encourages overall student participation and involvement in stagecraft. After the chorus is set up for their drawing, the music specialist calls upon all the individual voices to gather around the piano and rehearses with them in detail. She sings the chorus when needed, then spends quality time on pitch and timing with each individual role and is always very patient and encouraging even when the student does not perform to expectation within three or four attempts. She pays individual voices recognition by saying “it’s clear, it’s in tune, and sounds really good”, but at the same time points out that “sometimes I don’t hear the end of the word” as the audience must “be able to understand every single word” in an effort to raise the standard to a higher level. The music teacher stresses that the end of the word gets lost because there is not enough breath to support the voice, and therefore advises the students not only to take a bigger breath but also to hold on to it longer. She further points out about the ‘short breath’ by telling the students that when they perform in front of the audience the breath gets even shorter, and that therefore, they need to take a big breath, use most of it and save a bit when practising without the audience in order to secure a successful performance on stage. She reassures students not to be concerned with taking too long to take a breath as the piano
accompanies the singer’s timing, rather than setting the pace for the voice to follow. By describing the breathing techniques good singing requires, the teacher demonstrates her expertise in voice production and provides students with the mechanism by which they are made aware of the cause of the difficulties associated with breathing so that they can overcome such problems in stage singing. Whilst rehearsing with the soloists, the teacher constantly reminds them about the percussion instruments used within the music by playing the rhythms on the piano in order to ensure correct timing. Encouraging the soloists at the end of the rehearsal by saying “That’s great! You sound gorgeous”, she also makes sure each soloist has the music in mind, or to otherwise take the music home to practise. After rehearsing with the individual roles, the teacher goes back to the rest of the class and checks the drawings. She seems surprised by some of the pictures and shows great enthusiasm in applying some of their ideas in decorating the stage. This positive reinforcement on the music teacher’s part is effective in maintaining students’ interest and inclination toward their music tasks and also demonstrates her appreciation of art work as a means of gauging students’ creative efforts in stage decoration. The music teacher’s pedagogical style also demonstrates her ability to multi-task in music teaching.

The specialist recalls the last time she had students performing *The Sleepy Mandarin* was some twenty years ago. She regards this performance as a challenge as the performers are Year 4 students and their voices are quite young. The teacher admits that it took her some time to find voices for those individual roles and after she found them she was very happy, mindful that there is a lot of work to do in order to get the show ready and to deliver quality performance on the stage, but nonetheless, she has great confidence in this particular group of students and is looking forward to “show time” (MTI, 15. 12. 2011). This Year 4 class provides a good example of the music teacher’s ability to cater for varying student levels in her general music teaching and also
consolidates her belief that successful performance can be ensured by the teacher’s confident attitude towards achieving success. This belief is consistent with Southcott’s observation, quoting a pre-service student’s statement “failure is not an option… it will be a good show if you put everything into it” (2006, p. 3).

The music specialist has no doubt been an engine of motivation in establishing, developing and driving the Year 4 musical production program as well as the entire school music program itself. Corroborating this observation, the school Principal offers his opinion by stating that the school music program at HPS is highly successful, and that the success has been perpetuated because of the music teacher’s enthusiasm for the program. He emphasizes the importance of the survival of a music program when he states “If you don’t have the passion, the program just falls by the way” (PI, 17, 08, 2011). From his perspective, the failure of music programs could be attributed to the standard, run-of-the-mill procedure where students congregate in a room, sing for an hour or so, read their ABC\textsuperscript{12} books and do not “get into the actual art form itself” (PI, 17. 08. 2011).

This he sees in one of HPS’ neighbouring schools, located in an adjoining suburb, which is experiencing a marked deterioration of its previously successful music program. According to the librarian at HPS, the current music program at this particular neighbouring primary school has a basic choral program only, which operates on a part-time basis. Unfortunately, there is no information available in this nearby school’s current website regarding their school music program. In her article published in 2001, a former music director at this other school described the school’s then thriving music program which spanned more than two decades. She stated that the school provided “a very rich music program for all students, P - 6” and included “specialist and classroom programs in all Key Learning areas” (Marcic, 2001). Performing arts tuition and

\textsuperscript{12} A collection of books used for music education at primary level in Australia since the late 50s (Australian Broadcasting Commission, 2011).
music classes were offered to all students at the school on a weekly basis. Learning areas included instrumental, choral and technological studies and activities. Regular choral performances were conducted at local venues and school assemblies. The music program catered for all students and was a prominent feature, particularly in the third term of each year when the “Annual School Musical” was held (Marcic, 2001, p. 35). The school community responded enthusiastically to the musical performances, with “local kindergartens … elderly citizens … local councillors, members of parliament, DEET representatives” amongst the audiences (p. 36). As rich and successful this school music program was back in its glory days, it only survives today in a much diminished capacity due to a number of factors, including the loss of previous music teachers.

(2) Class observation No. 2

Date and time: 15/02/2012 Wednesday from 11.50 am to 12.40pm.

Year level: 5/6

Number of students: 23

Class subject: Singing and glockenspiel playing

As the teacher is greeting the class, some news is announced by the school Principal through the speakers. The announcement is about the third-year-memorial of the Black Saturday bushfire and that the nation is required to remain silent for one minute at this particular moment. After the ceremony, the music teacher continues the topic by telling the class a very sad but true story about the bushfire three years ago. The reaction of the class is rather somber. The teacher encourages the students to remember the disaster, but at the same time to improve their
awareness of fire safety. The teacher’s discussion on the bushfire topic demonstrates her care for students’ wellbeing, and her awareness as a music teacher that she also has the obligation of educating students in other aspects of life, and not just music.

The music teaching begins with the teacher’s introduction of a new song that she plays on her recorder. After her demonstration, the teacher clarifies that the song will be sung in a lower key rather than the same one used in her playing. This is so because a lower key would be more suitable for the students’ vocal range, and would also be consistent with the backing track on the CD. Despite the fact that the knowledge about key is not included in this year level’s curriculum, the reference to it has the effect of building a foundation for students’ further study on the topic. The class is reminded to sit straight for their professional presentation and for the purpose of better quality voice production. Requiring students to sit and sing in the correct way shows the teacher’s understanding of good vocal production and the importance of good posture. The teacher sings the song, line by line, and the class echoes back accordingly. When it comes to the words “Yakkitty Yak”, the students’ first attempt lacks expressiveness and intonation, prompting the teacher to demonstrate again with exaggeration of tone and facial expression. Singing with both appropriate vocal and facial expressions is one of the music teacher’s strategies that she employs repeatedly to good effect. Asking students to sing expressively and to enunciate the words clearly enables the music and lyrics to be delivered more vividly and appropriately. The second attempt of the song by the children achieves a much better result but is still not up to the teacher’s expectations, so she questions the class about the song’s content, with “Does that ever happen at your house, not exactly the same, perhaps, but we get told to do things like put the rubbish in the bin, feed the cat, or tidy up your room? Who doesn’t have a tidy room? I should put two hands up for my children. Some of you are really good. So that’s what this song is
about”. This talk helps students better understand the song by becoming more aware of its intended message, and therefore, the third round results in an almost perfect performance. This particular strategy provides a closer connectedness between the music and students’ daily life. As a result, students are able to present the music in a more natural and positive manner. Following the teacher’s expressive demonstration, the class goes through the whole song with evident enjoyment and enthusiasm. The students then sing the song for the second time but with the backing track. To ensure a smooth run, the teacher always calls out the lyrics of the following line rhythmically at the end of each previous line. This way of teaching serves the purpose of not only guiding students on lyrics but also modelling the practice of rhythm speech which is one of the fundamental methods advocated in the Orff approach. Landis and Carder (1972) stated that “Speech as a part of the musical experience is a distinguishing characteristic of the Orff-Schulwerk approach”, helping children learn songs through the most natural path (p. 78). The teacher shows her happiness and satisfaction by exclaiming, “I must say, that was really good! But once you learn the words you are going to be even better”.

The second task is a continuation of the previous week’s work which is a piece entitled Marimba March. It consists of chorus and verses, the verses being made up of several different well-known tunes. The students are to complete the whole piece on glockenspiels in a few weeks time. The teacher plays a tune on her glockenspiel to remind the class about the chorus they learnt previously. She stresses the importance of knowing the rhythms prior to knowing the notes when learning a new piece. The class is then asked to read the rhythm patterns noted on the whiteboard following the teacher’s directions. By emphasizing this perspective, the music teacher is practising and reinforcing the corresponding techniques included in both the Kodály and Orff approaches. The learning of rhythms is positioned essentially in the Kodály system throughout
all levels. In fact, the ability of identifying the rhythm patterns is required at primary level of
teaching, with the focus upon familiar tunes (Choksy, 2000). In the Orff approach, melody
devolves naturally and simply as rhythm; in effect, melody has its genesis in rhythm (Thresher,
1964). The teacher always demonstrates each task prior to leading the class for a run-through,
stressing the difference between one line and the other. The teacher’s demonstration provides a
clear goal for students to aim for as well as a standard of work for students to meet. When
students are experiencing difficulties at certain points, the teacher explains the rhythm patterns,
similarities and differences with previous lines, then asks the class to repeat the pattern as many
times as is needed. Each repeat is followed by the teacher’s words of encouragement and positive
comments. The teacher’s immediate and positive feedback specifies the teacher’s further
expectations, ensuring the quality of the students’ next performance. After the chorus is firmly
accomplished, the teacher tells the class “You’ve got a very nice tune coming up and you may
have heard it before”. The way the teacher introduces the following tune has the effect of
stimulating the students’ interest, thus, they listen to the teacher with even greater attention. She
demonstrates the tune immediately on her glockenspiel and tells the class the name of the tune –
*When the Saints Go Marching In* - and that it is to be played twice in the actual piece. Some
details of this tune’s background are also introduced by the teacher. As the teacher is playing the
tune, a few students are humming along before realizing that this well-known tune is the same as
the song sung by the St. Kilda Football Club. As a result, their enthusiasm in learning the song
elevates. This teaching-learning segment illustrates one of the underlying purposes that school
music education serves, that is, providing students the correct and rather detailed knowledge
about the most commonly known music compositions in a simple, yet, musical way. The
following section of the lesson requires students to learn and practise *When the Saints Go
Marching In, which becomes the first verse in the whole piece on their glockenspiels. The teacher turns to the whiteboard again and points at the notes, reminding students that the chorus they learnt previously must be practised on their glockenspiels as a priority. Once they can play the chorus fluently with enough confidence, they can then start to practise the first verse. After accomplishing both tasks they will then need to learn the hardest part in the whole process, which is the connection between the chorus and the beginning of the verse. This teaching approach is consistent with the Kodály method which advocates that the learning of music knowledge and skills should progress with sequence and logic, proceeding “from known to unknown” (Eösze, Houlanah & Tacka, 2009, p. 8). The teacher demonstrates immediately on her instrument and repeats a couple of times, stressing the connecting point. Providing students with a framework of the upcoming learning content, including the emphasis of the most difficult task which is demonstrated by the teacher, helps students clarify their practising targets and the expectations to be met.

“We will get to [the connecting point] in a minute; let’s learn When the Saints Go Marching In first”, the teacher explains to the class. The letter names of the tune are then written on the whiteboard, up and down, close or far apart, shaped in accordance with the pitches and rhythms. The class is asked to follow the notes whilst listening to the teacher’s twice repeated demonstration. This pedagogical strategy enables students to visualize the targeted music and makes their listening to the teacher’s demonstration more purposeful. Compared to staff notation, this way of notating music is suitable for glockenspiel playing as it is more direct and easier to follow. Consequently, it enables students to locate and present the notes on the instruments easily and accurately. “Listen please”, the teacher calls for students’ attention every time when she gets to the third line which contains more notes and rhythms with greater difficulty. The actual
learning of the new tune begins with the singing of letter names in rhythms. The teacher, again, makes sure that every student is sitting upright before they start. After a few times of running through the tune with emphasis on the difficult line led by the teacher, the class is then asked to challenge themselves by adding the chorus in. The teacher reminds students to pay extra attention to the connection between the chorus and the beginning of the verse. “That was fantastic!” the teacher happily exclaims. She continues, “Just before you go away to practise all that on your instruments, if you still have trouble with this part of it (pointing to the connecting point on the whiteboard), don’t worry, we’ll come back to it later”. The teacher’s statement reassures the students, particularly, those who are struggling, so that they can expect further direction from the teacher afterwards if they need it. The class is told that it is a very long piece, containing several different tunes with chorus in between, and therefore, they need to master the chorus and the first verse in order to make the whole piece run smoothly in the end.

Before the glockenspiel practice, the teacher turns to the whiteboard again, saying, “One thing I didn’t go through with you last time is [the rhythmic syllables] which most of you have already learnt in previous years”. The music teacher is well aware that there is a minority of students in the class who have just enrolled in the school and did not have any music education in previous schools. Therefore, the purpose of reviewing the rhythm names is not only for the sake of refreshing the knowledge of the old students, but also introducing the rhythm names to those newly enrolled students who did not have any prior acquisition of the knowledge. She explains, “In pretty much all the music that I do with you, ta (I) is the beat. There are other notes that can be the beat, but you won’t see them now”. She demonstrates to the class how the beat stays the same all the way through the music. “When I got two notes to put in that space, I got titi (II)”. She quickly shows the class how titi is developed from ta and the difference between the two
rhythms. She then goes through the same procedure for the production of *tika tika* (III). This teaching process is an illustration of the standard practice of the Kodály method in primary classroom music education. This is so because the rhythmic syllables, along with the stick notations, are two vital features of the Hungarian approach (Eösze et al., 2009, p. 8). The music teacher then asks questions of the children, “The other one that we’ve got there - see the symbol? It’s for *sah* (Z). Who knows the other name of *sah*, as a musician?” A couple of students provide the correct answer. Asking a question of this nature reveals the teacher’s intention to avoid losing those old students’ attention, as they already knew the basic knowledge of rhythm names, by engaging them with challenging questions. As she is drawing the sign, she says expressively, “*Sah* is a rest [and that’s] what it looks like in the music, no sound. And by next week, this piece of music will be moved into five lines and four spaces on the board as complete music”. Rhythm syllables, as “expressions of duration” are regarded as effective teaching tools in the Kodály method, enabling students to read rhythmic patterns accurately (Choksy, 2000, p. 12). Based on a firm understanding of the duration, students are required to learn both the “theoretical and rhythm names” (KMEIA, 2011, p. 1). The teacher’s explanation provides useful information that students will be able to apply in the following lesson.

After running through the rhythm names, the class is about to start their practice on glockenspiels. Students are asked to pair up with their preferred partners and name themselves ‘player one’ or ‘player two’. Each of the new students who were absent in the previous class is deliberately assigned to a student who knows what to do in order to secure the quality of their practice. Player ones line up to get the instruments whilst player twos are getting the beaters. The whole procedure of preparing the class for their practice is a routine process for students, completed in an orderly and efficient manner. It is clear to the observer that they have followed this lesson
structure before. The class is given five minutes for their first round practice. Meanwhile, the teacher walks around from one pair to the next, making sure the practice is going well and paying extra attention to individuals who require specific assistance. All students are asked to use the beater sticks when practising, and only to use the beaters when led by the teacher. This strategy is suitable for glockenspiel practice in large-sized classes, such as this one, in order to avoid the interruptions caused by the volume of noise.

The teacher then provides feedback for the first round practice, complimenting on the positives but also pointing out a commonly occurring problem. According to her observations, many students are developing a habit of counting the beat loudly whilst playing. She mimics the problematic way of practice in a slightly exaggerated manner, and then comments, “That’s not actually what I have in mind. I thought we might keep [the beat] inside [our head]”. Her graphic demonstration spoken in a soft voice effectively sends the intended message to all students, helping them correct the problem without too much effort. This strategy proves one of Orff’s beliefs, claiming that the experience of melodic and rhythmic learning should enable students “to develop an understanding and feel for music”, and such experience should be presented by the teacher in an interesting and stimulating way (Webster, 1997, p. 55). She then immediately demonstrates the correct way to practise which does not contain any counting actions. “In fact”, she explains, “I do not want to see you say [the beat] and I certainly don’t want to hear you say [the beat] in the end. But for now, if you need to whisper [the beat], you can” [italics indicate particular emphasis]. The teacher realizes that it takes some time for students to correct the beat counting habit and a complete ban of the action may cause other problems. She therefore chooses the timing words “in the end” and the action “whisper” to make allowance for the problem to extinguish gradually. The teacher asks player ones to listen carefully to her instruction then echo
back to her line-by-line demonstration. When it gets to the difficult line, the teacher asks the same group of students to listen twice to her playing and pay extra attention to the note she finishes on. Because this line contains more notes than other lines, the teacher breaks it into two small lines. By doing this, students are given only a small number of notes to play at a time in order to ensure the accuracy of both the notes and rhythms, and therefore, avoid a cluttered situation involving “all sorts of problems”. This teaching strategy correlates to another one of Orff’s beliefs, expounding that “as music notation is an abstract art, the concepts are taught in small sections which allows for revision and consolidation before proceeding” (Webster, 1993, p. 55). The teacher explains that, musically, it is not a good spot to break the music but her teaching experience has proven that this way of learning does produce a more effective result. This is so, because when the first small line is firmly acquired by the students, the addition of the second small line becomes much easier, thus, the whole line can be smoothly played by all students within a short time. The music teacher further explains that according to her observations, the same strategy is also utilized extensively in English as Second Language (ESL) teaching and foreign language teaching. She continues, “Teaching notes is not always that easy, and I want [the students] to get it right at the first time ‘cos as soon as they get it wrong, the wrong bit will start to imprint, [making it] very hard later on”. The music teacher’s style of teaching demonstrates, firstly, her extensive experience in the field of primary school music education; and secondly, her keenness in observing and incorporating other teaching strategies used in subjects other than music.

Through the practice with both player ones and player twos, the teacher continuously provides students encouragement in conjunction with her greater expectations for their next round of practice. Her positive manner influences the students accordingly, and at the same time helps
students build greater confidence for their following practice and performance. Before the lesson ends, the teacher asks the class - player ones and twos - to take turns in playing from the chorus till the end of verse one with backing track. She states, “Player one, if you get lost in *When the Saints Go Marching In*, stop, wait till the music finishes, then we pass it on to player two”. The class follows the teacher’s instruction and completes the task with the backing track successfully. The teacher happily comments, “That was really good”! She then briefly introduces the learning contents for the following lesson and dismisses the class. Students line up again quietly to put the instruments and beaters back neatly before leaving the music room.

To sum up, in contrast to the concerns reported in *NRSME* (DEST, 2005), stating that “Where state school programs do exist they are often not of a continuous, sequential or developmental nature”, the music program at Happy Rock Primary School provides an evident model of a successfully operated music education system at a government primary school. Classroom teaching plays a significant role in the entire school music program. The transcription of these two classes exemplifies a number of significant areas that the music specialist practises and demonstrates in her classroom music teaching. Firstly, her teaching method is based upon an extensive adoption and adaptation of the Kodály and the Orff approaches in conjunction with her inventiveness according to the needs of the class. Secondly, the teacher’s positive and encouraging teaching style is conducive to creating a learning environment that enhances students’ confidence and helps students value music more. Thirdly, the varying tone of her talking voice and expressive demonstrations maximize students’ engagement throughout the lesson, whilst providing an optimal model for students to follow. Fourthly, the teacher’s professionalism as both a musician and teacher enables the delivery of her knowledge and skills to be performed efficaciously, and therefore ensures desirable learning results from students.
Last but not least, the music teacher’s keenness in observing and adapting teaching strategies used in other school subjects enhances her own teaching practice, optimizing her teaching outcomes. The *NRSME* (DEST, 2005) states that in order to improve music education, a teaching approach that is well-structured, comprehensive, and accommodates the interests and needs of students must be provided in the school. The music specialist’s teaching approach more than satisfies the standards stipulated by the *NRSME*, and at the same time, is one which could be easily adopted and followed by other music classes at other schools, on the proviso that the teachers have equivalent music training background.

2. **Choral program**

Singing has been identified as a major focus of school music education. The *NRSME* (DEST, 2005) stated that voice is a natural instrument which every child is imbued with and “it is instantly accessible, flexible and useful for learning … [so that] every Australian child should participate and engage in “initial vocal music programms” (p. 124). The Victorian Music Workshop also recognizes the need for developing singing activities as a vital component of school music education, utilizing methods that are sequential and developmental in order to increase the emphasis on supporting singing programs in schools (SMAG, 2007). The music specialist at HPS regards singing as the heart of her program. Apart from the extensive incorporation in classroom teaching, the emphasis of singing is demonstrated even more clearly in the successful running of the three school choirs, Year 3 / 4 Choir, Year 5 /6 Choir, and the Chamber Choir. The music specialist believes that “Choir is the ‘flagship’ of the school and quality is the first priority when running a choir program” (MSI, 12. 06. 2012). She recalls one of the Australian leading choir conductor’s words which have strongly influenced her: “If you are serious about choirs, take them off lunch time” (MSI, 12. 06. 2012). The first step the music
specialist took to establish her own choir program at HPS was to persuade the school Principal to place choirs in normal class time rather than lunch time, and this scheduling approach has been maintained up until this very day.

The Year 3 /4 Choir is compulsory for every student enrolled in those year levels. Apart from attending their weekly classroom music program, students are also required to participate in a choir session once a week for 50 minutes. The choir used to run on a voluntary basis. In the first two weeks of every year, all Years 3 and 4 students were invited to join the music teacher for some trial experience. Students who were willing to continue their participation would then become the final members of the choir, and those who decided not to join in would remain in their classroom and work on the projects given by the classroom teacher. This approach of recruiting the choir members on a voluntary basis, which allows students’ freedom of choice, enables them to more value their participation in the choir and enjoy their experience for the duration. Some time ago, the coordinator of Years 3 and 4 once listened to the trial singing and was so impressed with their work, she suggested that they should all stay and become members of the choir. Subsequently, all students stayed and from that moment on, this choir had become compulsory for everybody at the year levels and “has worked really well” to this very day (MSI, 15. 12. 2011). Whilst the compulsory mode of running the program takes away students’ freedom of choice, it does provide them the opportunity to more fully realise their potential, cultivate their interest, and develop their vocal skills. It also provides an opportunity for the music teacher to extend the musical engagement of the children, beyond that offered by the class music lessons. There are more than 120 students in the current 3 / 4 choir, requiring the music teacher to invite two classroom teachers each time to come along and assist in “crowd control” (MTI, 15. 12. 2011). The classroom teachers can bring some work to do, otherwise they are free
to relax and enjoy themselves. This strategy enables the music teacher to focus more on the demands of the program, whilst providing classroom teachers the opportunity to be involved in the music program. The 3 / 4 choir mainly performs in their annual school concerts, shopping-centre performances, and the One Day One Song\textsuperscript{13} program. The music specialist regards the 3 / 4 Choir as the ‘backbone’ of the Years 2 / 3 / 4 Concert which is usually held in November each year.

Once the Years 3 / 4 compulsory choir program is completed, choir participation for Years 5 and 6 students becomes voluntary. It is run on a weekly basis and it, too, is scheduled for 50 minutes during class time. The classroom teachers divide their classes according to students’ preferences for either participating in the choir, or staying in the classroom for other projects. The 5 / 6 Choir is made available for all Year 5 and 6 students who are interested in singing or choral activities. There are over 90 students involved in the current 5 / 6 Choir, amongst which, the majority of students are from the previous year’s 3 / 4 Choir, some newly enrolled students to the school often being seen as well. Like 3 / 4 Choir, the size of the 5 / 6 Choir is comparatively large, hence, their limited participation in performances is usually seen in annual school concerts, shopping centre performances, and the One Day One Song program. Like the 3 / 4 Choir, the 5 / 6 Choir is the major support of the Years Prep / 1/ 5 / 6 Concert which is also held once a year but usually in September. The Music specialist concludes that the 3 / 4 Choir and the 5/ 6 Choir “do sing at different occasions as the need arises and always from the basis for their own concert” (MSI, 12. 06. 2012).

The Chamber Choir is audition-based. The music specialist starts auditioning at the end of Year 4, but newly enrolled Year 6 students are also welcome to be auditioned at any time. The current

\textsuperscript{13} Australia’s largest federal government supported simultaneous school music event since 2007.
membership in the Chamber Choir is 30 with a fairly even gender balance. Students in this choir gather on very Monday from 3pm - 3.45pm. The school finishes at 3.30pm but the choir is required to stay for an extra 15 minutes because according to the music specialist, “we need the extra time otherwise we will never be as good as we want” (MSI, 12. 06. 2012). At the beginning, the Chamber Choir was scheduled on Monday morning after the School Assembly, but it was not suitable “because the Assembly sometimes runs over so we lose a lot of time. I then had a good talk with the Assistant Principal, so we moved it to Monday afternoon and it’s now working very well” (MSI, 12. 06. 2012). This choir participates in almost all performances within and beyond the school community, simply because “They are the best, they are the oldest, and they are the smallest in size” (MSI, 12. 06. 2012). Apart from the aforementioned performances that 3/4 Choir and 5/6 Choir participate in, the Chamber Choir is also involved in other activities, such as the annual Violin Concert at HPS, Education Week Concert (which is run by the Education Department once a year), School of Rock (which also runs annually, involving other 15 to 16 schools), the Warm Winter Voices Concert (which is organized by local educational institutions), and other concerts or public performances within the local area. The music specialist has a special policy requiring all Chamber Choir members to be part of the 5/6 Choir. She explains,

Firstly, I can’t see the reason why the best voices [in these year levels] are not in the 5/6 Choir. Secondly they get to sing twice in the choir, so that means more practice for us which is always needed. And if someone says ‘Give us a concert’, we can easily pull out some songs from the 5/6 Choir repertoire combined with our Chamber Choir repertoire, so we’ll have twice as much repertoire (MSI, 12. 06. 2012).
It is interesting to note that all students in the top violin group are members of the Chamber Choir. The music specialist’s explanation for this is that “I tend to see that good musicians are good at all music areas” (MSI, 12. 06. 2012).

**Conclusion**

According to the teaching aims suggested in the recently released the *Shape of the Australian Curriculum: The Arts* (ACARA, 2011), students at Years 3 and 4 are to enhance their music knowledge, compositional skills, and notating abilities. At Happyrock Primary School, Year 3 students in 2012 are required to consolidate and revise basic rhythm names including quaver rest, focus on time and accent in music reading and writing, and compose ‘train music’ in accordance with the term classroom learning-theme. In the current Year 4 level, knowledge of Mozart’s music, excerpts from musicals, and 12-Bar Blues patterns becomes the focal point of classroom music. The improvising and composing tasks are the extensions of the learning of 12-Bar Blues patterns. Students are also involved in conversational-based composing activities using glockenspiels and two non-tuned percussion instruments. The compositions are completed by students in groups of three or four, recorded on the music teacher’s laptop computer, and compiled into CDs for students to keep. In the recent national curriculum, students at Years 3 and 4 are to be involved in singing, instrument playing and moving to music. Students are also encouraged to share opinions on their understanding of music concepts as well as on their own and others’ compositions through listening and the use of music terminologies. At HPS, music appreciation is an important part of the music program at every year level. Year 3 students are involved in various types of music appreciation, including recorder music which becomes the
learning tasks for later recorder playing as well as the music for the term classroom learning-theme. Music appreciation for Year 4 students at HPS focuses on Mozart music and music sections selected from musicals. Students are encouraged to use learnt musical terms to discuss the form, style and other basic elements involved in appreciation tasks.

In the recent national curriculum, improvisation, composition and performance are suggested as the focal components of music teaching in Years 5 and 6. Abilities in music literacy, aural skills and music language are to be continuously developed. In music appreciation, students are expected to identify key features of their listening and performing tasks. At HPS, students at these year levels are involved in extensive composing and performing activities. Glockenspiels are still the major instruments in assisting compositions amongst groups of three or four students. Evaluation of other groups’ work is encouraged to be discussed in musical terminology within the class. A wider range of music concepts and elements are learnt, practised and implemented in students’ improvising, composing and performing tasks.

It is fair to conclude that the teaching aims suggested in the recent national curriculum are not only reflected in the music curriculum in HPS but also at an optimal level. In terms of implementing the curriculum, the music specialist sees the need for adjusting her lesson plans without diverging from the core objective in order to accommodate students’ special needs, class individuality, term classroom learning-themes, and school events. Nevertheless, compared to the national standards, the music curriculum at HPS is more than satisfactory.

This chapter focused on the discussion of the classroom music teaching program which is a significant part of the music program in Happyrock Primary School. The school’s choral program was also outlined. In the next chapter, an effective and sophisticated instrumental
program will become the centre of the discussion. In addition, the observations of two violin classes chosen as representative examples to illustrate the teaching and organizing practices used in the school’s feature program are presented: the violin groups.
Chapter Eight

The Instrumental Program at HPS

In this chapter there will be a discussion of the selected primary school’s instrumental program with a focus on its violin teaching component.

Introduction

The instrumental program at Happyrock Primary School (HPS) was not in existence until the current music specialist’s arrival at the school as the pre-existing music program was mainly classroom-based in conjunction with a small amount of singing activities. It was the current music specialist who persuaded the then school Principal to incorporate instrumental learning in the school music program. She did so because, primarily, teaching certain types of instruments was her expertise and, more importantly, advocating instrumental learning at primary level had always been a vital part of her educational philosophy. This belief is reinforced by Griffiths (2011), who states that, “instrumental learning gives all young people opportunities to express the sense of achievement and enjoyment that comes from making individual progress in the context of making music together” (p. Foreword). Furthermore, Schenck (1989) asserted that instrumental learning benefits young children’s development at both creative and personal levels.

Since its inception, the instrumental program has been very well established, and is now developing towards a more sophisticated and multi-dimensional approach. The HPS instrumental program is proud of being purely and wholly self-created and operated by the music teacher with a small, yet, valuable level of input from a violin specialist when conducting the violin groups. The instrumental program also happens to share some similarities with the Whole
Class Instrumental and Vocal Teaching (WCIVT), an innovative music teaching approach at primary level in England which encompasses a vast range of music learning elements and is delivered through instrumental and vocal activities. Such an approach is renowned for being able to facilitate ‘whole class’ instrumental music learning, breaking away from traditional formal instrumental teaching, which admittedly has enjoyed a long history of being the most effective way of establishing performing skills, but is only available for a limited number of students (Beach, Evans & Spruce, 2011). At Happyrock Primary School the average class size is 22 students, with instrumental learning incorporated as part of the classroom music program at all levels. Apart from the learning of a few specific types of instruments, the instruments most frequently used in the class are the Orff tuned and assorted non-tuned percussion. According to the music specialist, these percussion instruments are used in classroom teaching at certain stages, and also help with taking “the pressure off the boys because some of their voices are already changing” (MTI, 15. 12. 2011).

There are three major instruments involved in the program are violin, recorder and guitar.

1. The violin program

   (1) Introduction

The reasons for choosing violin as the core instrument for the instrumental program at HPS were, firstly, because the music teacher is very experienced in school violin programs, and secondly, because it is more affordable in terms of the school’s budget. This practicality is substantiated by Beach et al. (2011) who state that, “the violin proved a popular school instrument because it was inexpensive and portable” (p. 7).
Prior to the music specialist’s arrival at Happyrock Primary School, there was a violin program which was supported by the department. The teacher who ran the program was from the neighbouring high school and hoped that her teaching at HPS would help with preparing students for their further violin learning at secondary level. The current music specialist went to great lengths to convince the then Principal, both verbally and in writing, about the possibility of continuing and enhancing the violin program. After receiving the Principal’s approval to operate the program the music teacher contacted the current violin specialist whom she had known very well and worked with at previous schools since 1982. The reason for inviting the violin specialist to come on board was not only because she was considered to be a brilliant violinist and an experienced teacher, but was also because she was constantly involved in intensive workshops, conferences and likewise activities to keep her teaching skills up-to-date. The violin specialist is contracted to teach violin classes at HPS every Wednesday, four terms a year. She usually arrives at school at 10am to tune all the violins and commences teaching from 11am till 5 o’clock in the afternoon.

The current violin program has been running at the school for at least six years, and is operated in a ‘User Pays’ system which means the parents of the enrolled students are expected to financially support their children’s tuition. Each lesson costs $10 AUD, with a 10% discount if the yearly amount is paid in full. Out of the $10 every week, $8 is for the tuition and $2 is for violin hire. If a student chooses to bring his/her own, a 20% reduction in fees is applicable. The violin program is self-funding and any profit made is negligible. Apart from the 20 violins left from the previous violin teacher all the rest of the instruments and music were purchased by the music specialist.
According to the violin specialist, a total number of nine groups have been arranged for around 56 students who are from different year levels and enrolled in the current violin program. The groups are named according to different colours. The Red Group is regarded as the top group which currently consists of six students who are from different grade levels and play violin very well. This group of students are often invited to join the school chamber choir for participation in outside school performances within the local community. The Green Group and the Orange Group are for beginners, involving a total number of 18 students from Grade 3 classes. There are also 16 students enrolled in their second year of violin learning, being placed in the Gold Group and the Purple Group. Six Grade 6 students enrolled in the Blue Group are currently completing their third year of violin learning at school and are enjoying the title of the Second Best in the entire program. The duration of each violin lesson is half-an-hour, involving eight to twelve students at a time. Most of the lessons are held during school time, however, some students come back at lunch time for either catch-up lessons or advanced training. The violin specialist is getting paid for part of her lunch time to provide those extra tuitions when needed.

In each lesson, both teachers stand at the front 3 metres apart so that they are fully visible to the entire class. Both teachers are constantly making sure every student knows what to do and how to do it properly. All students are trained to play from memory after listening to the music and the instructions from the teachers. This teaching method is consistent with Orff’s belief, claiming “Children should always play from memory – only this will guarantee a maximum of freedom” (Landis & Carder, 1972, p. 96). Students are very well behaved and fully engaged because the classes consist not only of violin learning, but also singing, rhythm games, etc. The purpose of including other music elements in violin classes is to provide students with a comprehensive understanding of the music they learn in order to make their violin learning more interesting and
easier. This observation is consistent with Griffiths (2011), who states that within a successful music teaching system, “individual technical and music skills are nurtured within the context of developing all aspects of what it is to be musical”, and such an educational perspective has been demonstrated by the violin program at Happyrock Primary School (p. Foreword).

According to the violin specialist there is also an after-school program in operation wherein three groups totalling 10 students who all graduated from HPS, come back to the school every Wednesday to continue their violin learning at 3.30pm and 4pm. Several Year 6 students who are currently enrolled in the violin program have also expressed interest in coming back to join the after-school program as a continuation of their violin learning after their graduation. The school Principal has been very supportive towards the violin program as well as the after school component. This is so because the students “look good” and their music sounds good whenever they are on stage. The secondary school students’ participation in concerts and performances at HPS is considered to be an effective role model for the primary students in terms of encouraging them to learn violin and to continue doing so. The school’s violin program is run by both the violin specialist and the school music teacher, who is also a fine violinist, but the after-school program is operated by the violin specialist only. Over the years, both the teaching experience at HPS and the partnership she enjoyed with the music teacher at previous schools have given the violin specialist the realization that the complexity of violin teaching can be successfully simplified when supported by a well structured, comprehensive and efficacious classroom music program. This simplification occurs because the exploration of a variety of music elements in classroom music learning accelerates students’ violin learning progress and is therefore more enjoyable. This is further exemplified in the after-school program in which the students once managed to learn a piece of Harry Potter music with very complicated finger positions,
containing a number of special notes which were completely new to the students. With the fine aural skills developed through classroom music learning, the students are able to identify the sounds with inner hearing before successfully locating the notes on the instrument. In her own words, the violin specialist explains that, “they can do it because they can hear what they are supposed to do and that translates to working it out and finding it on the violin” (VSI, 23. 11. 2011). This approach is comparable to the WCIVT, which not only aims to build a student’s performing skills, but also focuses on developing the student’s musical learning abilities in composing, improvising, and critical listening within a large group or the whole class (Beach et al., 2011).

In terms of implementing a violin program at primary schools, the violin specialist believes that, at schools, a “violin [program] is very popular to start in groups because you can have such large groups all at once and they are portable and if you stick to it you’ll make orchestras very easy” (VSI, 23. 11. 2011). This belief can be considered a reflection of the WCIVT approach which has progressed from the traditional model in such a way that it enables the new approach to accommodate the instrumental learning capacity of large groups or whole classes (Beach, Evans & Spruce, 2011).

Based upon her expertise and previous teaching experience, the music teacher some six years ago decided to make violin tuition available only for students at Years 3 and above. This is so because Year 3 is considered a good age for children to commence instrumental learning, and it also coincides with the progression of the Kodály teaching method. However, it is anticipated that the violin program will expand to include some Year 2 students who are capable of violin learning at this level, and this will only be possible when circumstances permit, e.g. when a suitable sponsor is procured with the Principal’s endorsement.
The Principal is very proud of the school’s violin program and extremely impressed with the students’ performance. In his own words, the program is “actually having an effect on what the kids can do, and all you have to do is to listen to the violins they play… and it brings tears to your eyes” (PI, 17. 08. 2011). He passionately believes that the skill his students learn through violin learning is an achievement in itself, and cites proudly the case of two of his students who are struggling in numeracy and literacy, yet are playing the violin well. He substantiates his belief by calling upon examples of those students who are ‘loners’ in the playground, yet come to life, interacting “when performing as part of a violin group” (PI, 17. 08. 2011). When he sees these benefits he believes these children have successfully found their niche, giving “them a sense of achievement” whilst developing “their self-esteem” (PI, 17. 08. 2011). This is consistent with Griffiths (2011) who believes that learning of an instrument provides young students with a sense of self-satisfaction in terms of achievement.

Success through achievement can be attributed to effective motivation. The librarian at HPS expresses her belief that a good music teacher, primarily, must be a good musician and a ‘motivator’, and this belief can be substantiated by the music teacher’s violin program. The violin program plays a vital role in the school’s entire music education and was initially “pushed by [the music teacher]” because “she ‘wants’ our children to be learning violin” (LI, 23. 11. 2011).

(2) Violin class observation No. 1

Green Group (11 beginners) 11.35am to 12.05pm

This is the first violin lesson for the eleven newly enrolled students in 2012. Both the violin specialist and the music teacher, also a skilled violinist, are present as the lesson is team taught.
At 11.30am students start to walk into the music room in an obvious state of excitement with their first-time tuition. A few of them ask the violin specialist if she knows their siblings who either still learn violin here or used to be in the violin groups before graduation. It is quite evident that the school’s violin program has enjoyed an excellent reputation which enables the program to continue year after year. The violin specialist’s affirmative response has the effect of encouraging students, which seems to make them more secure with the program because they feel that the teacher cares about every student in the group and remembers them very well. This group consists of eleven beginners from Grade 3 classes and has been named the Green Group. Students’ name tags have been made out of green coloured paper and laminated by the music specialist beforehand and are handed out to be pinned on students’ jumpers at the beginning of the class. Violins are lined up on the floor in the green zone and each of them has already had a student’s name and number written down in white pen. The preparation for the beginners’ class is well structured, and is the product of considerable effort. This effort appears to the observer to be very worthwhile as the students first encounter a warm-up activity that includes unpacking the violin case, positioning the violin in both holding and resting modes, fitting in the shoulder rest appropriately, and learning a simple tune on D string.

The violin specialist greets the students and congratulates them on their enrolment in the program. The warm welcome makes the beginners feel specially treated and proud of being a member of the group that has its own identity, the Green Group. Once the students are seated in two rows facing the whiteboard, the violin specialist draws their attention to the importance of having enough space between them because the “violin is coming to join [them] very soon”. The teacher’s regard for the violins has the effect of instilling in the students a profound respect for what is an otherwise an inanimate object. The teacher’s use of this form of child psychology
creates an imaginative if not theatrical engaging and entertaining learning environment. The teacher then shows the class her violin and reminds the students that the violins they are expecting will be smaller than hers in order to suit their age and body size. When it is announced that they are going to play a tune on the violin at the end of the lesson, the class is overjoyed. The children’s excitement becomes even more evident when the teacher announces that they will be allowed to take the violins home on the same day after school. These statements further stimulate the students’ interest, making them look forward to the rest of the lesson. One of the boys claims that he has his own violin at home which pleases the teacher, prompting her to ask him to bring the violin to school in the following week to ensure its size is appropriate. The boy is also assured that he will still be getting a violin for that lesson. The assurance of providing the boy a violin for the first lesson reveals the teacher’s professionalism in treating every student equally and not letting any one miss out on any learning opportunities. Further, she demonstrates her experience by asking to see the instrument from home to ascertain if it is appropriate.

Before introducing the violin, the violin specialist waits for the class to be completely silent in order to draw the students’ attention to the topic. She tells the class that through the first lesson they will learn how to unpack the violin case, how to put the violin away, and how to look after the violin. A boy says excitedly that he already knows what is in the case. The teacher turns toward him and in a friendly manner, responds by saying “Good, then you must have known that you can’t leave the violin in the sunlight, and never leave your violin in the car or near the window where the sun gets straight in”. The boy’s facial expression is one of surprise and then of acknowledgement. This teaching strategy demonstrates the violin specialist’s friendly and respectful teaching manner as well as her extensive teaching experience in terms of
understanding the way children think. At the same time, the teacher also sends the message to the rest of the class about violin care.

To further explain the care of violin, the violin specialist asks the class what violins are made of. Most of the class responds with the right answer, wood, and almost immediately they realize why they are told not to leave the violin exposed to sunlight. The teacher confirms that the direct sunlight will make the wood bend out of shape. Despite the fact that most students appear to know the reason for avoiding direct sunlight, the teacher’s further explanation on the answer helps the few who need clarification on the issue. The subject then moves to the basic structure of the violin, including four strings, tuning pegs, neck and shoulder of the violin. The violin specialist draws the attention of the whole class by saying in a rather serious tone that “If your violin sounds funny at home, bring it straight back the next day and we will fix it for you. Never try and fix it yourself because there is a chance that the strings will be broken”. The teacher’s serious intonation is used appropriately as it helps emphasize care and maintenance of the instrument. Strings and tuning pegs are also introduced to the class in the way of question and answer. Instead of using direct instruction, the violin specialist prefers to question students about the new knowledge and analyzes different answers before providing or revealing the correct one. Students are then asked about which shoulder the violin should be sitting on and they respond with two different answers. The teacher addresses those students whose answer is “right shoulder” and explains that these students have the answer in reverse because they saw her putting the violin on the left shoulder but forgot that she stands opposite to the class. The class is then asked to tap on their left shoulders repeatedly. This is a good example of the teacher’s question and answer style of teaching. She addresses students’ different answers to her question by analysing them together with the class. This pedagogy enables students to hear their peers’
opinions, understand why some answers are incorrect, and helps them to better remember the
correct answer. She is careful never to say that an answer is wrong which would create a
negative feeling in the children, rather she responds to answers in an open manner, encouraging
all but confirming the correct responses.

The violin specialist passes the next part of the lesson to the music teacher whilst asking the class
to turn around facing the green storing zone. The music teacher uses one student’s violin as an
element to demonstrate the procedure of unpacking the violin case. Students are reminded that
their name-tags are green in order to locate their violins in the green zone. This reminder makes
students further realise that their green name tags serve more purposes than just revealing their
names, as they also identify their group colour, helping them locate and store their violins.

Before the music teacher opens the case, she reminds the class that some violins may look a bit
different from others but they all function in the same way. This explanation is required as it
prevents the possibility of a chaotic situation developing later on, as caused by students’
curiosity or confusion. She demonstrates the steps of unpacking the violin case, such as making
sure the side with the little strap is facing the player, pulling the strap, unzipping one side,
unzipping the other side, and finally opening up. The whole procedure is presented
enthusiastically by the teacher and spoken in a tone that both entertains and intrigues the students.

Her teaching manner makes a simple and, otherwise unexciting learning segment interesting and
engaging. Also the explanations by both teachers help to establish from the outset good care
practices for the instruments. This is particularly important as the children are permitted to take
the violins home. The music teacher stresses the point that the bow is not provided in the case,
and that the class will be learning violin without a bow till the end of the term. If any student
finds a bow placed in the case, he or she needs to hand it in. According to the music teacher, the
reason for learning without a bow is to establish a solid foundation for the correct holding position which is vital for violin learning. Accomplishing the correct holding position requires extensive practice in positioning, shaping and angling, and therefore needs to take the entire term to achieve. In her own words “we need a very good set up at the beginning” in order to make the future learning develop smoothly and successfully. Another reason for learning without the bow is to secure a pleasant sound on the instrument from the outset. Students are taught to play simple tunes by plucking the strings (pizzicato) and are required to pay extra attention to the accuracy of each note they pluck. The teacher explained that, “the sound would be horrible if you give them the bow at the same time” whilst they are struggling with positioning the violin, “and the parents won’t be happy and the kids will lose interest”. However, learning to use the bow is not completely excluded from the first term teaching. Students are given a drinking straw each to practise with, first in holding position, then in moving position. The music they learn in pizzicato mode will be repeated in the second term and played with the bow.

The next section of the lesson involves asking students to take the violin out and to try fitting the shoulder-rest in the most comfortable position. As the music teacher demonstrates, she explains “some of you may find the small side sits better and others might want to turn it around and try the bigger side until you find the best place for you”. Students are then given a violin each to practise unpacking and fitting the shoulder-rest in. Following the teacher’s instruction, which again, is said in a lively manner, every student appears to be enjoyably focused on their task. She also tells the students that they will be playing violin with a music stand in front of them, complete with music sheets, but not in the first lesson. In the following five minutes or so, both teachers walk around the class and assist students to make sure everyone knows what to do and in the correct way. The music teacher emphasizes that the students will need to have their name
tags on for at least another two weeks so that the first thing for the students to do is to put the name tag on when they walk into the music room. The importance of the name tags is reinforced and the time frame of three weeks is a suitable period of time for the students to become familiar with their group colour and the violin storing section. It also gives the specialist violin teacher time to learn individual students’ names.

Before starting the following section of the lesson, the violin specialist says to the class “I’m really pleased to see that everybody’s following the instructions without making any noises.” Having given positive reinforcement to appropriate behaviour, she then teaches the students about the neck and the shoulder of the violin and asks students to hold the violin on its shoulder rather than the neck in the first few weeks. Students are then told to put their violin on the left shoulder and the chin on the chin-rest. The violin specialist reinforces the point by saying “Please hold the violin on its shoulder so you won’t have to stretch your arms for a while”. The teacher’s facial expression and body language make her instructions even easier to follow and help the students remember the temporary, yet, primary holding position. The teacher says, “We have four strings on the violin and we are going to play one of them today, and it’s called D”. She sings the last few words in the pitch of D whilst plucking the D string. By doing this, the teacher is introducing and demonstrating the working task, whilst at the same time she is also trying to develop the students’ aural skills. The training of aural skills is vital and is emphasized throughout the entire Kodály method, a method which pays strict attention to “the development of music in the inner ear – the aural imagination” (Russell-Smith, 1976, p. 83). Meanwhile, a couple of students are still trying to find a comfortable place to rest their violin. So the teacher immediately addresses the issue by saying “A good way to position your violin is to find the button on the bottom near the chin rest, [putting] your finger on the button and [brining] it
around to the bump next to your neck. Remember, the violin stays at an angle of 45 degrees”.
The teacher’s instant recognition of the problem and reaction to it and the strategy she provides,
reveal her well-developed teaching manner and responsible teaching attitude, enabling all
students to stay at the same level with no one falling behind at the starting point. She then asks
students to follow her to hold the violin in resting position. “Very good”, the teacher says happily.
“Now we are going to play a song and it goes like this D D D sah, D D D sah, D D D sah, Rest 2
3 4”. The class then sings the tune twice led by the teacher. Singing is extensively involved in the
violin program at this school and the learning of each new tune or piece commences with the
singing of it. This is comparable with one of Kodály’s underlying tenets, claiming that singing is
the most effective and natural way of learning music because human “voice is the most intimate
and universal of instruments” (Eösze, 2009, p. 8; Capitanio, 2003). All students in this group
who are from Grade 3 classes are able to sing in letter names, some singing names and basic
rhythm names because their classroom music lessons have prepared them well up to this level.

Within the hearing of the children, the music teacher stands aside and happily says to the violin
specialist “They are going to be so good!” The violin specialist shows agreement by repeating
the statement with enthusiasm. She then asks the students to try putting their violins back on
again and to find the right string for the note D by plucking through all four strings whilst
humming the note. Developing students’ aural training is one of the focal points of the Kodály
method, and is an aspect of instrumental teaching. The violin specialist’s direction for students to
locate the particular string via singing and listening is an obvious component of aural training.
Kodály believes that through singing “the ear could best be trained to distinguish intervals and to
keep the young musician in tune” (Landis & Carder, 1972, p. 50).
Before the children locate the particular string, the violin specialist reminds the class that she is standing opposite to them, saying “So think carefully before you put your violin on the correct shoulder”. The teacher’s forewarning prevents some students from resting their violins on the wrong shoulder and achieves effective result. The boys are asked to rest whilst the girls locate the correct string and practise the tune on it twice. Both teachers enthusiastically praise the girls’ very first performance. When the boys finish their first round, the teachers also compliment their effort. At two minutes before the class’s ending, the music teacher is making her way to get the students for the next class. Before she leaves the room, she tells the class that they should come back to collect their violin and take it home after school, saying, “Can you please remember to practise [the tune on the D string] everyday? Show mum and dad how it works and make it beautiful”. The homework that the students are given actually involves daily practice of the new tune, but the way the music teacher says it stimulates the students’ interest in practising in front of their parents. Consequently, they will be attempting to not only practise daily but also to the best of their ability. The violin specialist then explains to the class about how to put the violin back in the case and pack everything up. Students’ names are called one by one to their case to pack up. Everyone seems happy when leaving the room.

(3) Violin class observation No. 2

Red Group (6 top students) 11am - 11.30am

After the bell goes students start to arrive for their first violin lesson of the term. Everyone walks in happily and greets the violin specialist with a great deal of respect. The music teacher is in her office doing some preparation in the meantime. The violin specialist starts the lesson by asking the students if they all had a nice holiday. Students happily respond with snippets of their holiday
experiences, creating a class atmosphere that is both relaxed and close-knit. The violin specialist puts a new piece on each stand whilst the students locate their violins in the red zone and quietly get themselves ready for the class. The routine procedure is run automatically and smoothly by the students, demonstrating a good level of discipline in preparation for the lesson ahead. Those who get ready first immediately start to read the new piece and attempt to play the tune on the violin. The initiation of playing by students reveals their interests and enthusiasm in learning the instrument and new pieces. The teacher hears someone’s playing and compliments it. The teacher’s immediate comments demonstrate that the teacher is paying attention to each student’s every movement in the class, recognizing their efforts and encouraging them to continue. The class spends a good five minutes practising their holding positions, whilst the teacher constantly reminds the students of the 45 degree angle and keeping the violin level in line with the nose. At the same time she directs the students to move arms freely, up and down, walking around the class to make sure everyone’s position is comfortable and perfectly correct. The teacher’s meticulous manner not only provides students quality teaching but also conveys to them her high teaching standards in terms of developing a responsible and diligent learning attitude. The teacher also talks to the class with enthusiasm, saying “Wow! We are the top group this year, hey hey hey”! At this, the students seem to bubble with excitement. This encouraging statement helps make this particular lesson, and possibly the entire learning journey throughout the year, more engaging for the students.

The actual learning starts with the routine warm ups of reciting the finger positions rhythmically, containing “D1 D1, D2 D2, D3 D3, D4 D4; D3 D3, D2 D2, D1 D1, harmony” before playing. Soon after they start playing, the violin specialist detects some problems caused by the finger position markers on a particular student’s violin. Whilst fixing up the problems, she strikes up
the topic of the *marker effect* and encourages students to start playing independently to the markers on their violins. She tells the whole class a short story about one of her private students who had been playing violin with markers on for a long time. One day the teacher decided to take the markers off and the student still played in tune. Even when the finger was positioned wrongly, the student was able to adjust the position immediately to get the correct sound. She continues by saying, “So I thought, maybe, students in this group should play without the markers too”. Instead of leaving the whole class waiting in silence while helping a student, the teacher uses the opportunity to regale the class with a simple, yet instructive story, which has the effect of encouraging them to become independent from the violin markers. As a result, a few students are motivated to start playing violin without markers on.

In the routine warm ups, the note D is constantly repeated, so the teacher tells the class to “Remember, your first finger has got some memory - mine has”. This statement proves quite strategic, making it easier for students to put her words into practice. She demonstrates on her violin whilst saying “I’m sure at this stage you all know where your first finger goes; it stays in the same position. If it’s not quite right…your ear will tell you. So let’s go with that idea this time”. The teacher leads the first bar then the class joins in. This teaching segment involves some valuable points. The teacher, firstly, recognizes the effort of the class in knowing the finger positions. Her emphasis of the repeated movement on the first finger is directed at the minority who has forgotten the position over the long summer holiday. She then teaches the class to use their aural skills in order to identify the wrong note on the spot. By doing this, the teacher is also reminding the students of the story she told them about her private student. After the second attempt, the teacher checks with the student who had problems with the markers before to make
sure the problems are rectified. This, again, reveals the teacher’s care for each student, her responsible working attitude, and her thorough teaching style.

Before her introduction on the new task, the teacher asks the students to play the notes D and A, which are used frequently in the new piece, three times respectively. The first thing the teacher goes through with the class is the dynamics in the chorus which is a learning focus of the piece. The procedure is completed with the violin specialist’s usual teaching style - question and answer - which enables students to learn actively rather than passively through direct instruction. The teacher then questions the students about the starting note of the solo part and some of students immediately respond with the right answer. It is worth mentioning that the music was given to everyone in the group prior to the holiday in order for them to have the music organized for the new term. The teacher happily acknowledges the answer as correct and further instructs the class with “So it goes like this: D2 AA 11 A2”. She slowly demonstrates twice on her violin whilst calling out the finger positions, and the class copies twice. The teacher always looks around the class whilst they are playing to make sure every student is fully engaged and knows what to do. She then asks, in sing-song fashion, about the tune, “What’s the next? Anyone know?” A student plays it on the violin and the teacher is evidently pleased, singing “DD1, DD1”. The second bar is referred to as an “echo” of the previous bar to draw the students’ attention towards the soft volume. Using the word echo is very effective in terms of achieving the anticipated soft volume. This strategy is consistent with Capitanio (2003) who states “Echo imitation is a gradual step to allow the child to lead to free improvisation or question and answer, where the child then can respond to the given melodic or rhythmic gestures by improvising a response” (p.6). After the playing of the class, the teacher asks the class to pay attention to the similarities and differences between the first two lines whilst listening to her singing. Once again,
the teacher does not provide direct instruction but asks students to listen and observe. This teaching strategy not only engages students but also trains students’ aural skills and sight-reading abilities. Students immediately realize that the only difference in the second line is the ending. To confirm students’ responses, the teacher chooses to play the second line and draws their attention towards the ending, “Now listen, it goes D2 1 D”, emphasizing the notes. This way of acknowledging students’ correct answer provides the opportunity for students to again, practise their aural skills. In the instructions on the following notes, containing three Ds, the teacher emphasizes the rhythm of the repeated note as in ta titi and asks the class to tap the rhythm on their lap. The stress on the rhythm at this point is very important as the same note is repeated three times and students could easily lose focus on the rhythms. The music teacher stands beside the class and encourages them by saying “It looks good, it sounds good”. The third line is taught the same way by going through the finger positions and rhythm patterns, and repeating the tune twice. The finger positions are constantly called out by the violin specialist while she demonstrates and while the students play. Before the end of this learning section, the violin specialist repeats the structure of the new piece to remind students about the same and different sections. A quick review of the content reinforces students’ understanding and memory of the learning content, and therefore consolidates their learning effort.

The violin specialist plays another piece, and the students immediately recognize the song which they learnt in the previous term. However, the first round of the review on this piece is rather disappointing, so the teacher, again, demonstrates on her violin, line by line, calling out the finger positions and structure of the piece, including the similarities and differences between lines. Despite the students’ performance not meeting her expectations, the teacher always retains her enthusiasm and instructs the class with words of encouragement. This teaching manner is
reflected in *NRSME* (DEST, 2005), where it is stated that, “The most consistent factor contributing to the success of school music programmes was the commitment, dedication and enthusiasm of teachers” (p. 69).

By the third round of review, the students are able to master the piece. The teacher then points out to the class that “Whenever I say the finger positions, [a student] puts her fingers down on the strings. So she’s already had a little practice before we all started, and that is really good”. The teacher’s praise is an indication that the teacher is constantly observing every student’s performance and identifying issues to address. Though the teacher does not ask the rest of the class to copy this particular student, her complimentary remarks to the one student send the message to the other students that this way of learning violin is highly recommended. The class then plays the song with the CD whilst being constantly reminded about the finger positions by the teacher. After the playing, the teacher tells the students that on the other side of this song in the same book, there is a duet which will be taught to them in the near future.

There are three minutes left before the lesson ends, so the teacher decides to play a new scale on the violin and asks the students to identify the ending notes. Some students provide the correct answer. Aural skills are constantly practised through the violin specialist’s question/answer style of teaching. The learning of technical work is also a focal point of the violin program at this school. The class then tries to play the first four notes of the new scale with the teacher’s instruction on finger positions. Whilst the students are practising, the teacher walks around to check and make sure every student is able to play the new notes correctly in both ascending and descending directions. Both teachers are constantly paying compliments and providing encouraging words to the performance of the class throughout the lesson.
After the class is dismissed, students pack up automatically and take the music and their violins home for practice. One student stays back for a new marker to be put on his violin, and before he leaves the violin specialist praises him by saying “You did very well today”. She then asks, “Did you think you went well”? After receiving an affirmative answer from the student, the violin specialist is pleased. The teacher places due emphasis on gaining feedback from the student in order to gauge his self-evaluation of his performance. This follow-up procedure is an example of the teacher’s strategy to encourage students to evaluate their own performance whilst indirectly gaining feedback about her own teaching efficacy.

(4) Conclusion

In summary, the transcription of these two violin lessons is a reflection of the core of the school’s violin program – the engaging teaching practice. Performance is another important part of the program but will be discussed in the following sections of this chapter. A number of aspects of school violin teaching exemplified in these two classes are useful in illustrating a successful violin program functioning well in a state primary school system. First of all, this violin program is group-based as opposed to grade-based. Students enrolled in the program are divided into six different groups according to their learning progress rather than the school grades they are in. For instance, though most students in the top group are from Grade 6, and have had at least three years of learning experience in the program, there is one fourth grader and one fifth grader in the same group. These two students have only enrolled in the program for one to one-and-a-half years, but have been able to skip levels to the very top group because of their talent and faster learning progress. On the other hand, unlike most beginners who are third Graders, two students in that group are from Grade 4. One is a late enroller and the other one needed to repeat the first level. This grouping system is flexible, individual and effective in terms
of accommodating every student’s learning ability to achieve the best outcome. Secondly, the Kodály based singing, rhythmic and aural training is positioned essentially in the teaching process. As advocates and practitioners, both the violin specialist and the music teacher are well trained in the Kodály teaching system. Their combined experience in adapting the Hungarian method in classroom music and violin playing optimizes the outcome of integrating the Kodály pedagogy with violin teaching. Thirdly, the teaching strategies used in the lessons, e.g. indirect – question/answer instructions, specific story telling, expressive description and modelling, etc. are of heuristic, entertainment and influential value. Fourthly, allowing students to take the violin home not only conveniently enables students to practise regularly and intensively, but also promotes parents’ involvement in the program. Parent’s supervision of their child’s practice enables them to ascertain the child’s progress and encourages the child accordingly. It also helps the parents better understand the program and further support the development of the program.

2. The guitar program

The guitar program at HPS is prepared for students at Years 5 and 6, and is usually run in the last term of the year. The purpose of incorporating guitar tuition in this year level’s classroom music program is to provide primary knowledge about the instrument, and the basic techniques that good guitar playing requires. In addition, the music teacher believes she needs to better prepare students and build a solid foundation for their further guitar learning at secondary level as well as to stimulate their interest in learning this particular instrument. It is worth mentioning that the majority of the graduates from Happyrock Primary School complete their secondary studies at the neighbouring government high school - Happyrock Secondary School - wherein a sophisticated guitar program is in operation. At Happyrock Primary School, there are a total of 15 guitars available for teaching. Half of the guitars are three-quarter size and the other half are
full-sized. In a guitar session, the class is divided into groups of three students with one guitar sitting on a chair for students to take turns in using. The reason of having one guitar amongst three students is because at the initial stage of the learning, students’ fingers are delicate and, therefore, susceptible to pain, and can only play guitar for a short period of time. The using of the guitar on a rotational basis also enables students to listen to and comment on other’s play as well as to help each other when needed. Some students decide to buy a guitar and bring it to the class soon after their commencement of learning as they “like the idea and might go off and have private lessons” (MTI, 15. 12. 2011).

The guitar program has been in operation for nearly four years at Happyrock Primary School, and is going to be perpetuated and enhanced as an important section of the classroom music curriculum for Years 5 and 6. It is possible that the guitar program will also extend to incorporate in the near future a ‘Users Pay’ scheme when under certain conditions, e.g. hiring a guitar specialist, financial situation, the Principal’s support, etc. As a guitar player herself, the school librarian is well aware of the planned guitar group by expressing that “it is under progress”, a development she eagerly anticipates (LI, 23. 11. 2011).

3. The recorder program

Recorder learning at Happyrock Primary School is introduced to students at Year 3. It is compulsory for every student at the year level to learn recorder as part of the classroom music program. A recorder group is also available at lunch time for students who show extra interest in learning this instrument, including those beyond Year 3, and students who demonstrate real talent in playing this instrument.
Conclusion

In the submission to *NRSME*, the Australian Council of State School Organizations (ACSSO) (2005) reports eleven factors supporting quality school music education contributed by families and parents. According to the observations conducted throughout the research, these eleven factors are believed to be the most appropriate means of summarizing the music program at Happy Rock Primary School. These factors or necessary elements include (a) qualified music specialist utilizing recognized developmental teaching methodology and applying them in a creative manner; (b) lessons for all students at respective levels being conducted on a weekly basis; (c) instrumental tuition in percussion, recorder, etc. being established in the classroom at early year levels; (d) advanced music in the form of choral and violin ensembles being accommodated in the timetable; (e) placing singing, aural training and music literacy as focal points in curriculum; (f) allotting specific areas for music; (g) cultivating recognition of music as an integral part of the school’s curriculum; (h) generating overall school music appreciation and participation; (i) adequate provision of resources supporting the development of the program; (j) avocation and recognition of music as a discipline of music on a equal level with core subjects; and (k) incorporating musical experience “across the curriculum framework” (p. 8). The school music program at HPS more than demonstrates adherence to and incorporation the above recognized ASSCO essential factors.
Chapter Nine

Discussion

In this chapter there will be a discussion of two major themes derived from the investigation in this study: the development of the curriculum of the selected school’s music program and the music specialist’s efficacy in operating the program within and without the school. Under the first theme, three interrelated topics will be discussed: the establishment of teaching goals based upon student-centred principles, eclecticism in school music teaching, and the importance of music literacy. The topics discussed under the second theme will include the advocacy of school music education, efficacy in general music teaching, and efficacy in school instrumental and choral programs. In addition, issues involving public performance and informance, and the pull-out program will also be considered.

1. Music curriculum

   - Student-centred teaching objectives

Curriculum provides teachers with an overall plan which includes teaching strategies for the teaching of their subjects, whilst objectives, as a major component of curriculum, focus mainly on the goals of teaching. The music curriculum is at the core of school music teaching system, and an effective music curriculum must be extensive and up-to-date. In the early Course of Study for Primary Schools: Music Syllabus (Education Department, Victoria, 1956), it was clearly stated that the course was designed “to enable children to have the fullest experience and enjoyment of music as an integral part of their school-life” (p. Foreword). More than a half century later, Lierse (2009) asserts that successful curriculum planning for the 21st century
requires a comprehensive education system that accommodates a multi-faceted approach in recognizing various aspects of children’s talents. Both statements indicate that the music curriculum should be developed in accordance with students’ needs, and therefore, take a student-centred perspective, an approach which is strongly reflected in the music specialist’s curriculum at Happyrock Primary School (HPS).

The current music curriculum at HPS was created and developed by the music specialist and was based strongly upon her extensive teaching experience, and more importantly, the school’s culture and the students’ needs and learning progress. The music specialist is well aware of both state and national curricula in the Arts at different periods over the last few decades, particularly the CSF1 (Curriculum Standards Framework 1), CSF2 (Curriculum Standards Framework 2), VELS (Victorian Essential Learning Standards), and the recently released National Curriculum. She incorporates elements suggested in those documents to fill in perceived gaps in her own curriculum in order to further enhance curricular comprehensiveness and to standardize her teaching. This strategy parallels with Lindeman (2011), stating that a music teacher’s curriculum should “be based on state or national standards … and focused on engaging children in conceptual music learning” (p. 43).

It is interesting to note that during the observations and the series of interviews conducted with the music specialist, that the music curriculum at HPS is always one, if not several steps ahead of the corresponding state/national framework for school music education. This is reflected by Letts (2009) who points out that the current music curricula in Australian public primary schools need to be devised in order to correspond with generalist teachers’ skills in music, as they are too brief and impractical. As the specialist, recalls “When I went back to teaching, it was CSF1, and [when] I had a quick look at it, I thought, really, if you are doing a half-good job as a music
teacher you are covering all that, [so] I’ll keep doing what I’m doing. Then there was CSF2, and [when] I had a look at it, I thought I’m covering all that in about the first three weeks of my teaching - I’ll keep doing what I’m doing” (MSI, 05. 12. 2011). When VELS first came out, the music specialist quickly indentified that the creative domain suggested in the document was something really beneficial for the students, and therefore, needed to be taken on board straight away. She states that, “they do add a more creative edge to it. I looked at my program and I thought, really, it’s probably not got enough creativity in it. So, I had a good look at the program and I now include a compositional sort of component or element” (MSI, 05. 12. 2011). The addition of the compositional component is implemented in her teaching for Grades 3 and above, and there is a coordinated type of program that links through to a big compositional task in Grade 6, or 5/6. In terms of the newly released the Shape of the Australian National Curriculum: The Arts, the specialist’s only concern with it is the inclusion of all the five art forms. She continues, “I think it’s wonderful, but if you have a big flourishing music department, what happens to that? Because you then have to give away all your time and everything you do to other arts so that everyone can do a little bit of everything. Whereas, the way I see it, we are doing one thing reasonably well and I’d hate to give that up, much as I’d love them to have drama and dance as well” (MSI, 05. 12. 2011).

The objectives of the music specialist’s curriculum development cover the following major areas: provide every student at HPS quality music education; ensure an enjoyable environment throughout their learning journey; build a strong foundation in music literacy and musical skills; develop students’ ability in fine music appreciation; encourage every student to participate in public performances and informances (MSI, 08. 05. 2012). This teaching spectrum agrees with Lindeman (2011) who claims that the ultimate objective for music teaching is to enable students
to explore music in different ways, and deepen their understanding of music via conceptual experiences. Consequently, students’ receptivity to and enjoyment of music, as a form of art, are enhanced.

At HPS every student is entitled for a 50-minute classroom music session per week, which not only meets but also well exceeds the 20-minute teaching duration suggested by the *Shape of the Australian Curriculum: The Arts* (Cosaitis, 2012). The music specialist’s curriculum consists of singing, music appreciation, music literacy, performance, and creativity/movement. In addition, a detailed repertoire is attached to each grade’s term curriculum. This repertoire changes every year as the music specialist explains: “I try to avoid any repetitions because I lose interest very quickly otherwise, and if I’m not interested in teaching the songs, there’s no way that the children are going to be interested in learning them” (MSI, 08. 05. 2012). Various types of instruments are also extensively involved at different stages in accordance with different teaching objectives as presented in 2012 Term 1 Curriculum Chart in Chapter 7 which will not be re-stated here.

The music curriculum established and developed by the music specialist at HPS reveals that the knowledge, skills and experience required in the criteria of successful curricular development form the core of effective music teaching at primary levels. It is noted that a curriculum of this standard can only be effectively delivered by an experienced and highly qualified music specialist who is also a musician and is passionate about school music education. Letts (2009), drawing upon the general consensus which exists amongst the community of music education, maintains that it is necessary for public schools to employ specialists in order to deliver quality music teaching at primary level.
Eclecticism in school music teaching

Selecting and implementing appropriate curricular approaches are vital for school music teaching. Landis and Carder (1972) claimed that an eclectic teaching approach is seen in its adoption or adaptation and development of available ideas and useful concepts. Substantiating this, Lindeman (2011) asserts that there are numerous approaches for teaching music to children, and when an approach is featured for integrating and incorporating a variety of techniques and thoughts in a teacher’s method of teaching, the approach may be considered eclectic (p. 40). It is stressed that an eclectic approach is essential for school music teaching at primary levels.

The music program at HPS is believed to be a prime example of utilizing an eclectic curricular approach, illustrating the benefits of integrating multiple pedagogical methods in the music specialist’s teaching. She asserts that “Some teachers believe in using just one method throughout their entire teaching and it works for them, but it would not work for our program. We do a lot of different things here and one method is not going to serve all the purposes, and I use different methods for lower and upper year levels” (MSI, 13. 03. 2012). Lindeman (2011) asserts that it is common for primary school music programs to incorporate eclectic curricular approaches, and that some teachers formulate and develop their own approach based upon the ideas and teaching strategies selected from a variety of sources according to their experience and needs.

Amongst all the pedagogical methodologies the music specialist adapts, the Kodály method and the Orff approach are considered fundamental. As described in the second part of the Literature Review, two innovators in the field of music education, Zoltán Kodály and Carl Orff both established the foundation of their teaching methods in the first half of the 20th century. Both
music pedagogies have had a great impact on music education in general and school music education in particular (Goodkin, 2001). At HPS, the two approaches are adapted in each part of the music program including classroom music teaching, instrumental instructions, and choral programs, at both individual and combined levels. The proportion of each individual approach and their combination varies in accordance with year levels, program types and teaching objectives.

From observation and discussion it seems that the approaches of Kodály and Orff are most influential in the music curriculum of HPS. The music specialist acknowledges that the music program at HPS “is based upon the Kodály method, so it centres around singing/choral work”, and that this approach is given even greater emphasis in early years classroom teaching (MSI, 13. 03. 2012). The music specialist’s reasons for doing so are in line with Alsop (2007) and Zoltán Kodály Online (2009), stating that a sequential Kodály approach presents every music element a natural way in relation to the child’s musical development. Not only do children’s physical, social, emotional, aesthetical and intellectual development demand more complex skills and more involved concepts, but also their musical development increases the acquisition of more challenging techniques. These techniques cover the following areas: melodies from 3-note songs to tetra-tonic, then pentatonic and right up to diatonic songs in both major and minor keys; rhythms accommodating all sorts of movements in either simple duple or compound duple time; sequenced form, harmony, tempo and dynamics required for enabling children’s experience in all aspects of music at suitable levels; and comprehensive and adequate aural training skills. The music specialist maintains that the Kodály method advocates the establishment of a solid music learning foundation, and gradual and sequential progress in all teaching programs. Furthermore, the commencement of the next step must be based upon the consolidation of the previous one.
To do so, there should be only one new concept introduced at a time. This belief is also practised in other teaching areas of the music program at HPS (MSI, 08. 05. 2012).

The adaptation of the Kodály method is also reflected on the extensive utilization of singing in the music specialist’s teaching. Singing can be regarded as one of the very first skills children associate with and acquire for their future development and education. It is also a fundamental component in school music education, particularly in early years. Kraus (1972) noted that singing has been strongly advocated in the Kodály method which stresses that “the basis of school music education is the development and cultivation of the human voice” and that singing instruction is primary for the music education in early years of schooling (p. 126). The music specialist believes that singing activities involve a great range of basic skills and are, therefore, used all the way through to Year 6 at HPS. She admits that by the time students reach Year 4, the emphasis more or less moves away from the Kodály method. However, the quantity of singing activities has never been sacrificed; even when they play chamber percussion instruments and Orff instruments, students are still often involved in singing programs. Certain songs they sing are required to be transferred in writing prior to their attempt of playing them on the instruments. The music specialist further states that, “We still have a very vocally based program through to Year 4. [In] Years 5 and 6 we sing [as well] - I’d like to say every lesson, I don’t think I’ve missed one, so they have to keep singing otherwise they’ll lose not the ability but the inclination to sing, but we do a lot of instrumental work and that takes the pressure off the boys and some of the boys’ voices are already changing” (MSI, 08. 12. 2011). The Kodály approach is also employed in the specialist violin classes, as has been described.

In terms of the adaptation of the Orff approach, the music specialist explains that though the entire music program is Kodály based, the Orff approach also plays a vital role in many areas,
especially at upper level classroom teaching. In addition, body movements, percussion instruments and Orff instruments are also incorporated at every level throughout the program. Frank (1964) put forward that Orff’s music was “distinguished by his imaginative treatment of rhythm”, and his educational music, again, revealed his advocacy of the importance of rhythm and movement with a “natural, logical, and appropriate emphasis on rhythmic element” (p. 59). At HPS, the music specialist explains, the tuned and un-tuned percussion instruments are used in various ways in her music teaching at all levels.

At preparatory level, students are to explore a limited range of instruments, e.g. maracas, tambourines, claves, etc; keep the beat by using unaccompanied singing with body percussion; pass the percussion instruments around the circle whilst the noise level is contained; experience the sound effects in the songs they have learnt and the music incorporated in their music appreciation section; and create their own sound effects with the percussions. In Year 1, students are to revise the use of the percussion instruments; experience a greater range of percussions, e.g. triangles, bongo drums, cabasas, etc; keep the beat whilst a small group plays the rhythm; swap the practice between beat and rhythm of a song; and keep the beat and the pulse when introducing songs in compound time. In Year 2, tuned percussion instruments are introduced to the classes. Students are to learn how to hold the beaters and play rhythms on single note; play two-note songs taught in Prep on different notes; play two-note songs using a minor 3rd interval; and continue to learn well-known three-note and more complex songs on the instruments. In Year 3, glockenspiel is used as a major instrument in classroom music in the first term during which students attempt to play songs learnt in singing sessions on their glockenspiels. From the second term onwards, descant recorder is introduced to the class as it takes precedence over percussion instruments. In Year 4, tuned and non-tuned percussions are used for composing
activities in the second term. Students’ compositions are then recorded and written down in graphic notation, and occasionally, one piece is chosen and notated as a class project to be learnt and played. In Years 5 and 6, glockenspiel playing is extended in accordance with more difficult repertoire. Students at these year levels are involved in a major compositional project in which glockenspiels and non-tuned percussions are used extensively. In 2011, students composed pieces in rondo and ternary form based upon their knowledge acquired from the learning of Mozart’s work. This year’s theme is about a music story in relation to Jon Madin’s CABBAGE CAFE. As presented in the curriculum chart (Appendix B), a Lunchtime Percussion Ensemble is in operation for students in Years 5 and 6. They gather on a weekly basis, playing a variety of 1 to 4 parts pieces from musicals which are often in line with the concert theme of the year.

- Importance of music literacy

School music education is often interpreted or, in some cases, delivered as nothing more than singing songs and playing musical games. Occasionally, it may include dancing and playing untuned percussion instruments which are added as supplementary activities. Though every teacher is entitled to incorporate different components in their own programs, music literacy should always be considered indispensable. McIntire (2007) states that music literacy skills for the success of one’s music learning are just as important as general literacy skills are to a person’s success in school and in life. A similar belief was presented by advocates of the Kodály approach who claim that everyone should acquire the skills of music reading and writing when studying music just as they need to be trained in reading and writing when learning their native language (Landis & Carder, 1972, p. 41). Hence, the primary objective of Kodály’s teaching system was to provide music reading and writing skills to the entire nation as they are essential to the learning of all facets in art. Orff also believed that although children’s acquisition of music literacy should
be progressed naturally rather than being accomplished under any directives, there is no doubt that music literacy is an integral component in his pedagogical approach (Shamrock, 1997).

At Happyrock Primary School, the music specialist has always placed music literacy in a vital position in her curriculum. In the curriculum chart provided in Appendix B, it is clearly seen that music literacy is taught at every year level with a sequential progression. Every student is provided with an A4-sized Music Notebook for the purposes of doing exercises in music literacy and building a broad reference of corresponding knowledge. This notebook is to be used throughout students’ primary schooling years up to Year 5. A detailed description of the teaching of music literacy was presented in Chapter 5 and will not be reproduced in this discussion.

Music literacy learning can be rather difficult, especially for younger children, when the teacher’s pedagogical approach is not engaging and lacks stimulation. During the observations in this study, the teaching of music literacy is always delivered in a fun-based manner within an enjoyable and children-friendly atmosphere. The music room is decorated with a variety of posters and pictures of music language, rhythm patterns and notations. The exercise sheets for music literacy are well designed with cartoon characters and child-oriented drawings which are then compiled into their Music Notebook after the completion of the exercise. These practices are in line with McIntire (2007) who recognizes that children’s literacy skills are developed naturally through music within a pleasing environment via playful activities.

2. Teacher efficacy

- Advocacy of school music education

Effective teaching is an integral part of instituting and improving the inclusion of music education in schools. As presented in previous chapters, music education in Victorian state-
supported primary schools is still struggling with its implementation, development and adequacy.

Despite the overwhelming body of research that demonstrates the positive impact of music education on children, funding for music has been quite limited in terms of general budgetary allocations (Lierse, 2009). There are a number of reasons accounting for the causes responsible for the decline in music education, including, primarily, the shifting landscape of the Victorian education system which tends to change from one government to another. Over the last six years curricular imperatives have focused on Languages Other Than English (LOTE), Physical Education (PE), Sport, and Technology, whereas the current priority is numeracy and literacy. This policy has devalued the role music and the arts have played in the overall development in children (Lierse, 2009). Subsequently, an increasing number of music educators are facing the challenge of implementing or consolidating music education in state-supported primary schools. In order to be successful in this regard, the advocacy of school music education is vital in enabling music educators to promote the importance of having music education available at all primary levels. To further facilitate effective advocacy, music educators need to fully understand the importance of early music education and strive to establish positive relationships with all other parties involved in the school’s music program. The following discussions of the early music education outreach program and practices in advocacy are an illustration of the music specialist’s practices at HPS in terms of the aforementioned, exemplifying a successful school music education advocate.

(a) Importance of early music education

The experiences of music learning at early years helps children develop their music vocabularies and music skills (Gordon, 1999). Other benefits of receiving music education during the early years have been presented on different occasions in Chapter One and throughout this study. In
this section, the topic will be discussed through the analyses of data collected from the music program at HPS.

As stated, every student at HPS receives a 50-minute music class on a weekly basis, including those at lower primary levels (Preparatory - Year2). The curriculum for these year levels focuses on keeping a steady beat. Singing, music literacy and creative activities all revolve around nursery rhymes. As mentioned previously, the music specialist takes the Year 4 students to the two local kindergartens to stage performances consisting of singing and instrument playing. Her motivation for this is fuelled by her belief in early music education advocacy as well as to encourage pre-school children for their music learning induction at primary schools. Many parents in the locality have sent their children to HPS after their observation of the school’s students’ public performances at numerous venues.

(b) Positive relationship with other parties involved in the school’s music program

As presented in Chapter 1 and 2, other parties involved in the school’s music program included school administrative members, other teachers, students, parents, and members of the local community. The data sources accessed in this case study were the school Principal, Assistant Principal, violin specialist, school librarian, and the students. The history of the music program in HPS has gone through its fourteenth year since the arrival of the current music specialist. It is uncommon in Victoria for a state-supported primary school to employ a full time music specialist to establish and operate a music program over such a long time span, encompassing the change of four different school principals. Through the observations at HPS, discussions with the music specialist, and the interviews with other staff members, it is clear that the positive relationships between the music specialist and other parties involved in the program play an
essential role in the school music program’s long-term existence and ongoing development. These parties include the administrative members, other teachers, students, parents, and local community, with other teachers being the most important group mentioned by the music specialist.

Before the comparatively new Multipurpose Building was established, the music room was inside the main building under the same roof as other classrooms and the Staff Room. It was convenient for the music specialist to go to the Staff Room several times a day, meeting and chatting with other teachers, and even joining the teachers’ cooking group. Since the relocation of the music room in the new building it has become quite difficult for the music specialist to ‘visit’ the Staff Room on a regular basis due to the distance between the two buildings and the limited time between classes. She still makes a point of meeting with other teachers as much as possible “because the relationship with the rest of the staff is vital” (MSI, 08. 12. 2011). The music specialist explains: “I’ve spent 12 years building up [this relationship]. This year is one of my hardest years so I haven’t spent as much time in the Staff Room. I don’t think I’ve lost a lot of touch with the staff [as] they come and find me sometimes. But, yes, it’s really important to be out there to be part of the overall staff, and to be seen at Sports, at Art, and so on – whatever they are going to run because I’m going to turn around and say ‘I’d like you all to be in the concert’ and another one and then another one, so the very least I can do is go and attend and help out with all their things” (MSI, 08. 12. 2011).

In terms of establishing and maintaining a positive relationship with the administrative members, the music specialist describes it as a ‘must’. She explains, “Without their support, things would have been very difficult. For example, if the Assistant Principal wasn’t on ‘my team’, I wouldn’t have been able to do a lot of what I do because she takes care of all the timetabling issues which
is extremely important for my program” (MSI, 08. 12. 2011). The music specialist has put in a
great deal of effort to promote her program to the school administrative members. On the first
day of the current Principal’s arrival at HPS, the music specialist made a point of visiting the
Principal in his office, welcoming his addition to the team, and wishing him a successful career
at HPS. After her brief introduction of herself, the music specialist provided a rather short yet
well-prepared presentation on the school’s music program. The Principal recalls: “I was sitting at
my desk reading something and here comes [the music specialist], with a big smile on her face,
very friendly. She welcomed me, introduced herself, then talked about her program with a great
deal of passion and excitement” (PI, 17. 08. 2011). Throughout the years, the music specialist
has proved the excellence of her program to the Principal. Apart from the fact that the Principal
is a music ‘fan’ himself, the effort the music specialist puts in and the enormous achievement the
program accomplishes have made the Principal an important part of the school music program.
The music specialist expresses: “[The Principal is very supportive, not as overly as the previous
principal but he always makes time for the music program. He makes time to come to everything
we do, to be there to fetch and carry at most things we do. You know, helping up with the sound
system, giving speeches in each performance, participating in the show, all those sorts of things”
(MSI, 08. 12. 2011). According to the music specialist, the Principal’s support in the music
program is also revealed in the budget. Her requests for replacing old sound systems, purchasing
new instruments, making uniforms, and so forth, have never been questioned nor rejected. The
music specialist is very grateful for the budgetary support on the Principal’s part because she
realizes the difficulties an insufficient budget could create to the development of the program.
The support of the school Principal and the Assistant Principal for the program depends heavily
on their witnessing of the students’ enjoyment and achievement in it. The Assistant Principal
maintains that the music program at HPS is extremely valuable for the students, especially for those who come from impoverished or dysfunctional families wherein private music lessons are impossible to achieve. She also sees the great value to students who are not quite good in literacy or numeracy but talented in music because the program has provided an opportunity for them not only to develop their musical skills but also to enhance their self-esteem.

At the same time, the administrative members also realize the positive effects the music program is able to create for the school’s public image. Southcott (1998) stated that music education can be regarded as “the public face of schooling, both at the state-wide and the individual school level, [creating] an effective form of school self-promotion and celebration and could provide a way of raising funds for schools” (p. 242). According to the School Principal, the music specialist plays an active role in the school’s promotion. Whenever there are new parents visiting the school or doing orientation with their children, the music specialist always invites them to the music room and puts on a little performance for them. She also catches the opportunity to introduce the school’s music program, emphasizing the nature of the fun-based curriculum as well as a great deal of opportunities provided for public performance. Drawing attention to the music specialist’s promotion of her program within the school, the Principal states that whenever there is a special event at the school, the music specialist is proactive and always trying to utilize the school music program to accommodate matters. The Assistant Principal further explains that the current enrolment at HPS is between 410 and 420, “So part of our embarking on this program is to stem any loss of students. The music program is excellent for that because it’s public, you get out there, it’s so interesting and exciting to see children who sing well, behave well, play some instruments, especially from a public state school” (API, 05. 03. 2012). In terms of maintaining the positive relationship with the administrative members, the strategy the music
specialist uses is “communicating with them as much as possible on a regular basis” (MSI, 08. 02. 2011). The Assistant Principal explains that the music specialist talks with her about the development of the music program frequently: “She always comes in and talks to me,” she says, “she’s got her priorities and we’ve got ours, but we always talk and work things out” (API, 05. 03. 2012).

Although the relationships with the students, parents and the local community are simpler as compared to the aforementioned two parties, the music specialist still regards the issue as important in her success of running the music program at HPS. Her strategy of maintaining a positive relationship with students is based upon her student-centred teaching principles as mentioned earlier in this chapter. She explains that, “their happiness and enjoyment come first, then the learning” (MSI, 08. 12. 2011). When the music specialist commenced her career at HPS, her first amendment to the then program was to free the students up as the previous teacher’s lack of musical skills and experiences that limited the students’ enjoyment in the learning. The music specialist’s teaching style is flexible and creative: “There is no completely right or wrong. If for some reason we can’t finish the task, we’ll come back to where we left off next week and continue from there. I allow them to be a bit more creative and encouraging them to become more heavily involved in the extracurricular activities” (MSI, 08. 12. 2011). From the statements and pictures collected for the purpose of this study as presented in previous chapters, students’ love for the teacher and their enjoyment in the school’s music program are clearly revealed in their responses to the program. The music specialist’s passion for music teaching, love for students, encouragement for their study and motivation toward their performance have provided a great deal of positive influence to the students which further enables students to learn music in a friendly, relaxed, enjoyable and creative environment.
When it comes to advocating school music education and promoting her programs to the local community and parents, the music specialist maintains that “We try to be very community oriented so we keep the school’s profile raised in the community in as positive a way as we can and we tend to do that a lot through music. We also intend to get the parents involved in as much as possible” (MSI, 08. 12. 2011). For instance, she takes Year 4 students to perform on a regular basis at two local kindergartens and a Childcare Centre. Hence, this type of a transitional teaching will prepare young children in the local area for their ‘Step into the Prep’ program before their orientation or commencement at primary schools. The music specialist regards this part of her teaching as an outreach into the community. In addition to this, she organizes three, four or more concerts a year at the shopping centre directly across the road. The Santa’s Breakfast is one of the biggest events there and HPS has been invited to sing each year in the past few years. Another way of keeping constant contact with the local community is by participation in the One Day One Song program every year. In the program, all students across the nation are asked to sing the same song at the same time as a means of promoting music education throughout the country. The music specialist asserts that, “We are part of it, but we sing at the shopping centre rather than just do it within the school. When we go out to perform, I’m trying to raise the image of the school, and I’m happy to go out at any time, anywhere to anyone because then the children get that experience” (MSI, 06. 10. 2011).

According to the School Principal and other staff members at HPS, parents of current students are extremely proud of their children’s participation in these public performances, and therefore support the school’s music program whenever possible. The following statements are quoted from a letter that the music specialist sent to the chamber choir member’s parents on 3 May 2012:
Dear Parents,

I am pleased to be able to write to you with details about the forthcoming WARM WINTER VOICES Concert. Although it should be a very friendly gathering rather than a competition I would like us to shine brightly amongst the other choirs and hope you will support us by ensuring every choir member is able to attend … There is plenty of parking at the venue and we should have a marvellous evening.

The letter is very thoughtfully designed with pictures of instruments, music notes and the school emblem being placed alongside the school’s name. The title of the letter is shaped in an arch and the body of the letter is written in an artistic font. From the design and the wording of the letter, it is easy to observe the great effort the music specialist has put in. The message sent from the letter covers several points, including the nature of the event, importance of the preparation, her goal of presenting a quality performance, assurance of parking provision, and most importantly, her call for parents’ support. Admittedly, compared to the big program the music specialist runs, this letter may seem minor. However, her meticulous approach and sustained effort for gaining parents’ support are two attributes worth adopting by school music education advocates in general.

According to the feedback the Assistant Principal and the school librarian have received, parents are very pleased to see the music skills their children have accomplished through the music program at HPS, and therefore, more parents have become part of the music program. The school choir’s uniform is a prime example of parents’ participation as they contributed the design, materials, and even labour. Other parents have become the ongoing assistants in light systems, sound systems, stage arrangements, etc. The school librarian, who is also in charge of the sound
systems and stage arrangements, comments on this by saying that on several occasions during her stay in HPS, parents in the local area have expressed strong interest in sending their children to the school after their observations of HPS’s public performances. The following comments from the music specialist will be the perfect conclusion for this section:

It would have started as ‘let’s raise the profile of the school’ but we don’t really need to do that any more, although you never stop. I mean you’re always raising and keeping your profile out there but always it is about there should be more music in schools, more music for children, and look at this, it’s something money can’t buy if you like, the experience the children get from going out and performing. So it is about, I guess, raising the profile of music education (MSI, 08. 12. 2011).

- Effectiveness in general school music teaching

Effective music teaching in today’s educational system, especially in state-supported primary schools is in strong demand. However, in terms of the equipping teaching with the necessary skills to provide effective teaching, opinions of educational researchers and music educators vary. As pointed out by Stevens-Ballenger, Jeanneret and Forrest (2010), the knowledge and skills primary school teachers need for effective classroom music teaching have long been debated. Letts (2009) drawing upon the varying opinions of music educators, states that music education at primary levels is problematic in the majority of Australian schools as the teaching of music is left to generalists rather than specialists. According to the Stevens Report presented in MCA (2010), less than a quarter of all public schools possessed the capacity to provide effective music education. It is believed that music specialists are the most suitable educators for effective music teaching at primary levels. If the circumstances do not allow the employment of a specialist, it is
hoped that the following analyses of the music specialist’s teaching methodology in this regard will be adopted by generalists in order to improve their effectiveness in music teaching. Griffiths (2011) asserts that within a successful music teaching system, “individual technical and music skills are nurtured within the context of developing all aspects of what it is to be musical” (p. Foreword), and this particular educational perspective has been evidenced by the music specialist at HPS.

Effective teaching requires an effective curriculum. According to Victorian Music Workshop Report (SMAG, 2007), an effective music curriculum should be aesthetic, intellectual, creative, social, and most importantly, comprehensive. The music specialist at HPS is a highly qualified music teacher, a gifted musician with the varied abilities of playing piano, violin, recorder, guitar and other instruments, and a motivated advocate of school music education. Her resourceful character determines the comprehensiveness of her program which is also a reflection of the other features aforementioned in the Report. The curriculum chart mentioned earlier in this chapter has partially, yet effectively, demonstrated the various components incorporated into the music specialist’s teaching, for example, music literacy, aural training, singing, instrument playing, music appreciation, improvisation and composition. The school librarian describes the music specialist as ‘exceptional’, stating “Our children here are so lucky that they get the opportunity to learn many instruments – you know, the violin, the recorder, some of them I think are learning guitar as well. You know, we don’t just sing songs like what other schools do, we do a lot of things here, and that’s what the parents want to see. So they can say “my children go to [this] school; they learn to play an instrument; [they] learn to sing songs; and [they] are learning how to read music even” (LI, 23. 11. 2011). Adding to this point, the violin specialist at HPS expresses her appreciation, commenting that the music specialist’s classroom teaching makes her
violin teaching much easier because the students have been very well prepared in music literacy, aural skills, and music appreciation abilities. These fundamental knowledge and skills enable students to start their violin learning with a solid foundation of musicianship and, subsequently, they progress quickly with a steady pace and their interest in learning is always maintained (VSI, 23. 11. 2011).

In effective music teaching, a music teacher’s professional and musical skills do matter greatly but his/her personal and moral character also contributes significantly. The music specialist believes that being encouraging and motivating is very important in successful music teaching. Victorian Music Workshop Report (SMAG, 2007) further points out that effective music teaching requires sufficient abilities from music teachers at their musical, professional and personal best. As previously mentioned in other chapters, through a series of observations of various types of music classes at HPS the music specialist has projected an image of a nurturing, enthusiastic, encouraging and motivating teacher. Her classes are very well organized, within which students are constantly kept busy with varied yet interesting learning and working tasks. The words of encouragement, including compliments, praises, and recognition of students’ achievements, are frequently heard in the classes, and moreover, the music specialist’s passion for music performance and music education has provided a positive model for students who may pursue a future career in the music industry. From the students’ responses provided on their music program, the majority has expressed their enjoyment they have experienced and the skills gained from the music program. A number of students have shown their interest in becoming musicians in the pop music industry, whilst a few students have expressed their inclination towards becoming music educators when they grow up. It is clear to see that the music specialist’s personal character and professional practice revealed through her teaching have had
an inspirational effect on her students’ learning in both musical and social aspects. It is fair to say that a music educator of this calibre is what effective music teaching requires, possessing the ability to successfully deliver top quality teaching in primary school music education. This is reflected by Southcott (1995), who maintained that “teachers [without] insufficient skill in and knowledge of music … would be unlikely to teach [music] frequently or well. Such teachers would produce musically ill-equipped students who, in turn, would be the source of the next generation of teachers” (p. 244). The music specialist’s personal character is also reflected in the interview conducted with the School Principal for this study. Drawing attention to the music specialist’s dedication to the school’s music program, the Principal says that the music specialist has expressed her concerns on different occasions for children of challenged socio-economic background who show potential for musical talent. She has made recommendations to the Principal for deferential consideration in terms of financial support, thus enabling them to pursue their musical aspirations. Through the combined efforts the music specialist, the Principal and the violin specialist have put in, those financial issues have been resolved.

Effective teachers never stop learning from each other and from teachers of other subjects in order to enhance their knowledge and skills in their teaching, keeping themselves up-to-date with innovative teaching methods and strategies. As presented in previous chapters, the violin program at HPS is operated by both the music specialist and the violin specialist. This is so, because the music specialist believes that though she, herself, can play and teach violin, she is … nowhere near [the violin specialist’s] level of performing standard and teaching. [The violin specialist] spends her whole life teaching violin and she is always learning more and more things, going to workshops and conferences, you know, all that, so she’s right on top of the whole thing, so that’s how it started (MSI, 08. 12. 2011).
The music specialist is also a member of a local music teacher committee. They gather on a regular basis, giving presentations about their own teaching or topics in relation to school music teaching. “It’s really good”, says the music specialist, “We learn from each other and it helps me reflect on what I do, too” (MSI, 07. 05. 2012). According to the music specialist, another way of improving her teaching is to observe classes of other subjects. In the multipurpose building, the music room is next door to the LOTE room, and Italian is currently taught as the second language in HPS. Observations on the Italian classes and discussions with the LOTE teacher help the music specialist better understand the many common aspects shared between the teachings of music and foreign languages. The music specialist further notes that she is a life-long learner from her own teaching; she constantly evaluates her practices in every component involved in the music program in order to maintain and enhance the high quality of her teaching. She explains: “It makes you think…why the same lesson plan works perfectly for other classes but not for this class. Once you figure it out, you know what to avoid or what to put in when you have them next time” (MSI, 21. 11. 2011).

- Effectiveness in school instrumental and choral programs

Effective music teachers at primary schools should have sufficient knowledge and skills not only in classroom teaching but also in organizing and operating instrumental and/or choral programs as they are two essential components of quality school music programs. Stevens-Ballenger et al. (2010) suggest that, “courses [provided by the university sector] could be made available (as inservice opportunities) in … singing, and choral conduction, and instrumental conduction/ensemble direction” (p. 39). Through participation in school instrumental and/or choral programs, children not only gain musical skills but also benefit from the establishment of the sense of being a group member, enhancement of their abilities to pay attention to detail, and
development of their socializing skills. The results of the data indicate that public performance and the pull-out program are the two areas wherein the efficacy in school instrumental and choral programs is better demonstrated. The general benefits of public performance, in conjunction with the effects the pull-out program incurs, has been presented in the literature review of this study. Hence, the following contents will focus upon the analyses of the data collected from the music program at HPS in relation to these two areas.

(a) Public performance and ininformances

As mentioned in previous chapters, public performance is a feature of the music program at Happyrock Primary School. Every student is given a number of opportunities throughout the year to perform both inside and outside the school in front of different types of audiences. Students are strongly encouraged to perform in classroom music sessions in front of their peers, especially in early years. The music specialist says that “We go out a lot and we love doing it, and people enjoy our performances” (MSI, 11. 01. 2012). Outside the school, there are several places where they put on performances on a regular basis, for example, the local shopping centres, kindergartens, and retirement villages. Performances in these venues are usually in choral form, and glockenspiel playing is also often seen as accompaniment.

Informance as an innovative form of school music presentation has enjoyed its third year in 2011 at HPS (MSI, 08. 05. 2012). As mentioned in previous chapters, there are many types of informance, and the one that is successfully operating at HPS is School Community Informance. However, due to various reasons, the participants in HPS’s informances are not parents but school staff members. When asked about the benefits of this particular performing event, the music specialist happily responds: “It is fantastic! It took a long time though before this
happened but it’s just great to have our lovely staff members to join us. We can’t live without them now!” (MSI, 08. 05. 2012). She further explains that the teachers’ participation in the informances provides valuable benefits, for instance, it enhances the teacher-student relationship because students and teachers become team-mates throughout the entire preparing and performing process; it provides an opportunity for generalist classroom teachers to demonstrate their musical talent or skills, with students getting to know their teachers from another perspective; teachers’ passion for music more or less inspires students and may create positive impact on students’ inclination towards music learning; other staff members’ participation in school’s musical events provides a great deal of support for the music specialist; and last but not least, this type of informance at HPS is a great way of promoting the school’s music program in front of the parents and local community, especially when the administrative members become an on-going part of it, as at HPS (MSI, 08. 05. 2012).

(b) Pull-out program

As mentioned in the first part of the literature review, school music education is often associated with the pull-out program. In many cases, the pull-out program can be a cause of friction in a school and is sometimes believed to have negative effects upon students’ study in general classes and, subsequently, their academic progress. According to Wallick (1998), the negative effects mainly include the disruption to the regularly scheduled classes, missing out on instructional tasks, decline in students’ academic performance, frustration for general classroom teachers, and disharmony between music teachers and other staff members.

Not unlike other cases, HPS also faces the difficulty of dealing with the pull-out issue, however, this has been overcome through the establishment of a rather positive attitude, paving the way to
a successful program. The music specialist’s response to the issue of pull-outs is encapsulated in the following statement: “Even though students are leaving their regular scheduled classes for music lessons or activities, they are not actually leaving instructions” (MSI, 13. 03. 2012). This belief coincides with Wallick (1998), acknowledging that, “When string students are excused from their classrooms for string class, they are not leaving instruction. They are moving to another classroom in a different area of the building” (p. 8).

During the interview with the School Principal at HPS, the pull-out issue is mentioned on a number of occasions, with the Principal consistently maintaining a positive attitude towards the topic. He presents some examples of their successful achievements in the area whilst demonstrating confidence in his ongoing support for the school’s pull-out program. The Principal is convinced that through the participations in music activities, especially performances outside the school, the students “are getting a lot from the performances, for example, the performance in the shopping centre” (PI, 17. 08. 2011). When NAPLAN\textsuperscript{14} has been used as an argument to augment teachers’ requests to keep students in class, the Principal has acknowledged the importance of NAPLAN but has reasserted his stance on the need to accommodate the school music program, saying “We need to look at the big picture too … if children can do well in music it does have an effect on their confidence which theoretically should flow through everything else they do” (PI, 17. 08. 2011).

In terms of dealing with the pull-out issue, the Assistant Principal’s comments hit upon the core of the issue. It is worth mentioning that the AP carries a number of important duties at HPS, such as daily organization, personnel, budgetary management, etc. She acknowledges that it is very rare to hear any complaints from their generalist classroom teachers or other staff members about

\textsuperscript{14} National Assessment Program-Literacy and Numeracy commenced in 2008 in Australia. All students at Years 3, 5, 7, and 9 participate in the tests on the same day annually.
the pull-out program because of the supportive working morale amongst teachers and the history of music education at HPS. These environmental and historical aspects help the staff members better understand the importance of music education to HPS’s development, witnessing the enormous benefits the students have received from the music program including the pull-out program, and therefore, support the program at every level possible. In addition, the AP believes that “The majority of our teachers accept the fact that we’ve organized to minimize disruption and they are good with that” (API, 05. 03. 2012). She also notes that there is still tension between the requirements of doing literacy and numeracy, and music and sports, and therefore, they have managed to compromise slightly on the issue. For instance, the chamber choir has been shifted to the last session on Monday from the morning session after the School Assembly. Overall, it is secure to say that the pull-out issue does exist in HPS but has been dealt with professionally, amiably and effectively.

There is an interesting observation on the pull-out issue which is revealed in the interview with the school librarian. She takes a definite stance by stating that teachers who make complaints are “usually the older teachers who don’t [understand] the benefit [of the music program]” (LI, 23. 11. 2011). She further suggests that those teachers who complain about the ‘pull outs’ should deepen their understanding of the benefits that the school music activities have created, and that for both students and teachers, “the music program is not just an extra thing, there’s more to it … it’s relaxing … and a good brain exercise” (LI, 23. 11. 2011).

From the above observations and discussions about the pull-out program at HPS it is safe to conclude that the supportive attitude and actions of the administrative members are vital in running the program whilst other staff members’ respect for the program and their confidence in the school’s organizational system are also indispensable in achieving successful outcomes. Like
the Assistant Principal says: “Staff like us are very respectful for the work [our music teacher] does, and they do understand that it has been a fantastic and successful program in a whole lot of different ways, so they do appreciate that too” (API, 05. 03. 2012).

In this chapter, the music specialist’s effective teaching and her practice as a successful school music advocate have been highlighted through the observations, discussions and interviews at different times on a number of occasions to serve the purpose of this study. The analysis of the data has been presented through two major perspectives: curriculum development and effectiveness in school music teaching, and a number of subdivided topics, including the establishment of teaching objectives, eclecticism in school music teaching, the importance of music literacy, advocacy and efficacy of school music education, school instrumental instruction, choral activities, pull-out program, and public performance/informance. In the following chapter, a conclusion of the entire study will be presented with the addition of recommendations for future studies relevant to this research area.
Chapter Ten

Conclusion

This final chapter will reiterate the original issues raised in this study, the research contentions, and the importance of this study. A summary of the findings as a concluding statement will be presented, followed by recommendations regarding future studies relevant to the research area.

- Issues and research contentions

The motivation for the inception of this study was based upon previous studies and the researcher’s observation of the lack of implementation of music education in state-supported primary schools in Victoria, and the inadequacy of the quality of music teaching in some schools wherein music programs are available. A thorough exploration concerning the issues that impact upon music teaching in government primary schools, particularly in Victoria was presented. These issues were then developed into three major areas. The first is formulating and developing appropriate music curriculum for music educators at all government primary schools. The second concerns applying teacher efficacy in every component of the school music program, including developing advocacy of school music education and improving effectiveness in and supporting classroom teaching and additional music activities. Finally, the third considers the provision of quality teacher education in both pre-service programs and in-service facilities. The first two issues, curriculum development and teacher efficacy, were given particular emphasis in the discussions throughout this thesis, whilst the third issue, teacher education, was only briefly mentioned. The first two issues provided the foundation for the contentions of this study and, in addition, have been recognized as essential components comprising the music specialist’s
notably successful music program in the selected primary school. A more detailed discussion of
the third issue would be beyond the scope of this study. Subsequently, the research contentions
became (1) A balanced, well-sequenced music curriculum is vital in an effective school music
program; and (2) Teacher efficacy is pivotal in the success of a school music program. These two
research contentions were discussed through several interrelated issues, such as the establishment
of teaching goals, selection of teaching content and methods, advocacy of school music
education, effectiveness in music teaching, and so on.

Given that the contentions of this thesis concern the nature of an effective school music program
and the role of teacher efficacy in the implementation of such a program, several research
questions were identified. These will be answered succinctly in turn:

1. What abilities are required in a successful music educator in a state primary school in
   Victoria?

   The successful music educator in this study is a well-qualified, experienced and versatile
   musician and teacher. She is an expert in her craft of music education and in her
   advocacy for her program. Over time she has built a strong relationship with the students,
   their parents, the local community, her fellow teachers and the administrative staff of the
   schools.

2. How is classroom music taught in the selected school music program?

   The music educator has an eclectic approach to classroom music content and activities with
   considerable emphasis given to the approaches of Orff and Kodály. She engages children
   with music via active participation, using singing, listening, recorder and percussion playing.
   There are many performance opportunities for her music classes to present to the school and
wider community that provide her students with added motivation to perform well, and enjoyably so.

3. How are instrumental and choral music taught in this program and what is their relationship to classroom music?

Running parallel to classroom music, there are selective violin group tuition classes taught by the school music educator and a specialist violin teacher. Children from Grade 3 and above are eligible to join these classes on a user-pays basis. These children are divided into five groups according to their progress and ability. The violin classes perform frequently. The school has an auditioned chamber choir as well as two compulsory choirs for all children in Grades 3 and 4, and 5 and 6. The choirs are organised and conducted by the school music specialist. Given that the choir is compulsory in Grades 3 and 4, there is considerable overlap with the class music program.

4. What strategies does the school music educator employ in advocating for the inclusion of music in this school?

The school music educator is tireless in her promotion of her subject. She frequently communicates with the administrative staff members and supports the outreach and public presence of the school by providing musical events whenever called upon. She liaises with the other teachers in the school and supports their programs with thematically related material wherever possible. In addition, she strategically provides the school administrative members and the parents with cogent arguments why music is important in the life of every child.
5. How is the school music program understood by the school Principal, the Assistant Principal and the other teachers?

The advocacy arguments advanced by the school music educator are wholeheartedly accepted by the Principal and Assistant Principal, the former using these arguments to both promote his school and to support the music program within the school in terms of time allocation, facilities and resources. In general the other teachers are similarly convinced, albeit occasionally feeling that they are inconvenienced by the absence of students when they attend music activities.

6. How does the local community engage with the school music program?

The local community and the parents are very supportive of the school music program. This support occurs in a number of ways, such as community concerts (at the local shopping mall, retirement villages, and kindergartens) and school performances. The appreciation of the local community and parents is reflected in their attendance, assistance and in comments made to the school administrative members. To contextualize this study it was necessary to explain: (1) the history of the inclusion of music education in Victorian state-supported primary schools; (2) the Arts in the recently released Australian Curriculum and VELS; (3) the most commonly and successfully used teaching methods (the Kodály and the Orff approaches) and music activities (instrumental and choral programs); and (4) development of advocacy of school music education. These issues have been addressed frequently throughout this thesis and in the discussion of the data presented in the previous chapter. Rather than present novel practices in primary school’s music education, the impetus for this study was located in its capacity to examine, analyse, and present a relatively uncommon example of research into an actual school, its complexities, interrelationships, and its detailed profile of a most effective music educator and music program.
Investigation and analysis of the particular school chosen presented a particularly successful model of practice in primary music education, how this model operates, and the reason for its success.

The researcher’s philosophy placed its foundation in phenomenology as the most suitable means of investigating what was actually happening within the music program of the selected primary school. Two data collection strategies, semi-structured interviews and observations, were employed in this phenomenological case study at a selected Victorian state-supported primary school with the aim of chronicling a highly effective primary school music program and exploring the factors that contributed to its efficacy.

- **Concluding statement**

The current status of music education in state-supported primary schools in Victoria is regarded as inadequate. It is acknowledged that the *Shape of the Australian Curriculum: The Arts*, published on 7 August 2011, has made a step forward towards making music education compulsory at all Australian primary schools (Cosaitis, 2012). Though the final decision is left to the state government and school administrators in terms of how music education is implemented and to what degree, it is the school music educators’ goal to ensure the sustainability of the development of their programs. This aim is most likely to be accomplished through successful formulation and development of the music curriculum, and demands teacher efficacy in every component of the music program, utilizing the best level of the music educator’s skills in musical, professional and personal areas. This understanding was investigated in this qualitative case study utilizing a series of detailed observations of the selected school’s music program, and extensive and in-depth interviews and discussions about the issues involved in the music
program. A thorough analysis of the school’s current curriculum and a collection of students’ written statements and pictures were also utilized for the purpose of enhancing the comprehensiveness of the data.

Overall, this highly successful music program considered here demonstrates a number of features that are worthy of emulation. These features include the music specialist’s expertise in music teaching and performance; a comprehensive and practical music curriculum; utilisation of an eclectic method in classroom music teaching; effective management and conduction in violin and choral programs; positive relationships with school administrative members, other teachers, students, parents and the local community; organisation of regular public performances; enthusiasm in music education; and her nurturing and dedicated manner of teaching.

1) Music curriculum

The music curriculum provides a framework for music teaching, encompassing objectives and strategies as well as the criteria required for assessment and report. The importance of formulating an appropriate and effective music curriculum has been addressed throughout the thesis, particularly in Chapter 5. In the selected primary school the development of the music curriculum is ongoing as, in accordance with the data, the music specialist’s curriculum was “never finished” (MSI, 07. 05. 2012). Thus curriculum is a fluid, developmental process.

The researcher’s pre-existing knowledge in this area was consolidated by the results of the qualitative data collection, affirming that music curriculum should be devised for the purposes of serving students’ needs, incorporating the school’s culture, and taking into consideration the nature of the local community. It is tenable to suggest that a successful music curriculum should be one which is both based upon student-centred teaching principles and continuously refined in
accordance with students’ levels of progression. This is in line with Robinson (1989) who stated that arts teaching should not “impose rigid structures of ideas and methods upon the children” (p. 33). This type of curriculum enables flexibility in implementing lesson plans, providing children-friendly song-choosing strategies, encompassing a broad range of working tasks, incorporating appropriate types and levels of fun activities, culminating in the creation of a friendly and enjoyable teaching-learning environment. The teaching objectives included in an effective music curriculum should be clearly and carefully established, well thought-out, specific, and achievable, as demonstrated in the selected school in this study. In terms of selecting and adapting teaching methods or ideas, it appears that eclecticism is desirable, particularly in classroom music teaching. This is so because a combination of a variety of pedagogical approaches and teaching strategies enables the music teacher to provide the knowledge and skills most needed in early music education, such as singing, music literacy, instrument playing, music appreciation, and music improvisation and composition. The appropriateness of the Kodály method, the Orff approach and the combination of the two were strongly supported by the results of the data as being highly effective methods in primary school music teaching. Creating an enjoyable and engaging environment is essential in a successful music curriculum; at the same time, music literacy, including reading, writing, and aural skills, should always remain at the core of the entire music program. This qualitative study has demonstrated that the teaching of music literacy should be included in the curriculum for students at all year levels, and should progress continuously and sequentially. Music literacy should also be taught through a variety of activities, which are stimulating, engaging and fun-based, especially for children in younger age groups. Moreover, the music curriculum should be established and developed with the music teacher’s full awareness and understanding of the state and/or national standards for the purpose of
ensuring that the progress of the school’s music program corresponds with the entire educational system.

Mills (1991) concluded that the development of a music curriculum should depend on particular circumstances concerning participating students, teachers, school philosophy, current policies, and so forth. Observations and semi-structured interviews conducted in this phenomenological study have made it possible for the researcher to gain insight into the formulation and implementation of an effective and comprehensive music curriculum as put into effect by a highly qualified music specialist who is both an accomplished musician and a recognizably successful music teacher.

(2) Teacher efficacy

As presented throughout this thesis, particularly in Chapters 2 and 5, the inclusion of music education in Victorian state-supported primary schools has been inadequate for more than half a century. The current situation demands both the implementation of music education in schools which do not have such provision, and the sustainability of development in schools wherein music education is already available. In order to improve, support and maintain effective school music education, teacher efficacy is an imperative. There are many issues involved in teacher efficacy, however, the qualitative results of the data have identified specific issues, including advocacy of school music education, effectiveness in general music teaching, and effectiveness in instrumental and choral programs.

Advocacy of school music education is imperative in instituting and improving the inclusion of music teaching in primary schools. The music specialist’s practices in advocacy at the selected primary school were successful, and impressively so. These practices were most clearly seen in
her teaching within and beyond the classroom, her solid relationships with the school Principal, Assistant Principal, other staff members and parents, and active promotions of music within the local community. In order to become successful advocates, music educators need to develop a thorough understanding of the importance of early music education. Armed with sufficient knowledge in this topic, music educators can inform school administrators and policy makers about the advantages of early music education and also draw their attention to the value of these advantages. In addition, these advantages can also be explained more effectively to the general public. This in turn provides additional support for the school music teacher when negotiating with the school administration.

Another important practice required in successful advocacy is to establish and maintain a positive relationship with other parties involved in this school’s music program. As has been seen in the qualitative case study, these parties include school administrative members, students, other teachers, parents, and local communities. Music educators must be active in this regard in order to gain continuous and optimal support from all of these parties. When dealing with the administrative members and other teachers, frequent and effective communication is considered vital, whilst the music educators’ consistent participation in all types of school activities and other teachers’ classroom programs is most desirable. In terms of gaining support from parents and local communities, frequent, varying and high quality presentations of the music program are regarded as essential. This is so because the demonstration of students’ music learning outcomes and the excellence of the school’s music program are the most effective means of advocating school music education in public.

Successful advocates in music education should also be effective as inspirational music teachers because their advocacy of music education is directly demonstrated to the students, which
subsequently influences the next generation’s attitudes and perspectives towards school music education. As mentioned in Chapter 7, as part of their class activities, the written statements and pictures collected from the Year 4 students provided a rich source of data that revealed students’ perceptions of their school’s program and their music teacher. It might be that such a source could demonstrate ideal students’ perspectives on general music education for all state-supported schools. The music educator’s enthusiasm for music, excellence in knowledge and skills, and professionalism in teaching, as well as his/her motivating, encouraging, and engaging personal character are continuously and repeatedly demonstrated through regular classroom teaching and frequent music activities to the students. Therefore, a successful music education advocate should not only be effective in teaching students music but also in inspiring students’ lives in all aspects of music education.

As has been repeatedly mentioned throughout this thesis, sophisticated knowledge and skills in music, and extensive experience and professionalism in teaching contribute greatly to the delivery of effectiveness in music teaching in general. In addition, an effective music teacher should also be enthusiastic, innovative and considerate. The abilities required for establishing a comprehensive curriculum, implementing teaching plans through various methods and strategies, and creating an enjoyable teaching environment are essential in effective teaching. The researcher acknowledges that the music specialist’s credentials, experience and character have all contributed towards her success in curriculum development and effective teaching. A willingness to constantly learn from other music educators and teachers of other subjects is highly desirable to achieve and maintain teacher efficacy. Effective music teachers evaluate their own teaching, adding to, reinforcing, and adjusting their own teaching skills and knowledge whilst constantly keeping up with changes and improvements in curriculum and teaching practices. This is in
agreement with Loughran (2010) who states that, “In the actions we take to facilitate student learning, we are continually developing our professional knowledge of practice” (p. x).

This qualitative case study has identified that effectiveness in instrumental and choral programs was an integral part of teacher efficacy in the selected primary school. The skills of organizing and conducting instrumental and/or choral programs can enhance the music educator’s overall effectiveness of the school’s music program. As presented in the previous chapter, school music programs can be used in the public image of schooling in terms of promoting the school and increasing the school’s enrolment numbers. In this regard, the instrumental and choral programs need to incorporate a variety of learning components and activities to effectively prepare the school’s music program as a whole, being presented on different occasions for school promotion purposes.

Public performance is the most commonly used practice in presenting students’ learning outcomes and the development of the school’s music program. Through public performance, students gain valuable experience in performing for different types of audience; parents are informed with their children’s progress in music learning; and the school captures the opportunity to promote itself. Effective school music teachers should have the ability of organizing and staging regular public performances every year in different venues for various purposes. The implementation of informance is also strongly supported by the results of the data. This form of presentation provides an opportunity for staff members other than the music teachers to demonstrate their music talent and work together with the students. Through an informance, students become teammates with their teachers, witness their teachers’ musical skills, subsequently, enhancing their relationship with teachers.
The pull-out program seems to be an indispensible part of school instrumental and choral programs in state-supported primary schools. Although the results of studies in this area have revealed that the pull-out program does not cause any decline in students’ academic achievement, the concern amongst general classroom teachers and parents still exists. This requires an effective timetabling system as well as other staff member’s cooperation, but both aspects require the music teacher’s efficacy and advocacy to demonstrate the benefits of the music program for both students and the school. When other staff members, especially the school principals and the daily organizer, have developed a deeper understanding of the importance of the music program, they would be more likely to willingly support the pull-out program wherever possible. The data also revealed that other staff members’ respect and appreciation for the music teacher and his/her teaching also helps to deal with the pull-out issue. So, again, a solid and positive relationship between the music teacher and other staff members is most desirable, made more achievable by informance as an innovative activity.

As has been demonstrated in the data, the achievements of the music specialist at the selected primary school were most successful and commendable. The practices she used in all aspects of the music program strongly highlighted the fact that effective primary school music education requires an appropriately formulated music curriculum based upon student-centred principles, employing eclectic teaching approaches, and positioning music literacy as its focal point. At the same time, teacher efficacy in terms of success in advocacy of school music education, as well as effectiveness in general music teaching, instrumental and choral programs, is also considered vital. In agreement with this, Champion (2012) asserts that good school music programs share the characteristics of
well-planned, locally appropriate curriculum with diverse opportunities to develop vocal and instrumental skills and regular performance events. They do not limit the range of music styles and traditions and the whole-school community is involved in planning the role of music within the curriculum and co-curriculum programs.

- **Recommendations for future practice**

Despite the belief that generalist teachers have the advantage of integrating music into their overall pedagogy on a daily basis, the quality of music teaching can only be delivered by those who have undergone appropriate training in music and have the required level of skills in musical, professional and personal areas. In this study, a music specialist was responsible for a highly effective school music program. It could be argued that such a high quality program could not be implemented by a generalist teacher unless they had particular music skills. It would appear that the overall educational system in Victorian state-supported primary schools does not expect music education to be included as a compulsory subject, nor does it support the employment of a full-time music specialist at every school. In accordance with this situation, future practice in this research area or relevant areas might consider the following: (1) Teacher courses at tertiary level and provision of sufficient training hours, content and practices to prepare future generalist teachers for quality music teaching, both physically and mentally. (2) The development of appropriate music curriculum to suit generalist teachers’ needs, whilst also taking into consideration their limited music training background. (3) Providing sequential in-service training components on a regular basis to enhance music teacher’s knowledge and teaching ability, including classroom management skills. (4) Assessment needs to be devised as a necessary gauge of students’ learning outcomes but also as a means of enhancing their enjoyment of music learning. (5) School funding should be apportioned to providing quality
music programs as well as procuring and maintaining state-of-art teaching resources, such as interactive whiteboards, digital technology, quality music instruments, excursions, incursions, etc.

- **Recommendations for future research**

A number of potential areas for further research exploration could be undertaken in diverse schools to explore issues of efficacy and advocacy in other education settings. It is recommended that qualitative research approaches are most effective in undertaking explorations of complex teaching and learning environments. This research only touched on the understandings of attitudes of children in school music programs but this would be a rich area for future exploration. Each of the modes of musical engagement identified in this study could be the focus of studies in their own right, such as choral programs, violin groups, etc. Little research into current classroom practices such as those advocated by Orff and Kodály has been found apart from historical studies or practical texts. These methods in authentic educational settings could be a rich field of research. From this study, school principals clearly have a pivotal role in the effectiveness of school music education, thus, research that focused alone on their understandings could be undertaken. Further, it would be useful to investigate what music teaching methods are considered the most effective and suitable to be adopted by both music specialists and classroom generalists. This question could include existing issues of primary school music education in Victoria, and the availability of appropriate teaching methods in terms of facilitating primary music educators’ teaching practice.

Music is a vital component of the human condition and, from an arts perspective, represents one of humanity’s crowning achievements. Music is part of everyday life, and influences and permeates every level in society. Music educators and educators in general in the 21st century
need to acknowledge the ever-growing importance and universality of music and how our very identity, both culturally and personally, is shaped, elevated, and given greater meaning by this age-old, yet constantly evolving art form. It is essential that music education be included at the very foundation of our lives, and therefore, should be introduced as early as possible, at the very least at the primary level of schooling. In order to establish music education as an expected component of schooling, it must be ensured that the standard of primary music teaching is raised by the necessary provision of suitably trained music teachers. The provision of highly trained music specialists with effective school music teaching experience and expertise in successful school music advocacy is essential to efficacious school music education. The ability to advertise and promote the importance of primary music education should also be a major responsibility of the education authorities, especially school administrators, so that the institution and improvement of music education in state-supported primary schools throughout Victoria draws one step closer to fruition.
Bibliography


http://www.acara.edu.au on 08/12/2010

http://www.acara.edu.au/arts.html on 08/12/2010


http://www.childrensmusicworkshop.com/advocacy/pullouts.html on 20/06/2012


http://www.testcat.fcla.edu/catalog/uf.jsp on 24/01/09


Britten, N. (1995). Qualitative Research: Qualitative interviews in medical research. *Education and Debate*. Retrieved from [http://www.bmj.com/cgi/content/full/311/6999/251](http://www.bmj.com/cgi/content/full/311/6999/251) on 10/08/09


Education Department, Victoria (1956). *Course of Study for Primary Schools: Music Syllabus.*


Howard, P. M. (1996). Kodaly Strategies for Instrumental Teachers: When the Kodály method is extended to string and other instrumental instruction, it offers opportunities for enhancing student musicianship. *Music Educators Journal,* No. 82, pp. 27 - 33.


pp. 146 - 149.

[http://www.sld.demon.co.uk/resmethy.pdf](http://www.sld.demon.co.uk/resmethy.pdf) on 12/03/2011

Letts, R. (2009). *Your Concerns about Music and the National Curriculum.* Retrieved from


No. 4, pp. 64 - 66


Appendix A

Human Ethics Certificate of Approval

MONASH University

Standing Committee on Ethics in Research Involving Humans (SCERH)
Research Office

Human Ethics Certificate of Approval

Date: 18 May 2009
Project Number: CF08/3630 - 2088001765
Project Title: Investigation of efficacious classroom music practices in Victoria
Chief Investigator: Dr. Jane Southcott
Approved: From: 18 May 2009 To: 18 May 2014

Terms of approval
1. The Chief investigator is responsible for ensuring that permission letters are obtained, if relevant, and a copy forwarded to SCERH before any data collection can occur at the specified organisation. Failure to provide permission letters to SCERH before data collection commences is in breach of the National Statement on Ethical Conduct in Human Research and the Australian Code for the Responsible Conduct of Research.
2. Approval is only valid whilst you hold a position at Monash University.
3. It is the responsibility of the Chief Investigator to ensure that all investigators are aware of the terms of approval and to ensure the project is conducted as approved by SCERH.
4. You should notify SCERH immediately of any serious or unexpected adverse effects on participants or unforeseen events affecting the ethical acceptability of the project.
5. The Explanatory Statement must be on Monash University letterhead and the Monash University complaints clause must contain your project number.
6. Amendments to the approved project (including changes in personnel): Requires the submission of a Request for Amendment form to SCERH and must not begin without written approval from SCERH. Substantial variations may require a new application.
7. Future correspondence: Please quote the project number and project title above in any further correspondence.
8. Annual reports: Continued approval of this project is dependent on the submission of an Annual Report. This is determined by the date of your letter of approval.
9. Final report: A final report should be provided at the conclusion of the project. SCERH should be notified if the project is discontinued before the expected date of completion.
10. Monitoring: Projects may be subject to an audit or any other form of monitoring by SCERH at any time.
11. Retention and storage of data: The Chief Investigator is responsible for the storage and retention of original data pertaining to a project for a minimum period of five years.

Professor Ben Canney
Chair, SCERH

cc: Mrs Wei Constantin

Post: Monash University, Vic 3800, Australia
Building 31, Room 111, Clayton Campus, Wellington Road, Clayton
Telephone +61 3 9905 2460 Facsimile +61 3 9905 1420
Email: ethics@amp.monash.edu.au, www.monash.edu/research/ethics/humanresearch.html
ABN: 12 237 614 012 CRICOS Provider #00000C
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grade/Instrument</th>
<th>Movement</th>
<th>Performance</th>
<th>Curriculum</th>
<th>Musical Literacy</th>
<th>Music Application</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Grade 2</td>
<td>Movement</td>
<td>Performance</td>
<td>Curriculum</td>
<td>Musical Literacy</td>
<td>Music Application</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grade 3</td>
<td>Movement</td>
<td>Performance</td>
<td>Curriculum</td>
<td>Musical Literacy</td>
<td>Music Application</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grade 4</td>
<td>Movement</td>
<td>Performance</td>
<td>Curriculum</td>
<td>Musical Literacy</td>
<td>Music Application</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grade 5</td>
<td>Movement</td>
<td>Performance</td>
<td>Curriculum</td>
<td>Musical Literacy</td>
<td>Music Application</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grade 6</td>
<td>Movement</td>
<td>Performance</td>
<td>Curriculum</td>
<td>Musical Literacy</td>
<td>Music Application</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix C

Samples of Students’ Responses on Their Music Program at HPS

Write a sentence

Music is... When you’re down, music can change your whole life.

Draw a picture

Music and me
Write a sentence

Music is good for children to learn if they want to be a music teacher or a musician when they want to be when they are older.

Draw a picture

Music and me
Write a sentence
Music is as being famous
know better than being famous
that you that you very much
The End

Draw a picture
Music and me
Write a sentence
Music is a great way to bring out your talent and have lots of fun.

Draw a picture
Music and me
Write a sentence

Music is a great thing that brings you closer to fame. It's a great way for you to express your feelings. Music is a great way for you to pour out your talent.

Draw a picture

Music and me
Write a sentence

Music is something awesome and cool and I love music.

Draw a picture

Music and me and Ethan